

**CALIFORNIA RECREATION RESOURCE ADVISORY COMMITTEE**  
**November 5-6, 2007**  
**Meeting Notes**

Members present: Monte Hendricks, Donald Klusman, Linda McMillan, Dick Dasmann, Nate Rangel, Paul McFarland, Patricia Gatz, Bob Warren, Charlie Wilson, Danna Stroud.

Members Absent: Roy Denner

Designated Federal Official: Marlene Finley

BLM: Mike Ayers

Forest Service: Teri Drivas, Lester Lubetkin, Tamara Wilton, Frances Enkoji

**November 5, 2007**

The first meeting of the California Recreation Resource Advisory Committee (RRAC) was called to order by Marlene Finley, Designated Federal Official, on 11/5/07 at 10:00 a.m.

Facilitator led group through meeting logistics, ground rules, welcome, and introductions of key agency's staff and FS Regional Recreation Fee Board members in attendance. RRAC members reviewed the qualities, roles, and responsibilities of a RRAC Chairperson and agreed to a nomination process.

RRAC members introduced themselves, identified the RRAC position they represent, and their expectations.

Chris Nota, FS, presented a Federal Advisory Committee Overview with accompanying PowerPoint slides summarizing important points. Questions were answered in reference to field trips and subcommittees which are both acceptable for the RRAC and to clarify that the Brown Act does not apply to the RRAC.

Marlene Finley led an overview of the member's RRAC notebook materials which covered a review of the Recreation Enhancement Act (REA), RRAC Roles and Responsibilities, the BLM & FS Interagency Agreement, and the RRAC Charter. Questions and discussion points included clarification of definitions of criteria for various types of fees, acceptance of Interagency Passes at FS concession operated sites, question if cost of collections exceed revenue and the budget and expenses for the RRAC. Marlene explained the term "security" at a site could be a site host or the presence of personnel to provide a feeling of safety and security and a High Impact Area could not be an entire administrative unit. She also explained that the FS is required to comply with the Service Contract Act which does not allow the agency to require concessionaires to operate without

compensation so there are some cases where we can require them to accept an Interagency Pass and some where we can not. Marlene told the members that the FS holds cost of collection at 15% or less and that the RRAC budget and expenses would be provided to the RRAC.

Mike Ayers (BLM) and Marlene (FS) presented recreation program overviews for each of the agencies.

RRAC members nominated the following members for the position of Chairperson: Nate Rangel, Richard Dasmann, Bob Warren, Patricia Gatz, Linda McMillan, and Don Klusman. Panel members then asked questions to the nominated members to help them make a decision on chairperson. RRAC members agreed to a one year term for elected Chairperson initially and the nominee with the next highest number of votes would be designed Vice-Chair. Vote taken, Bob Warren elected Chairperson and Nate Rangel elected Vice-Chairperson.

Frances Enkoji, RRAC support staff, reviewed R-RAC member travel reimbursements, methods of staying connected, meeting schedules & locations, contact information, etc.

### **November 6, 2007**

Meeting called to order by Bob Warren, Chairperson on 11/6/07 @ 0800. Determined that this is a continuation of yesterday's meeting and roll call was not necessary.

FS Pacific Southwest Regional Forester Randy Moore and BLM State Director and Ex Officio Mike Pool were introduced and made brief statements of welcome and appreciation for RRAC members' willingness to serve.

A review and editing of the draft By-laws was completed.

During the public comment period, Mr. Ed Waldheim, representing California Off-Road Vehicle Association, made a brief statement. His comments included no longer being able to rely on the California "Greensticker" grant program to fund the motorized recreation program on public lands. Need to also look at fee programs and appropriated funds to fund the motorized recreation program. Concern was also expressed about appropriated funding decreases.

Mike Ayers, acting BLM Ex Officio, described the process for developing and reviewing BLM proposals prior to bringing forward to the RRAC. Proposals are presented to one of the existing BLM Resource Advisory Committees, and approved, prior to bringing forward to the RRAC. BLM recreation program managers presented the following proposals:

<b>Proposal Name/Location</b>	<b>Proposal</b>	<b>RRAC Recommendation</b>
Dumont Dunes OHV Area BLM, Barstow Field Office	Increase Special Recreation Permit fee from \$20 to \$30 for weekly, \$60 to \$90 for annual pass. Implement a \$10 holiday weekly fee or \$30 for all holidays for the year.	Motion made to recommend fee increase as proposed made by Don Klusman, seconded by Nathan Rangel. Motion carried.
<p><b>Discussion &amp; Questions:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• How would fees improve the trash collection? Will focus on education &amp; enforcement on taking trash back home.</li> <li>• Fee will be implemented as soon as possible. Visitors have already been notified that they may save weekend permit receipts and can put towards an annual pass when available.</li> <li>• Encourage BLM to continue to work with user groups to educate visitors.</li> <li>• Cost to operate site vs. projected revenue - \$200,000 shortfall.</li> <li>• Public Testimony – Ed Waldheim, member of TRT, spoke in favor of the fee increase.</li> </ul>		
El Mirage OHV Area BLM, Barstow Field Office	New Special Recreation permit fee of \$90 for annual pass, \$30 for weekly pass, \$15 for daily pass.	Motion made to implement new fee as proposed made by Don Klusman, seconded by Nathan Rangel. Voting: Motion carried.
<p><b>Discussion &amp; Questions:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• BLM clarified information on daily fee per vehicle of \$15.00.</li> <li>• Public notification efforts - BLM has worked with the Friends of El Mirage but have not posted in the newspaper.</li> <li>• Fees will be collected at the visitor center (when completed) and through outside vendors. BLM hopes to encourage offsite fee collection via vendors.</li> <li>• Cost to operate site vs. projected revenue - \$300,000 shortfall.</li> <li>• Public Testimony – Ed Waldheim, representing Friends of El Mirage, spoke in favor of the new proposed fee.</li> </ul>		
Clear Creek OHV Area BLM, Holister Field Office	New Special Recreation Weekly Permit fee of \$10 per OHV, \$80 Seasonal Pass for primary vehicle and 2 OHVs, \$80 for primary vehicle, non-OHV use for season. New standard amenity fee of \$5 per vehicle.	Motion made to implement new fee as proposed made by Paul McFarland, seconded by Richard Dasmann. Voting: Motion carried.

**Discussion & Questions:**

- How did BLM determine price of annual pass? Public supported the higher fee.
- Yes, all amenities are in place.
- Rare plants are protected by fencing, visitor education, and law enforcement.
- Special events still require a special use permit but no pass will be required, special use permit fees will cover costs of events.
- BLM RAC approved the fee proposal.
- BLM discussed the asbestos risk – using visitor education and employee safety measures to address. Awaiting OSHA and EPA reports.
- Suggestions on how to communicate safety and resource protection issues to visitors; use the “Coffee and Chat with a Ranger” approach from Yosemite example.
- Revenue is based on 75% compliance. More than one entrance into the area so reduces compliance and ability to enforce fee.
- How much are fines for citations? \$100 for first offense. Suggestion on including citation amount information on signs.
- Entrance station is staffed on weekends, self-service on weekdays. Permits are sold at office also.
- Public Testimony – Ed Waldheim, CORVA, supports the new fee proposal and is glad to see this project moving forward.

Marlene Finley described the process for developing and reviewing proposals prior to bringing forward to the RRAC. Proposals are reviewed by the Region 5 Fee Program Manager, reviewed and approved by the R5 Recreation Fee Board (acting for the FS Regional Forester), prior to bring before the RRAC for a recommendation.

Tamara Wilton, R5 Fee Program Manager, described the proposal package completed for each proposal which includes a summary of the public involvement, fee proposal analysis (abbreviated business plan), and pricing analysis. An attempt was made to bundle proposals by forest, by site type, and similar types of fees. Tamara Wilton presented the following FS proposals:

<b>Proposal Name/Location</b>	<b>Proposal</b>	<b>R-RAC Recommendation</b>
FS, Eldorado NF Campgrounds: 1. Northshore 2. Jones Fork 3. Strawberry Point 4. Northwind	Increase Expanded Amenity fee from \$8 to \$10. Implement the fee increase beginning 5/1/08.	Motion made to recommend fee increases as proposed made by Don Klusman, seconded by Charles Wilson Motion carried.
5. Wrights Lake Equestrian	Increase Expanded Amenity fee from \$18 to	

6. Wrights Lake	\$20 and add an extra vehicle fee of \$5. Implement the fee increase beginning 5/1/08.	
7. Lovers Leap	New Expanded Amenity fee of \$10 and an extra vehicle fee of \$5. Implement the new fee beginning 5/1/08.	Motion made to recommend new fee as proposed made by Don Klusman, seconded by Paul McFarland. Motion carried.
<p><b>Discussion &amp; Questions:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Request a clarification on kind of toilet, i.e. vault, flush, CXT, etc. be included in the proposal analysis format.</li> <li>• Include the level of amenities in the price/market comparison would be helpful.</li> <li>• Include the percent increase in fee for each proposal.</li> <li>• Lovers Leap CG –             <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Clarification from forest – garbage collection will be provided.</li> <li>○ Linda McMillian suggested a phased in approach to fee and voiced expectation that forest will work with visitors in allowing their contributions to prevent future fee increases. Visitors might assist in providing tables, fire rings, etc.</li> </ul> </li> </ul>		
FS, Eldorado NF Recreation Rentals: 1. Loon Lake Chalet	Increase Expanded Amenity fee from \$75 to \$100. Implement the fee increase beginning 1/1/08.	Motion made to implement fee increases as proposed made by Nathan Rangel, seconded by Paul McFarland Motion carried.
2. Van Vleck bunkhouse	Increase Expanded Amenity fee from \$65 to \$75. Implement the fee increase beginning 1/1/08.	
3. Robbs Hut	Increase Expanded Amenity fee from \$45 to \$65. Implement the fee increase beginning 1/1/08.	

<p><b>Discussion &amp; Questions:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Discussed the different prices and capacity of each rental facility.</li> </ul>		
<p>FS, Sequoia NF Campgrounds:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Troy Meadow</li> <li>Fish Creek</li> <li>Kennedy Meadows</li> <li>Lower Peppermint</li> <li>Horse Meadow</li> </ol>	<p>Increase Expanded Amenity fee from \$10 to \$17. Implement the fee increase beginning 1/1/08 for all except Lower Peppermint (5/15/08).</p>	<p>Motion made to implement new fee as proposed made by Nathan Rangel, seconded by Paul McFarland. Motion carried.</p>
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Camp 9 Family</li> <li>Camp 9 Group 1&amp;2</li> </ol>	<p>Increase Expanded Amenity fee from \$12 to \$17 for Camp 9 Family and from \$110 to \$160 for Camp 9 Group sites/night. Implement the fee increase beginning 1/1/08.</p>	
<p><b>Discussion &amp; Questions:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Camp 9 – Question over the large amount of deferred maintenance at some of these sites and appropriateness of raising fees in run-down facilities. Forest clarified plan to improve facilities and address deferred maintenance items. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>With so much deferred maintenance will the public accept the large fee increase? The fee has not been increased since 1998 and public involvement has been very supportive of the fee increase.</li> </ul> </li> <li>Camp 9 – Question about why FS plans to offer the Camp 9 facilities for concession operation. Marlene stated that there is a national commitment to not remove sites from the concessionaire program and the FS operation of the Camp 9 facilities is just temporary.</li> </ul>		
<p>FS, Shasta-Trinity NF Shasta Summit Single Climb Permit</p>	<p>Increase Special Recreation Permit fee from \$15 for a 3-day climb to \$20 effective 4/1/08 and from \$20 to \$25 in 2010.</p>	<p>Motion made to implement both phases of fee increase as proposed made by Linda McMillan, seconded by Monte Hendricks. Voting: Motion carried.</p>
<p><b>Discussion &amp; Questions:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>R-RAC discussed whether it was acceptable to recommend a phased in fee proposal, agreed that it was.</li> <li>Question about whether the revenues supported climbing rangers, yes they do.</li> </ul>		

The remaining FS proposals were deferred to the next meeting to be reviewed due to time constraints.

Suggested changes were made for future fee proposals that included the RRAC liked the format for FS proposals, BLM will consider using, adding percentage increases, describe the benefits outside of the project or unit boundary, table of contents would be helpful, keep groupings of like projects by forest, would like a listing of proposals after they have been reviewed and approved by the Regional Fee Board.

Marlene asked for a meeting evaluation and suggestions included trying to hold meetings near where the projects or proposals are located to facilitate public participation and field trips and looking at packaging proposals into groups based on locations. The group didn't feel a need for a facilitator but did feel agency contacts for proposals were helpful in person and maybe by phone at future meetings. They appreciated receiving good information in advance of the meetings.

Next Meeting will be January 14-15, 2008 in Southern California. Agenda items to include: A field trip, discussion of the Adventure Pass and high impact recreation areas and review fee proposals. Requested information on the Adventure Pass – revenue, expenses, sites included in the program, and where passes can be purchased.

Meeting was adjourned by Bob Warren at 3 p.m.