NOTE: This proposal form and recreation fee strategy follows FSH 2309.13, Chapter 30 – Recreation Fees, Sections 32.6–32.8.

1. PROJECT DESCRIPTION

Name of Project Area: Canyon Lakes Ranger District Rental Cabins

Project Contact Person: Lawrence Fullenkamp
Position Title & Phone #: North Zone Archaeologist (970-278-6962)

Forest: Arapaho Roosevelt National Forests and Pawnee National Grassland
Ranger District: Canyon Lakes Ranger District
County: Larimer County
Congressional District: 2nd

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Site(s) Infra #</th>
<th>Name:</th>
<th>Site Type:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0501</td>
<td>Buckhorn Ranger Dwelling</td>
<td>Cabin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0502</td>
<td>Buckhorn Assistant Ranger Dwelling</td>
<td>Cabin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0503</td>
<td>Buckhorn Bunkhouse</td>
<td>Cabin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0504</td>
<td>Buckhorn Office</td>
<td>Cabin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0505</td>
<td>Buckhorn Garage</td>
<td>Cabin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0369</td>
<td>Corral Park Cabin</td>
<td>Day Use</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0301</td>
<td>Red Feather Ranger Dwelling</td>
<td>Cabin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0302</td>
<td>Red Feather Assistant Ranger Dwelling</td>
<td>Cabin</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Proposed Action: New fee _X_ Change of fee____

Proposed Fee Type: Std. Amenity____ Expanded Amenity _X_ Special Rec. Permit____

Proposed Fee: Below are the proposed fee rates for each rental cabin on a per night basis.

Red Feather Ranger Dwelling: $200 (summer) $150 (winter)
Red Feather Assistant Ranger Dwelling: $175 (summer) $125 (winter)
Corral Park: $100 (summer only)
Buckhorn Ranger Dwelling: $175 (summer) $125 (winter)
Buckhorn Assistant Ranger Dwelling: $150 (summer) $100 (winter)
Buckhorn Office: $150 (summer) $100 (winter)
Buckhorn Bunkhouse: $150 (summer) $100 (winter)
Buckhorn Garage: $250
Summary of Benefits. (Benefits the public will receive by new/increased fee and the public policy and management objectives served by charging recreation fees, regardless of whether they are perceived as a benefit by visitors.)

Adding the seven cabins and a group site included in this proposal – at the Red Feather, Corral Park, and Buckhorn sites – to the recreation rental system will provide visitors to the Arapaho and Roosevelt National Forest and Pawnee National Grassland’s (ARP) Canyon Lakes Ranger District (CLRD) with a diverse range of overnight options that extends beyond tent and RV camping. The proposed fees will support staff time, as well as operations and maintenance costs associated with renting and maintaining the cabins. None of the cabins will be listed for rental until deferred maintenance is taken care of and the structures have been brought up to code.

Providing more overnight cabin rental opportunities for CLRD visitors aligns with the following national-scale policy objectives:

- **USFS National Priority 2: Be good neighbors and excel at customer service.** Supporting cabin rentals on CLRD using REA fees will help USFS to better serve the public by providing a larger range of affordable, high quality lodging options on the District.

- **USFS National Priority 3: Promote shared stewardship by increasing partnerships and volunteerism.** Many non-profit partners are supportive of adding cabins on CLRD to the recreation rental system, including HistoriCorps Inc. and Colorado Preservation Inc. These partners have expressed interest in working with USFS to prepare cabins for rental.

- **USFS National Priority 4: Improve the condition of forests and grasslands.** REA fees will support the protection and upkeep of important cultural resources that are legacies of USFS history and examples of historic New Deal era architecture.

- **USFS National Priority 5: Enhance recreation opportunities, improve access, and sustain infrastructure.** Adding cabins to the recreation rental system enhances existing opportunities on CLRD by adding new lodging options with a range of amenities, providing overnight access to NFS lands for visitors who might not otherwise spend the night. In addition, REA fees will help to sustain historic CCC-constructed infrastructure at the Buckhorn and Red Feather sites.

**Red Feather Work Center:**

*Setting & General Description (include description of the site, natural resources/features, scenic values, recreational attractions, amenities, current/projected visitation, etc.):*

Located an hour drive from Fort Collins at the eastern edge of the town of Red Feather Lakes, just off Dowdy Lake Road, the Red Feather Work Center serves many USFS functions. In addition to the two historic cabins included in this proposal – the Ranger Dwelling and Assistant Ranger Dwelling – the site includes a bunkhouse for seasonal workers, an engine house, a helicopter landing pad, and a seasonal volunteer-run visitor’s center. The two cabins are located on either side of the visitor center, but well apart from the other buildings. All structures at the Work Center share a short access road.
The Ranger Dwelling and Assistant Ranger Dwelling were constructed by CCC crew F-50-C between 1937 and 1941 while stationed at Red Feather, as part of broader natural resource enhancement efforts undertaken by the federal government during this era. The structure that currently houses the USFS visitor’s center, which matches the style of the two cabins, was constructed at the same time.

The Ranger Dwelling and Assistant Ranger Dwelling have been intermittently used for fire crew and seasonal housing since the offices of the then Laramie Ranger District moved to Fort Collins in the late 1940s. Both structures are furnished and in decent condition; they will require minimal effort to prepare for rental. The Work Center site has functioning water, electric, and sewer systems.

The Red Feather Ranger Workcenter Cabins (5LR.1864) have been determined to be eligible for the National Register of Historic Places. The Ranger Dwelling and Assistant Ranger Dwelling meet the two criteria for historic significance below.

- **Criterion A:** Associated with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad pattern of history. The Red Feather cabins are associated with the development and administration of the Roosevelt National Forest and R2 of USFS, and with CCC activities that contributed to federal response to the Great Depression.

- **Criterion C:** Embodies the distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction, or that represent the work of a master, or that possess high artistic values, or that represent a significant and distinguishable entity whose components may lack individual distinction. The Red Feather cabins are among the best-preserved examples of CCC-era USFS rustic-style design in CO. The rustic style reflects USFS policy of the time, which required that administrative structures exemplify agency values of practicality, efficiency, and sensitivity to nature. The Red Feather Dwellings and Office (currently the Visitor’s Center) incorporate exaggerated rustic-style elements not found elsewhere in the region, including log porch railings and vertical log gables.

The Red Feather Lakes area, which provides an array of recreational opportunities for visitors, is defined by a series of lakes set amidst tumbling towers of granite and stands of ponderosa pine and aspen. Dowdy Lake and West Lake, both less than a five-minute drive away, provide opportunities for kayaking, canoeing, stand-up paddle boarding, and fishing; and a slew of trails – Mt. Margaret, Molly Moon, Frog Pond, Columbine, and Granite Ridge, among others – provide nearby opportunities for hiking. In the winter, the lakes and surrounding areas offer excellent opportunities for cross-country skiing and snowshoeing.

At present the area offers a few overnight options for visitors looking for easy access to the range of recreation opportunities this area affords. Less than a five-minute drive away, the Dowdy Lake Campground provides 60 single and double family campsites with electric hookups; West Lake Campground, equally close, provides 31 sites. A ten-minute drive away, Bellaire Lake Campground has 27 sites. There are also some dispersed camping areas within a 30-minute drive of Red Feather, and a few nearby private rental houses listed online.

**Facilities/Amenities Checklist (check all that apply, list each site separately):**

**Site Name:** Red Feather Work Center
The Ranger Dwelling and Assistant Ranger Dwelling at Red Feather will be added as recreation rentals with the following amenities. Most importantly, they will offer guests potable water between May and October, and thereby the comfort and convenience of flush toilets and showers during that time. Winter rentals at Red Feather will not include water. CLRD plans to install a vault toilet for winter restroom facilities, as shown in capital improvements section of the attached financial plan. The Red Feather site is connected to the grid, so the site will offer year-round electricity.

Between June and early September, the cabins will be managed by volunteer hosts on-site who also staff the Red Feather Visitor’s Center. While visitors will be responsible for cleaning and removing all trash from the cabins when they leave, the on-site hosts will check on the cabins in between rentals to ensure cleanliness for the next visitors, replace toilet paper, etc. The hosts will also be on site to answer any questions during Visitor Center hours.

CLRD will continue to use the Ranger Dwelling to house seasonal crews even once the cabin has been added to the recreation rental system. CLRD staff will coordinate before each season to mark off any weeks needed for District use. District use, which typically ranges from 6-12 weeks a season, is captured in the revenue projections section of the attached financial model.

1. ____ Designated developed parking
2. ____ Permanent toilet facility: ____ Flush     ____ Vault     ____ Other
3. ____ Permanent trash receptacle
4. ____ Interpretive sign, exhibit or kiosk
5. ____ Picnic tables
6. ____ Security services

Other Amenities: ____ Garbage Removal, ____ Paved Access Road, ____ Drinking Water, ____ Information/Directional signs, ____ Shower/Bath House, ____ Tent Pads, ____ Electricity, ____ RV Hookups, ____ Fire Rings/Grills, ____ Others (list)

Capacity: # of Cabins_
   - Red Feather Ranger Dwelling: # of Rooms 7, # of Beds 6, PAOT 7.
   - Red Feather Assistant Ranger Dwelling: # of Rooms 5, # of Beds 4, PAOT 5

Photo(s): See attachment CLRD Rental Cabins Proposal – Photos

Map (Areas show boundaries): CLRD Rental Cabins Proposal – Maps

NRHP Eligibility (Cabins/Structures): Eligible for NRHP
Archeologist’s concurrence: ____ Y     ____ N

Comments:
Corral Park:

Setting & General Description (include description of the site, natural resources/features, scenic values, recreational attractions, amenities, current/projected visitation, etc.):

Corral Park Cabin is a one and a half story log cabin located in the Long Draw Valley ¼ mile from the Neota Wilderness, less than one half mile from the Comanche Peak Wilderness, two miles the Corral Creek Trailhead and Rocky Mountain National Park. The Long Draw Valley connects up with CO Route 14, a National Scenic Byway that follows the river as it snakes through Poudre Canyon. The cabin offers stunning views of the Mummy Range (Hague’s Peak and Rowe Peak) to the southeast. The cabin was built in the 1950 by a Range Permitee, Carl Johnson. Prior to the 1950 rustic log cabin a pioneer log cabin was built by range permittees in 1916.

The cabin was renovated in 2018 in connection with a Greenback Cutthroat Trout Restoration Project. During the renovation a new roof was installed, windows were rehabilitated, a new door was installed, a new woodstove, propane generator, propane refrigerator, propane lights, and new beds were installed.

The cabin is close to Long Draw Campground and Grandview Campground, the Neota Creek Trail, Corral Park Trail, La Poudre Pass Trailhead and just a half an hour from the Poudre Canyon which contains the District’s most popular trails including Greyrock, Hewlett Gulch, Dadd Gulch, Roaring Creek, and Big South. The USFS Arrowhead Visitor’s Center and Big Bend Sheep Viewing Area are both east of the cabin on CO 14. River access also affords an abundance of guided and independent opportunities for fishing, rafting, and whitewater kayaking along the Cache la Poudre.

Overnight options nearby are include tent camping and private providers Glen Echo Resort, Archers Poudre River Resort, Marrs, or other private cabin rentals along CO-14 and near Red Feather. Southeast of Corral Park Long Draw Campground (25 sites with three double sites) Grandview Campground (9 sites). There is no electricity at either Long Draw or Grandview campgrounds for RVs. Long Draw and Grandview are not available for reservation online. No private cabins are available for rent in the Long Draw Valley and only a handful private cabins are available (Glen Echo Resort, Archers Poudre River Resort, Marrs, or other private cabin rentals along CO-14 and near Red Feather) in the Poudre Canyon Area.

Facilities/Amenities Checklist (check all that apply, list each site separately):

The Corral Park cabin will be added as a recreation rental with the following amenities. The rental will have a vault toilet, fire pits, a wood stove and

7. _X_ Designated developed parking
8. _X_ Permanent toilet facility: _____Flush  _X_ Vault  ____Other
9. _____Permanent trash receptacle
10. _____Interpretive sign, exhibit, or kiosk
11. _X_ Picnic tables
12. _X_ Security services
Other Amenities: _Garbage Removal, _Paved Access Road, ___Drinking Water, ____Information/Directional signs, ____Shower/Bath House, ____Tent Pads, _X_Electricity, ____RV Hookups, X_Fire Rings/Grills, ____Others (list)

Capacity: # of Cabins_1_, # of Rooms_2_, # of Beds_4_, PAOT_6_

Photo(s): See attachment _CLRD Rental Cabins Proposal – Photos_

Map (Areas show boundaries): See Attachment _CLRD Rental Cabins Proposal – Maps_

NRHP Eligibility (Cabins/Structures): _ Archeologist’s concurrence: _X_Y ___N

Comments:

**Buckhorn Work Center:**

**Setting & General Description (include description of the site, natural resources/features, scenic values, recreational attractions, amenities, current/projected visitation, etc.):**

The Buckhorn Work Center, historically known as the Buckhorn Ranger Dwelling, is located on the Buckhorn Road 1.5 hours west of Fort Collins. The compound, which sits atop an open grassy hilltop near Box Prairie Creek at approximately 8,200 ft. elevation, includes five historic Civilian Conservation Corps (CCC)-constructed structures built in the 1930s and early 1940s – a Ranger Dwelling, Assistant Ranger Dwelling, office, bunkhouse, and garage.

The Buckhorn Work Center is a site of substantial historical significance. Just across the road from today’s existing structures, the first Ranger Dwelling on the Forest was constructed in 1910 (the structure no longer exists). During the Great Depression the CCC stationed a crew of approximately 80 young men at Buckhorn, where the government set up tent cabins and a large mess hall to lodge and feed workers as they constructed roads, trails, and buildings. Crew F-61-C’s activities included work on all five of the structures in this proposal, which were erected to support both CCC and USFS administration. When the CCC disbanded in 1942 all ownership was ceded to USFS. For a short time, the Poudre Ranger District was fully administered out of the newly constructed Station, although within a decade the District moved its offices to Fort Collins. For a time the site was used as a seasonal guard station; and until the early 2000s USFS operated a seasonal visitor’s center out of the Buckhorn Office and housed volunteer hosts in the Ranger Dwelling. During this time the other structures were intermittently used to house seasonal staff.

Since the late 1990s the Buckhorn Work Center has been infrequently used, although CLRD fire and recreation staff still store equipment in the garage. Unfortunately, two decades of limited use has resulted in a buildup of deferred maintenance and intermittent issues with vandalism. While the structures remain in relatively good condition, of the
three sites included in this proposal the structures at Buckhorn will take the most investment to prepare for rental.

Although they are not currently listed on the National Register of Historic Places, all five buildings at the Buckhorn Work Center meet the two criteria for historic significance below and are eligible for the National Register of Historic Places. CLRD plans to apply for listing on the Colorado State Register of Historic Places in 2020 to better ensure these sites’ future protection.

- **Criterion A**: Associated with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad pattern of history. All structures at the Buckhorn Work Center are associated with the development and administration of the Roosevelt National Forest and R2 of USFS, and with CCC activities that contributed to federal response to the Great Depression.
- **Criterion C**: Embodies the distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction, or that represent the work of a master, or that possess high artistic values, or that represent a significant and distinguishable entity whose components may lack individual distinction. The Buckhorn Work Center has the most intact concentration of pre-CCC-era USFS frame design buildings in CO, as well as a prime example of CCC-era rustic style construction (the Office building). The structures’ design and construction embody characteristics of USFS architecture in CO at the time; they were built to reflect agency values of practicality, efficiency, and sensitivity to nature. All together the compound is also a prime example of a typical Ranger Station layout, one of the best preserved in R2.

In addition to its historic significance, the area offers nearby opportunities for hiking, OHV use, and fishing in spring and summer, as well as cross-country skiing, snowshoeing, and snowmobiling in winter. The Donner Pass Trail starts off of the Buckhorn Road just west of the compound, and the Emmaline, Beaver Creek, and Fish Creek trails are less than a 30-minute drive away. Box Prairie Creek, which runs just south of the Work Center, offers opportunities for fishing. The site is four miles away from the Comanche Peak Wilderness and the Cache La Poudre Wilderness and only five miles from Rocky Mountain National Park. Donner Peak Trail is less than 500 feet away from the site and serves multiple resources uses.

Existing options for overnight visitors near the Buckhorn Work Center are limited. Tom Bennett Campground (12 sites) is approximately 30 minutes west, and Jack’s Gulch Campground (37 sites + 5 equestrian sites) is approximately the same distance northwest. There are no private cabin rentals available in this area online.

Facilities/Amenities Checklist *(check all that apply, list each site separately)*:

Site Name: Buckhorn Work Center

CLRD will offer two options for rental at the Buckhorn Work Center. First, the entire site can be rented as a group rental for events, with the garage functioning as an event space and the cabins as overnight lodging. CLRD envisions Buckhorn as an ideal site for family reunions, small weddings, and other group events. Second, buildings can be individually rented by different visitor groups when there is not a group event going on. Individual rentals will function the same as CLRD’s other rental cabins.
The five structures at Buckhorn will be added as recreation rentals with the following amenities. The site will have electricity provided by two existing generators, and USFS may install two centrally located vault toilets. Running water, trash, and host services may be phased in over time.

1. X Designated developed parking
2. X Permanent toilet facility: X Flush   X Vault   ___Other
3. X Permanent trash receptacle
4. X Interpretive sign, exhibit or kiosk
5. X Picnic tables
6. X Security services

Other Amenities: X Garbage Removal, ___Paved Access Road, X Drinking Water, ___Information/Directional signs, X Shower/Bath House, ___Tent Pads, X Electricity, ___RV Hookups, X Fire Rings/Grills, ___Others (list)

Capacity: # of Cabins_5_
- Buckhorn Ranger Dwelling: # of Rooms_6_, # of Beds_4_, PAOT_5_
- Buckhorn Assistant Ranger Dwelling: # of Rooms_4_, # of Beds_2_, PAOT_3_
- Buckhorn Office: # of Rooms_3_, # of Beds_2_, PAOT_3_
- Buckhorn Bunkhouse: # of Rooms_3_, # of Beds_4_, PAOT_5_
- Buckhorn Garage: # of Rooms_2_, # of Beds_0_, PAOT_50_ (note: this space will be rented as an event space, and will not have beds to accommodate overnight guests)

Photo(s): See attachment **CLRD Rental Cabins Proposal – Photos**

Map (Areas show boundaries): See attachment

NRHP Eligibility (Cabins/Structures): NRHP Eligible, Nominated to Colorado State Register Spring 2021
Archeologist’s concurrence: X Y ___N

Comments:

2. MARKET ANALYSIS, DEMAND and FACILITY/SERVICE VALUE

Describe:

(1) The population being served by the recreation sites/activities and the level of demand for those sites/activities:

Demand for USFS cabin rentals is high across the region and country. However, as the chart below illustrates, the ARP currently provides fewer opportunities for overnight rentals than most forests in R2. On the ARP specifically, high demand for the only two existing rental sites – Stub Creek Cabin on CLRD and Squaw Mountain Lookout on the Clear Creek RD – indicates visitors to the Forest are interested in and taking advantage of
overnight rental opportunities. Between 2016 and 2018, Stub Creek averaged a 90% occupancy rate and Squaw Mountain averaged 95%.

The proposed rentals’ proximity to Fort Collins and other densely populated and growing Front Range communities suggests sustained demand for a range of overnight options. All three sites are less than a 1.5-hour drive from Fort Collins-Loveland, a metro area of 310,000, and 2-3 hours from the 3 million residents of metro Denver. If the CO Demography Office’s projections – which show Front Range communities driving more than 50% growth in the state’s population by 2050 – hold true, even more Front Range residents will likely be looking to escape to the mountains in future.

The accessibility these sites provide to popular recreation opportunities on the Forest also assures sustained demand. Hiking and fishing along CO14; hiking, fishing, and boating opportunities around Red Feather; and hiking and OHV-ing along Buckhorn Road all ensure these sites will be popular overnight destinations for visitors looking for easy access but not interested in camping.

![R2 National Forests -- # of Cabins/Lookouts](chart)

(2) The degree to which fees for the recreation sites/activities compete with recreation fees charged by other public and private entities, and the fee range within which the proposed fee falls:

The fees proposed for these eight rental cabins will not compete with recreation fees charged by other public and private entities.

Demand for overnight rental opportunities on the Forest is high enough that adding additional cabins to the recreation rental system, especially if additions are made incrementally over time, should not impact use of the Stub Creek Cabin or Squaw Mountain Lookout. In addition, the existing rental options are in different geographic areas than the proposed rentals.

While there are a number of USFS campgrounds close to the Red Feather and Corral Park sites, and to a lesser extent Buckhorn, these campgrounds offer overnight visitors a different experience and price point. Campgrounds offer fewer amenities, and their
prices, which range from $19-$23 for single sites near Red Feather and off of CO 14, are much lower.

Lastly, there are only a handful of private rental cabins (Glen Echo Resort, Archers Poudre River Resort, Marrs, or other private cabin rentals along CO-14 and near Red Feather.) as well as AirBnB and VRBO near the proposed rental sites that might face competition from the addition of USFS rentals. In the winter months when none of the USFS sites offer running water, private rental cabins will fill a different niche by providing more amenities. In the summer when demand for cabin use is highest there will likely be enough demand to fill all options, thereby having little impact on the market for private rentals.

As the market analysis below demonstrates, proposed fees for the Red Feather, Corral Park and Buckhorn sites fall within the range of fees charged for other rental cabins in R2. The proposed fees fall well below those listed for private cabin rentals near Corral Park and Red Feather on AirBnB and VRBO (there are no private rental cabins available near Buckhorn listed).

(3) The value of facilities and services provided at the recreation sites compared to recreation facilities and services offered by other providers in the vicinity, based on an assessment of local market conditions and demand:

The value of facilities/amenities provided at the Red Feather, Corral Park, and Buckhorn sites, which are specifically listed in the Project Description Section, is high compared to other overnight options on the forest (i.e. USFS campgrounds and dispersed camping areas). Given that most of the fees attached to the USFS cabin rentals listed below were instituted a decade or more ago, with inflation factored in the proposed fees for CLRD cabins are comparable to USFS sites offering similar amenities. The proposed fees are slightly higher than those charged by CO Parks & Wildlife, but in general the USFS options offer more amenities and accommodate more visitors. Rental houses listed on AirBnB and VRBO that are located on private land nearby Red Feather and along CO 14 offer many amenities but are listed on average at more than double the proposed fee rates.
## Fair Market Value Comparison:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Site Name</th>
<th>Site Type</th>
<th>Fee Type</th>
<th>Current Fee</th>
<th>Proposed Fee</th>
<th>Distance from Sites</th>
<th>List of Amenities &amp; Services</th>
<th>Analysis</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Red Feather Work Center (ARP, Canyon Lakes RD)</td>
<td>Cabin</td>
<td>EAF</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>Ranger Dwelling (occ. 7): $200 Ass. Ranger Dwelling (occ. 5): $175</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>Electricity, heat, potable water/flush toilets/showers (May-Oct), fireplace, vehicle accessible, host (June-Sept), on-site Visitor's Center, rec.gov rental</td>
<td>On-site volunteer host during busy summer months to answer questions/manage site, accessible to public; priced slightly higher given amenities, accessibility, and size</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Corral Park Cabin (ARP, Canyon Lakes RD)</td>
<td>Cabin</td>
<td>EAF</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>$100 (occ. 4)</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>Wood Stove, propane refrigerator, propane generator, propane lights, vault toilet, fire ring, picnic table.</td>
<td>Nearby volunteer host during busy summer months to answer questions/manage site, accessible to public; priced slightly higher given amenities, accessibility, and size</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Buckhorn Work Center (ARP, Canyon Lakes RD)</td>
<td>Cabin</td>
<td>EAF</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>Ranger Dwelling (occ. 5): $175 Ass. Ranger Dwelling (occ. 3): $150 Office (occ. 3): $150 Bunkhouse (occ. 5): $150 Garage (event space -- occ. 100): $250</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>Electricity, heat, vault toilet, fireplace, vehicle accessible, interpretation, event space, rec.gov rental</td>
<td>No host, part of historic Ranger Station compound, event potential; price comparable to sites with similar amenities if factor in inflation, but lower than other proposed fees since no running water and no host</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comp. 1: Stub Creek Cabin (ARP, Canyon Lakes RD, CO)</td>
<td>Cabin</td>
<td>EAF</td>
<td>$125</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>On CLRD, &lt; 50 miles</td>
<td>Electricity, heat, potable water, flush toilets, fireplace, vehicle accessible, firewood, trash collection, host, rec.gov rental (accommodates 5)</td>
<td>On-site volunteer host takes care of trash, cleaning, and firewood; comparable price with similar amenities and host on-site</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Site Name</td>
<td>Site Type</td>
<td>Fee Type</td>
<td>Current Fee</td>
<td>Proposed Fee</td>
<td>Distance from Sites</td>
<td>List of Amenities &amp; Services</td>
<td>Analysis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comp. 2: Squaw Mountain Fire Lookout (ARP, Canyon Lakes RD, CO)</td>
<td>Lookout</td>
<td>EAF</td>
<td>$80</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>On ARP, &lt; 140 miles</td>
<td>Electricity, heat, exterior incinerating toilet, picnic table, rec.gov rental (accommodates 4)</td>
<td>No host, pack in/pack out facility, no vehicle access; price lower with less amenities and no host</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comp. 3: Keystone Ranger Station (MBR, Keystone RD, WY)</td>
<td>Cabin</td>
<td>EAF</td>
<td>$120</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>&lt; 150 miles</td>
<td>Electricity, heat, non-potable water in summer, flush toilets, showers, picnic table, grill, wood stove, parking, vehicle accessible in summer, rec.gov rental (accommodates 8)</td>
<td>No host, pack in/pack out facility, more remote; price comparable with similar amenities but no host</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comp. 4: Matterhorn Cabin (GMUG, CO)</td>
<td>Cabin</td>
<td>EAF</td>
<td>$240</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>&lt; 500 miles</td>
<td>Electricity, heat, potable water, wood stove, flush toilets, showers, vehicle access, rec.gov rental (accommodates 12)</td>
<td>FS takes care of trash, but no on-site host; Price higher with comparable amenities, sleeps more people, nearby Telluride Ski Mt.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comp. 5: Silesa Guard Station (GMUG, CO)</td>
<td>Cabin</td>
<td>EAF</td>
<td>$120</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>&lt; 400 miles</td>
<td>Electricity, non-potable water, flush toilet, shower, wood stove, fire ring, picnic table, food locker, rec.gov rental (accommodates 6)</td>
<td>No host, pack in-pack out facility; comparable price with similar amenities and no host</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Site Name</td>
<td>Site Type</td>
<td>Fee Type</td>
<td>Current Fee</td>
<td>Proposed Fee</td>
<td>Distance from Sites</td>
<td>List of Amenities &amp; Services</td>
<td>Analysis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comp 7: Agnes Creek Cabin</td>
<td>Cabin</td>
<td>EAF</td>
<td>$120</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>23 Miles</td>
<td>Wood Burning Stove, grill, outhouse, (accommodates 6)</td>
<td>pack in-pack out facility. State Owned Privately run. Comparable price. <a href="https://www.neversummernordic.com/reservations/rooms/9417b466-25fe-4e89-b51b-1c0119494f4f">https://www.neversummernordic.com/reservations/rooms/9417b466-25fe-4e89-b51b-1c0119494f4f</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comp 8: Meeker Park Lodge</td>
<td>Cabin</td>
<td>EAF</td>
<td>$118</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>75 miles</td>
<td>Electricity, heat, potable water, Fireplace, flush toilets, showers, vehicle access, (accommodates 2)</td>
<td>Host, garbage services, comparable price. Privately run. <a href="http://www.meekerparklodge.co/">http://www.meekerparklodge.co/</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comp. 11 Average of 35 USFS Cabins in CO</td>
<td>Cabins</td>
<td>EAF</td>
<td>$74</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>In CO</td>
<td>Includes range of amenities depending on site; size of cabins varies</td>
<td>Range: $25-$240 Median: $50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comp. 12 Average of 15 CO Parks &amp; Wildlife Cabins in CO</td>
<td>Cabins</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>$101</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>In CO</td>
<td>Includes range of amenities depending on site (2 have running water, 9 have electricity); size of cabins varies</td>
<td>Range: $90-$120 Median: $90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Site Name</td>
<td>Site Type</td>
<td>Fee Type</td>
<td>Current Fee</td>
<td>Proposed Fee</td>
<td>Distance from Sites</td>
<td>List of Amenities &amp; Services</td>
<td>Analysis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comp. 13 Average of 20 Larimer County Cabins (at Hermit Park and Horsetooth Reservoir)</td>
<td>Cabins</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>$100</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>Hermit Park: &lt; 80 miles Horsetooth Res.: &lt; 50 miles</td>
<td>Hermit Park: no electricity, no water, vault toilet, cabins accommodate 4-8</td>
<td>Provide less amenities, priced lower</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Horsetooth Reservoir: electricity, nearby restrooms and water at campground, cabins</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>accommodate 5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comp. 14 Average of 8 AirBnB locations Larimer County, CO</td>
<td>Cabins/ Houses</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>$327</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>&lt; 10 miles from either Red Feather or Corral Park sites</td>
<td>Electricity, potable water, flush toilets, showers, other amenity offerings vary</td>
<td>4 houses located along Poudre Canyon and 4 in Red Feather Lakes, avg. price incl.s taxes/cleaning costs/AirBnB fees</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(accommodates 4-10 depending on house)</td>
<td>Range: $175-$474, Median: $331</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Selected fee and method:
The following proposed fees were selected based on the quantity and quality of amenities provided, access to adjacent opportunities for recreation, and a market analysis of USFS cabin pricing in R2 as well as state, county, and private rentals near CLRD.

Red Feather Ranger Dwelling: $200 (summer) $150 (winter)
Red Feather Assistant Ranger Dwelling: $175 (summer) $125 (winter)
Corral Park: $100 (summer only)
Buckhorn Ranger Dwelling: $175 (summer) $125 (winter)
Buckhorn Assistant Ranger Dwelling: $150 (summer) $100 (winter)
Buckhorn Office: $150 (summer) $100 (winter)
Buckhorn Bunkhouse: $150 (summer) $100 (winter)
Buckhorn Garage: $200

Comments: The Buckhorn Work Center cabins are priced slightly lower given that guests will not have access to running water. Of the remaining three cabins, the Red Feather Assistant Ranger Dwelling is priced slightly lower because it accommodates fewer overnight visitors.

3. CURRENT AND PROJECTED REVENUES and ANNUAL OPERATION & MAINTENANCE COSTS

Provide a financial analysis, including projected development including capital investment costs, operations and maintenance costs and projected fee revenues for the useful life of the recreation fee sites and areas.

See spreadsheet: CLRD Revenue-Expenditures for Cabins Oct 2022

4. COST OF BACKLOG (Deferred Maint.) WORK NEEDS:

All deferred maintenance will be taken care of prior to listing these cabins as rental sites, but subsequent to approval of this fee proposal. CLRD is going through the process of proposal development and approval before undertaking significant work on the structures in order to ensure that any investment of staff and financial resources towards getting the cabins rental-ready is warranted. Knowing that we will be able to charge rental fees prior to undertaking major work ensures that the District is deploying resources only when there is a long-term plan to cover O&M costs. In addition, the public participation process will provide the District with an opportunity to raise awareness of the sites and garner community support for their revitalization. This process could potentially help the District to gain partner assistance with renovation projects.

CLRD has a several options for funding deferred maintenance costs associated with the rental cabins outside of utilizing limited forest funds:

- **External grant funds.** Many external entities provide grant support focused on the restoration and preservation of historic buildings, both in CO and nationally. Of particular note, the CO State Historical Fund (SHF) awards non-competitive funding to prepare reports on the physical condition of historic structures, as well as competitive funds for planning, preservation/rehabilitation activities, and
education. CLRD will likely apply for support from SHF to restore the historic Buckhorn Work Center. To qualify for these grants the CLRD listed the site on the State Register of Historic Places and has started a National Register of Historic Places Nomination with the assistance of the WO Heritage ACES program staff. A State Historical Fund Planning Grant for $16,000.00 was received in the spring of 2021.

- **In-kind partner support.** CLRD has a history of partnering with HistoriCorps, a nonprofit that coordinates volunteers to assist with labor on projects that preserve/restore historic structures on public lands. HistoriCorps has already expressed interest in working with CLRD to restore the Buckhorn Work Center. The in-kind contributions of this group, and potentially others, will help CLRD to get the cabins rental ready. A project with HistoriCorps is scheduled for FY23.

- **Capital Improvement Project (CIP) funds from the RO/WO.** CIP funds support critical capital projects that provide agency benefits in five areas, including recreation and public access. Funds are distributed based on regional submissions, and the Buckhorn Work Center could be a good fit for a “minor project” ($500K-$2M range). The CLRD has been WO approved through the NAMP process for $524,140 in CIM funding for FY23-FY26.

- **Great American Outdoors Act Funds.** The Buckhorn Ranger Station was on an initial approved list for FY21 and reapplied in FY22. The partnerships for GAOA projects have grown since the first two applications and progress is being made on competing construction documents and planning for an FY23 request.

- **2021 Infrastructure Investment and Jobs Act:** Early discussions with WO Heritage Staff have taken place about opportunities for cabins in the current proposal.

### Current Status of Funding for DM - December 2021

- **Approved: Planning Grant from State Historical Fund: $16,000.00**
- **Approved NAMP/CIM Funds: $524,140.00 FY23-FY26**
  - FY23: $199,140.00; FY24: $150,000.00; FY25: $150,000.00; FY26: $25,000.00

Given CLRD’s stated goal to take care of deferred maintenance before listing cabins for rental, the current cost of deferred maintenance will not be covered with REA fees and is not included in this proposal. However, as shown in the financial model, 15% of annual fee revenue will be set aside to fund deferred maintenance over time. Internal and External Funding has already been secured for DM and additional opportunities are being sought prior to implementing fees under this proposal.

### DM Costs in NRM

Corral Park: $0.00, DM backlog was completed in 2018-2019
Red Feather Ranger Cabin: $13,522.80* (Contract was awarded in FY20 to reduce $235,067.36 of DM work items.)
Red Feather Assistant Ranger Cabin: $102,435.22
Buckhorn Ranger Cabin: $93,752.86
Buckhorn Office: $173,747.28
Buckhorn Assistant Ranger Cabin: $52,546.91
Buckhorn Bunkhouse: $115,101.46
Buckhorn Garage: $41,765.91

The Canyon Lakes Ranger District of the Arapaho and Roosevelt National Forests is working with Colorado Preservation Inc and Form+Works Design Group, a Historic Architecture Firm, to apply for a planning grant to create construction documents for historic rehabilitation and adaptive reuse planning of the Buckhorn site. Additionally, the District and Forest are applying competitively for Colorado State Historical Fund Grants and FY23 NAMP funds to prepare for the rental of the cabins. The red Feather Cabins are currently under a contract to reduce deferred maintenance.

5. FEE COLLECTION METHOD AND ESTIMATED FEE COLLECTION COSTS

Method(s): The cabin rentals will be listed exclusively on Recreation.gov.

Costs: There are no collection costs incurred for sites listed on Recreation.gov

6. PLANNED USE OF FEES RETURNED TO SITE (list by priority, include daily O&M, etc.)

Use of fees will differ slightly year to year and between sites but will generally fall into the following buckets.

- **Operations and maintenance.** Rental fees will fully support all of the structures’ daily operations and maintenance. This includes but is not limited to staff time coordinating rentals/volunteer-hosts and managing the sites, cleaning supplies and toilet paper, fuel for heating and the generator at Buckhorn, water system testing and maintenance, plumbing and electric work, replacement and repair of furnishings and appliances, advertising, security patrols, and minor repairs.
- **Interpretation.** For the historic Buckhorn and Red Feather sites rental fees will also be put towards the development of interpretive materials that explain the cabins’ architectural and historical significance.
- **Deferred maintenance.** While all existing deferred maintenance will be completed before the cabins are listed for rental, CLRD will set aside 15% of annual fee revenues going forward with the goal of supporting ongoing deferred maintenance.
- **Capital improvements.** Over the first decade of rental CLRD will use recreation fees to fund the construction of vault toilets at both the Red Feather and Buckhorn sites.

7. CUSTOMER/PUBLIC INVOLVEMENT MECHANISM TYPES

Develop a public participation strategy including tribal consultation (where appropriate) for each recreation fee proposal that is commensurate with its complexity and the expected level of controversy.
See documents:

- Site Monitoring
  - X Customer Survey Card
  - X Comment Log / Cabin Guest Book
  - X Newspaper Articles
  - X Website Listing
  - X E-mails
  - X Direct Mail
  - X Personal Contacts
  - X On-site Posting
  - X Other (list): (Example: Posting at nearby sites)
  - X Posting on Facebook  X Twitter  X Other social media
8. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION RESULTS

See document:

The Results section of the Public Participation Tasks – Results document will, at a later
time, provide for and document public input on the proposal, as identified in Section C.
of the regional Recreation Fee Proposal Process document.

9. ADDITIONAL ATTACHMENTS

List and reference additional information (documents) that can be provided upon request
to document and describe this project proposal and the public response.

Photos: CLRD Rental Cabins Proposal – Photos
Maps: CLRD Rental Cabins Proposal – Maps
Articles:
10. PROJECT SUBMITTAL & CERTIFICATION

Project Submittal:
This recreation fee project is being submitted as a new fee or fee increase proposal in Region 2 under the Federal Lands Recreation Enhancement Act (REA). This proposal has been reviewed by representatives on the unit and meets REA criteria. I understand that any site reservations must be made through the Recreation.gov reservation system. I also fully understand and agree to comply with the accounting and reporting requirements necessary to participate in the REA fee program.

MONTE WILLIAMS
Forest Supervisor Date

Project Receipt and Assignment:
This recreation fee project meets basic REA criteria for a new fee or fee increase proposal and is being forwarded to the Regional Recreation Fee Advisory Board (RFAB) for review and interaction with the proponent/Forest point of contact at their earliest available scheduled meeting/conference call.

Recreation Fee Board Chair Date
Figure 1: Location of Red Feather Work Center, Corral Park, and Buckhorn Work Center facilities within the State of Colorado
Figure 3: Location of Red Feather Work Center, Corral Park Cabin, and Buckhorn Facilities within the Canyon Lakes Ranger District
Figure 4: Buckhorn Ranger Site
Figure 5: Red Feather Ranger Station Site
Figure 6: Corral Park Cabin
Red Feather Work Center: Ranger Dwelling

Figure 1. Red Feather Ranger Dwelling

Figure 2. Red Feather Ranger Dwelling just after construction (1936)
Red Feather Work Center: Assistant Ranger Dwelling

Figure 3. Red Feather Assistant Ranger Dwelling

Figure 4. Red Feather Assistant Ranger Dwelling (1949)
Figure 5. Red Feather Assistant Ranger Dwelling living room

Figure 6. Red Feather Assistant Ranger Dwelling bedroom 1
Figure 7. Red Feather Assistant Ranger Dwelling bedroom 2
Corral Park Cabin

Figure 8. Corral Park cabin

Figure 9: Corral Park Cabin view of Rocky Mountain National Park and Long Draw Valley.
Figure 9: Corral Park Cabin Interior photos: Upstairs bedroom and main floor.
Figure 7. Aerial view of Buckhorn Work Center

Figure 8. Buckhorn Work Center Sketchup model.
Buckhorn Work Center: Ranger Dwelling

Figure 9. Buckhorn Work Center Ranger Dwelling

Figure 10. Buckhorn Work Center Ranger Dwelling (1950)

Figure 11. Buckhorn Work Center Ranger Dwelling View of Entrance
Buckhorn Work Center: Office

Figure 12. Buckhorn Work Center Office with Surroundings

Figure 13. Buckhorn Work Center Office (back)

Figure 14. Buckhorn Work Center Office just after converted from dwelling to office (1950)
Buckhorn Work Center:
Assistant Ranger Dwelling and Garage

Figure 15. Buckhorn Work Center Assistant Ranger Dwelling

Figure 16. Buckhorn Work Center Garage
Buckhorn Work Center: Bunkhouse

Figure 17. Buckhorn Work Center Bunkhouse (front)

Figure 18. Buckhorn Work Center Bunkhouse (back)