

Carson National Forest Plan Revision—Wilderness Evaluation Comments--AREAS

(Note—For comments with no indication of Include/Exclude, the latter was assumed.
Comments in favor of Inclusion are in *Italics*.)

1. Abiquiú 2 (4 May 2016)

- a. W-1, W-5, W-9, W-32, W-32—I am against it!
- b. Also W-2—Gather medicinal herbs for use throughout the year
- c. Also W-23, W-24—Need firewood—only source of heat
- d. Also W-16— Has many roads, private land areas, and development that would deem it unsuitable for wilderness.
- e. I am in the T district, Ojo Caliente. I am concerned about access to firewood.
- f. My property is in section C-32 (G?) and you the forest service are telling me that if you make surrounding areas and adjacent areas wilderness I will have to take a horse to my property.
- g. The geography of the El Rito and Canjilon districts do not lend themselves to grazing and firewood permits without mechanical assistance.
- h. The Jarita Mesa has been logged thin from one corner to corner. We need to clean our stock tanks! There are roads all over.

2. Amalia (11 April 2016)

- a. ChW6
 - i. Human activity evidence in form of roads and 4x4 traffic; Too close to town and ski area for solitude
- b. Q1
 - i. Absolutely the most heavily vehicle accessed site in the Valle Vidal is Shuree (?) Ponds
 - ii. Lacks solitude – heavily used by OHV and snowmobile and important to Red River's economy
 - iii. Stay for wood cutting, piñon picking, hunting, grazing, fishing, our watersheds, head gates
- c. Q3
 - i. I think it should be left out because of Cabresto Lake, which is a source of water for the acequia, and the village of Questa.
- d. Q4
 - i. Need access for hunting activities!
- e. Q5
 - i. Eastern half is highly departed ecosystem legacy impact of historic logging
 - ii. We own land in Midnight area and we don't want to be on wilderness or next to wilderness
- f. Q1,4,5
 - i. Forest management is needed in each of these areas to insure forest health. Though fire is allowed in a wilderness, the impact on neighbors is potentially significant. The smaller an area is the more likely the impact on neighbor lands will occur
 - ii. Tremendous residential use and the economic impact that has on Red River. Would also limit access to my family ranch up Mallette Canyon.
 - iii. Widespread noxious weed infestations
 - iv. Relatively high density of administrative access roads required for successful execution of several special use permits.
- g. Valle Vidal
 - i. The entire Valle Vidal is not eligible for a wilderness designation because of improvements: e.g. Shuree Lodge, Shuree ponds, corral for cattlemen, two lane road from Amalia to Cimarron, evidence of human activity, cemeteries.

- ii. VV is surrounded by non-federal land, RCCLA [Rio Costilla Cooperative Livestock Association], Red River and Cimarron.
 - iii. We need the Valle Vidal to be the engine of our local economy. Improve access and increase visitors. More visitors would help economy of Amalia, Costilla and Cimarron.
 - iv. Wilderness status conflicts with Rio Grande cut throat trout management and creek restoration.
 - v. Keep track of all permits sold to hunters for elk, bear, deer, bobcat, and have information available for public review. There is an overabundance of wildlife in the Valle Vidal, elk in particular. The FS is in a better position (management) to deal with these issues than would a wilderness area!
- h. WpW6, w8Wp
- i. W6 Lacks solitude due to heavy hiker traffic
 - ii. WpW6
 - 1. The Questa district lacks areas to create hut hopping opportunities for non-motorized recreational activities (hikers, cross-country skiers, horseback riders). By leaving this area not designated as wilderness we have the opportunity to construct huts in this area – thereby creating hut-hopping between Red River and TSV.
 - iii. WpW8
 - 1. Lacks solitude dues to proximity of homes, ranches, highly populated trails.
3. East Side Districts (29 March 2016)
- a. C4
 - i. Traditional uses are true of the majority of lands adjacent to any of land grants, Cristóbal de las Jerna (C4), Trampas (C5), etc.
 - ii. Traditional use by Sta Barbara Grant
 - b. Q1, 4
 - i. There is evidence of human activity – roads, old railroad beds, logged areas, etc.
 - ii. Lots of range improvements--i.e. windmills and earthen water tanks--that need to be maintained with mechanical equipment
 - c. Q2
 - i. There are roads abundantly used for traditional uses such as firewood removal, piñon picking, etc.
 - d. Q3
 - i. The area has a unique ATV, OTV trail that is easily accessible and a place to view molybdenum mine areas. This is an educational trail and should remain open to the public.
 - e. Q5
 - i. The Midnight area and the Greenie Peak are used by various snowmobile groups. Children and adults can get an educational experience and an awesome recreational experience. This should not be designated as a wilderness area. Keep this one open for hiking, ATV use, horseback and snowmobile use!
 - f. WpW5
 - i. This is a great place to take ATVs, ORVs or take a hike. This one should not be designated as a wilderness. It can be managed by the FS and should not be a 'problem area.'
 - ii. With heavy recreational use (ATVs) – roads needed to access traditional uses
 - g. There were a few comments in favor of expanding Wilderness designation:

- i. C14--Around existing Pecos wilderness there is a good amount of roadless area that would likely meet characteristics – quiet, remote
- ii. C4--Warm Springs area is appropriate – remote, limited access, adjacent to Picuris pueblo lands
- iii. C10--N side is limited access (but area is of limited size) – may help prevent encroachment to Taos pueblo lands (though the pueblo may still want some vehicular access)
- iv.

4. Manassa, CO (13 April 2016)

- a. W4
 - i. Wild horses present; Man-made dirt tanks
- b. W11
 - i. Cell phone towers / close to highway and heavily used roads / easy access
- c. W14
 - i. Rio Grande, Lucero Lakes – lots of down and dead – poor and debilitated enclosures not maintained for years. Broke-off – not good hiking – very rocky would not be desirable – stock tanks fenced between Broke-off and Lucero Lakes.
 - ii. Heavily accessed by vehicles and ATVs / man made structures / private land (corral units)
- d. W17
 - i. Allotment we need to use back hoe to clean stock tank. We have the Toltec train goes right through it. We have a lot of ATV use. The railroad track crew. There camping ... fishing
- e. W29, 30
 - i. Evidence of human activity – roads and past logging Man-made water tanks Heavy ATV use Noisy highway through area Access to private land Numerous mining claims
- f. Wxs 723, 710 ADD
 - i. Riddled with logging roads and are used extensively by hunters and wood gatherers in pickups and ATVs.
- g. Rio Tusas, lower San Antonio area
 - i. Should not be considered due to the wood harvest The private land that is checker boarded throughout

5. Peñasco 15 April 2016

- a. C5
 - i. Should not be considered because:
 1. Many landowners use vehicles to gain access to their private land
 2. Traditionally it is used for firewood, grazing, hunting
 3. Much power saw and four wheeler usage happens here.
 - ii. Just as important for the irrigation sections to El Valle-Trampas area.
- b. C7
 - i. Hodge camp area to include acequia headgates.
 1. Hodges campsite: Boulders, pointy, small and large rocks throughout campsite-- unable to park a camping trailer. Campsite not leveled. Two culverts exposed – 1st right middle, 2nd top half. No tables, no grills. A pond of water at entrance. Entrance getting flooded.

- ii. Needed for wood cutting
 - c. C11, C14
 - i. Also to harvest hay from Hodges Meadows and to harvest wood for heating and vigas to maintain our barns and homes ... and our acequias and hunting in our back yard. We were born and raised here, and this is our livelihood. We don't need no more wilderness.
 - ii. No wilderness added within land grants of Santa Barbara and Las Trampas
 - d. Camp Summer Life now known as the Monastery: Concerned about the acequia head gate which starts above. If this part becomes wilderness, what access will there be to get there.
 - e. Ell Valle Campsite – It's not posted on hwy 76. campsites not leveled, need more tables, more grills, more restrooms, road that leads to campsites is sloped to the left and the right with ruts and deep holes and boulders, small pointed large rocks.
 - f. La Junta campsites: Entire road needs to be scraped – road is very bumpy with holes and pointy rocks. Campsite needs more restrooms – more tables – more grills – solitude area.
 - g. Sipapu ski area need area to expand management area in purple needs to be eliminated from consideration, as does roadless area surrounding ski area.
6. Taos 8 April 2016
- a. Land along Hwy 150 is critical for fire mitigation, along with land for the village of Taos Ski Valley, and along the Bull of the Woods trail.
 - b. Another consideration should be fire probability and spread into areas that have Wildland Urban Interface communities and important water sources for communities, such as Hwy 518 north to Pueblo Ridge
 - c. All motorized trails around Red River must stay as is. If these go wilderness, it will seriously impact RR economically. A possible trail along the big Ditch needs to stay open for that consideration.
 - i. For Red River town and corridor Hwy 434 need a big buffer (not 1 mile, more like 10 miles)
 - ii. Red River area and Valle Vidal do not need any more wilderness areas. This will have an impact on \$ made in Red River. The town will die out. More than ½ the \$ made is from jeeps, ATV and motorcycles.
 - d. There is a robust set of mountain bike recreational trails throughout the C4, C10, C13, C12 areas, including Picuris Peak.
 - e. Valle Vidal considerations--
 - i. Because of fire potential if wilderness area this could affect the Rio Costilla Cooperative Livestock Association properties, 88,000 acres of mountain producing timber.
 - ii. If Valle Vidal remains Forest Service there is a possibility that we could get a paved road from Cimarron to Amalia that would bring opportunities, jobs to an area that has suffered economically, especially now that the mine in Questa has closed.
 - iii. If considering wilderness designation for Valle Vidal, CNF should consider current riparian restoration projects currently underway on neighboring private land. Specifically: Middle Ponil Creek
 - iv. Specifically in the Valle Vidal: USFS land for trade: Upper Leandro Creek, Upper Allen Creek, Upper P_?__house Canyon
 - f. There were some comments in favor of expanding Wilderness designation:
 - i. *Add extra 'buffer zone' acreage to the wilderness to protect Serpent Lake*
 - ii. *I recommend the Middle Fork Road remain decommissioned permanently. For that road to be reopened would destroy the access that people can go as a day hike to experience wilderness beauty.*
 - iii. *I think the north end of the Pecos Wilderness needs to be expanded.... When considering wilderness designation, the CNF must consider the potential for future beneficial land trades adjacent to the forest and inholdings that would correlate property boundaries with*

watersheds to improve ecologically based management, as well as the potential to trade for inholdings, motorized trail. There needs to be more enforcement of motorized travel rules, even in existing wilderness. The NM Wilderness Alliance has defined a proposed boundary that would expand and protect the wilderness, as well as protecting acequias and traditional uses.

7. West Side Districts (1 April 2016)

- a. W6
 - i. [There are] hunting and fuelwood / grazing / gathering area (electric line) Near Mesa de Las Viejas, Echo Amphitheater, private ranches
- b. W15
 - i. [There are] range grazing and water structures development
- c. W23, 24
 - i. El Rito Canyon ... Stone Canyon ... ongoing large-scale restoration projects
- d. W25
 - i. Land grant issues?
- e. W28
 - i. Sustained yield unit
- f. W32
 - i. Canjilon Lakes – campgrounds and water source, fishing
 - ii. Contains Canjilon water association spring and development for potable water
 - iii. It is adjacent to Trout Lakes, which is a popular recreation site
 - iv. Manageability is not feasible due to access and use between Trout Lakes and Canjilon Lakes
 - v. Snowmobiling occurs on the entire unit
 - vi. There are several inholdings that are adjacent to this unit