

### **Preliminary Comparison of How Alternatives Address Key Issues**

The table on the following pages provides an overview of the alternatives being analyzed in the joint Draft Environmental Impact Statement (DEIS) for Forest Plan Revision on the Chippewa and Superior National Forests. This comparison is based on the issues that were identified by the public, Forest Service employees, other government agencies, and governments during scoping for Forest Plan Revision.

The purpose of this table is to provide an understanding of the range of alternatives being considered to address Forest Plan Revision issues.

A detailed analysis of the environmental impacts of each alternative will be documented in the DEIS which the Forest Service expects to release for public review early 2003. The alternative preferred by the Regional Forester will be identified in the DEIS. Based on the preferred alternative, a Proposed Revised Plan will be developed for each Forest.

(NOTE: This table is formatted for printing in landscape mode)

Issue	Units		Preliminary Comparison of How Alternatives Address Key Issues												
			This information is based on preliminary analysis and may change with the analysis documented in the Draft EIS.												
		Alternative A	Alternative B	Alternative C	Alternative D	Alternative E	Alternative F	Alternative G							
<b>Overview of Alternatives Developed to Address Key Issues</b>	Emphasis	<i>Management Theme: Current Forest Plan</i> • Early successional forest • Primarily even-aged management • Older forest attained primarily through Standards & Guidelines • Developed and undeveloped recreational opportunities	<i>Management Theme: Older Forests &amp; Mixed Conifer</i> • Partial cutting and uneven-aged management, with some even-aged management • Designated areas of older forest • Semi-primitive motorized and non-motorized recreation	<i>Management Theme: Early Successional &amp; Young Forests</i> • Replicates large-scale natural disturbances • Primarily even-aged management • Older forest through extended rotations and Standards & Guidelines • Developed and undeveloped recreation	<i>Management Theme: Old Forest</i> • Partial cutting for restoration in 1 <sup>st</sup> and 2 <sup>nd</sup> decades • Primarily ecological succession after 1 <sup>st</sup> and 2 <sup>nd</sup> decades, with limited partial cutting for restoration • Semi-primitive, non-motorized recreation	<i>Management Theme: Young &amp; Old Forest Settings</i> • Primarily even-aged management and some uneven-aged management • Older forest through vegetation management. objectives & Standards & Guidelines • Developed & undeveloped recreation; both motorized and non-motorized	<i>Management Theme: Within Range of Natural Variability</i> • Ecologically driven to maintain vegetation within Range of Natural Variability • Mix of even-aged and uneven-aged management • Recreation opportunities attained primarily as a result of Management Area direction	<i>Management Theme: Allocates Old &amp; Young Forest</i> • Designated areas of young and old forest • Mix of even-aged and uneven-aged management • Developed and undeveloped recreation; both motorized and non-motorized							
	CNF = Chippewa National Forest, SNF = Superior National Forest, w/= with w/o= without														
<b>Vegetation</b>  Condition in Decades 2 & 10  (*Does not include Boundary Waters Canoe Area Wilderness-BWCAW)	Decade	Dec. 2	Dec. 10	Dec. 2	Dec. 10	Dec. 2	Dec. 10	Dec. 2	Dec. 10	Dec. 2	Dec. 10	Dec. 2	Dec. 10	Dec. 2	Dec. 10
	CNF %Conifer	28	31	34	57	39	36	35	58	34	44	34	52	34	51
	CNF %Deciduous	72	69	66	43	61	64	65	42	66	56	66	48	66	49
	CNF Upland % 0-10 yrs.	13	16	4	4	14	15	4	2	8	10	5	6	7	7
	CNF Upland % 100+yrs.	11	18	14	51	9	22	14	53	12	36	14	50	13	38
	SNF* %Conifer	42	52	45	80	42	53	50	81	44	72	46	72	47	67
	SNF* %Deciduous	58	48	55	20	58	47	50	19	56	28	54	28	53	33
	SNF* Upland % 0-10 yrs.	13	15	5	6	15	14	5	2	11	9	8	9	9	10
SNF* Upland % 100+ yrs.	8	15	19	50	13	22	18	51	16	38	18	38	16	33	
<b>Timber</b>  Volume MMBF (Annual Volume -- Decade 1) NDY = non-declining even flow	CNF	Benchmark w/NDY = 86 wo/NDY = 161	70 - 85	35 - 45	85 - 100	15 - 25	50 - 60	35 - 45	45 - 55						
	SNF	Benchmark w/NDY = 145 wo/NDY: 319	100 - 120	50 - 60	135 - 165	30 - 45	80 - 100	70 - 85	70 - 85						
<b>Clearcut</b> acres (% of harvest, first 10 yrs)	CNF %	70	30	65	0	59	50	39							
	SNF %	73	42	74	0	71	61	52							

Standards & Guidelines provide specific direction for project planning and implementation. Vegetation Management Objectives define landscape conditions over periods of time. Benchmarks represent an estimate of the MAXIMUM volume with specific constraints to protect resources. They are NOT a target or goal.

Issue	Units	Preliminary Comparison of How Alternatives Address Key Issues						
		This information is based on preliminary analysis and may change with the analysis documented in the Draft EIS.						
		Alternative A	Alternative B	Alternative C	Alternative D	Alternative E	Alternative F	Alternative G
<b>Wildlife Habitat</b>	How wildlife habitat is provided for in the alternatives	Provides habitat mostly for species associated with young, early successional forests and edges.	Landscape is dominated by habitat for species associated with older forest, later successional forest, and interior areas.	Provides habitat mostly for species associated with young forests, early successional forests, and edges.	Provides habitat for species associated with older forest, later successional forest and interior areas.	Provides habitat for species associated with a variety of forest conditions and successional stages.	Habitat characteristic of natural disturbance regime. Older forests, but some ecosystems dominated by habitat associated with early successional species.	Provides habitat for species associated with a variety of forest conditions and successional stages. Habitat zoned by Management area.
<b>Older Forest and Fragmentation</b>	How older forest is provided for in the alternatives	Wildlife Standards & Guidelines	All Special Management Complexes (SMCs), Vegetation Management Objectives, Standards & Guidelines, All Research Natural Areas (RNAs), Potential wilderness	Some extended rotation, Vegetation Management Objectives, Standards & Guidelines	Minimum Management Areas, Non-suitable land, All Research Natural Areas (RNAs), All potential wilderness	Vegetation Management Objectives Standards & Guidelines	All Research Natural Areas (RNAs), Vegetation Management Objectives, Standards & Guidelines	Upper level Special Management Complexes (SMC's) Vegetation, Management Objectives, Standards & Guidelines, Some potential wilderness
<b>Fire</b>	Primary Prescribed Fire Uses	Site preparation, fuel reduction	Natural disturbances, fuel reduction	Site preparation, fuel reduction	Natural disturbances, fuel reduction, increased use in later decades	Some natural disturbances on small scale, site preparation, fuel reduction	Natural disturbances, site preparation, fuel reduction	Natural disturbances, site preparation, fuel reduction
	Fire Risk Index	CNF: Low/Moderate SNF: Low/Moderate	CNF: High SNF: High	CNF: Low SNF: Low	CNF: High SNF: High	CNF: Moderate SNF: Low/Moderate	CNF: Moderate/High SNF: Moderate/High	CNF: Moderate SNF: Moderate/High
<b>Riparian</b>	Approach	Mitigative Approach	Proactive Approach Riparian Management Area (CNF)	Mitigative Approach	Proactive Approach	Proactive Approach Riparian MA (CNF & SNF)	Mitigative Approach Riparian Management Area (CNF)	Proactive Approach Riparian Management Area (CNF)
<b>Recreation</b> Recreation Opportunity Spectrum Distribution	Semi-primitive Non-motorized	CNF: 2% SNF: 0% SNF-BW: 15%	CNF: 31% SNF: 31% SNF-BW: 15%	CNF: 2% SNF: 0.2% SNF-BW: 15%	CNF: 78% SNF: 37% SNF-BW: 15%	CNF: 3% SNF: 1% SNF-BW: 15%	CNF: 4% SNF: 2% SNF-BW: 15%	CNF: 5% SNF: 2% SNF-BW: 15%
	Semi-primitive Motorized	CNF: 4% SNF: 2% SNF-BWCAW: 3%	CNF: 5% SNF: 4% SNF-BWCAW: 3%	CNF: 1% SNF: 2% SNF-BWCAW: 3%	CNF: 19% SNF: 25% SNF-BWCAW: 3%	CNF: 5% SNF: 5% SNF-BWCAW: 3%	CNF: 2% SNF: 7% SNF-BWCAW: 3%	CNF: 17% SNF: 14% SNF-BWCAW: 3%
	Roaded Natural, Rural, Urban	CNF: 94% SNF: 61%	CNF: 64% SNF: 28%	CNF: 97% SNF: 60%	CNF: 3% SNF: 0.4%	CNF: 92% SNF: 57%	CNF: 94% SNF: 53%	CNF: 78% SNF: 46%
	Primitive	SNF-BWCAW: 19%	SNF-BWCAW: 19%	SNF-BWCAW: 19%	SNF-BWCAW: 19%	SNF-BWCAW: 19%	SNF-BWCAW: 19%	SNF-BWCAW: 19%

BWCAW = Boundary Waters Canoe Area Wilderness which is part of the Superior National Forest. Some calculations include BWCAW acreage in SNF and some do not, as indicated.  
SNF-BWCAW = only Wilderness acres

Issue	Units		Preliminary Comparison of How Alternatives Address Key Issues						
			This information is based on preliminary analysis and may change with the analysis documented in the Draft EIS.						
			Alternative A	Alternative B	Alternative C	Alternative D	Alternative E	Alternative F	Alternative G
<b>All Terrain Vehicles (ATV)</b>	Max. new desig. trail miles/ Number. of new trail systems	CNF	60 / 2	30 / 1	60 / 2	0	90 / 3	60 / 2	60 / 2
		SNF	60 / 2	30 / 1	60 / 2	0	90 / 3	60 / 2	60 / 2
<b>ATV use of FS Roads</b>	CNF low standard system roads		Allowed	Allowed	Allowed	Allowed	Allowed	Allowed	Allowed
	CNF non-system roads		Allowed	Prohibited	Prohibited	Prohibited	Prohibited	Prohibited	Prohibited
	SNF low standard system roads		Allowed	Allowed	Allowed	Allowed	Allowed	Allowed	Allowed
	SNF non-system roads		Allowed	Allowed	Allowed	Prohibited	Allowed	Allowed	Allowed
<b>ATV Cross-country use</b>	CNF		Prohibited	Prohibited	Big game retrieval. & trapping. access only	Prohibited	Big game retrieval. & trapping access only	Prohibited	Prohibited
	SNF		Allowed	Prohibited	Big game retrieval. & trapping access only	Prohibited	Big game retrieval & trapping access only	Prohibited	Prohibited
<b>Snowmobiles Cross-country use</b>	CNF		Prohibited	Prohibited	Prohibited	Prohibited	Prohibited	Prohibited	Prohibited
	SNF		Allowed	Allowed	Allowed	Prohibited	Allowed	Allowed	Allowed
<b>Snowmobile New Trail Construction</b>	CNF max. new miles		100	40	100	0	100	70	70
	SNF max. new miles		90	50	90	0	130	90	90
<b>Water Access</b>	Development level		Medium	Low	High	Low	High	Medium	Medium
<b>Potential Wilderness</b>	CNF Acres (0 ac. existing)		0	6,213 Two areas	0	6,213 Two areas	6,213 Two areas	0	2,727 One area
	SNF Acres (809,000 ac. existing)		0	18,000 12 areas	0	61,000 All 30 areas	0	0	4,000 4 areas
<b>Recommended SMC's</b>	CNF Acres		0	171,467	0	0	0	0	87,420
	SNF Acres		0	289,448	0	0	0	0	185,167
<b>Recommended RNA's</b>	CNF Acres (3,000 ac. existing)		0	5,000 8 areas	0	4,500 7 areas	0	8,200 All 9 areas	8,200 7 areas
	SNF Acres (3,025 ac. existing)		800	48,000 All 41 areas	800 1 area	48,000 All 41 areas	19,000 11 areas	48,000 All 41 areas	33,000 26 areas