

Tongass National Forest Plan Amendment

Objection Resolution Meeting

October 12-14 & October 17-19, 2016 Ketchikan
and Juneau, Alaska

Cape Fox Lodge Shaa Hit Conference Room 800 Venetia Way, Ketchikan <u>Teleconference Number:</u> 888-844-9904, Passcode 1331636# <u>Focus Topics – See Attachment 1</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Renewable Energy• Young Growth Transition	KTOO @360 Meeting Room 360 Egan Drive, Juneau <u>Teleconference Number:</u> 888-844-9904, Passcode 1331636# <u>Focus Topics – See Attachment 1</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Inventoried Roadless Areas• Wildlife Habitat and the Conservation Strategy

Meeting Outcomes

1. Attendees understand the Tongass National Forest Plan Amendment objection review process and its status, how the information discussed at the meeting will inform the final decision on the forest plan amendment, and next steps.
2. For the topics identified for consideration at the meeting, the Objectors and Interested Persons have an opportunity to discuss and clarify the objection(s) with the Reviewing Officer and suggest opportunities for resolution.

AGENDA Day 1 – October 12, 2016 10:00 AM – 5:00 PM Ketchikan

Introduction to the Process
Focus Topic – Renewable Energy

Time	Topic	Who
10:00	Sign-in / Teleconference Dial-In	
10:15	Welcome and Opening <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Welcome • Review meeting outcomes and agenda • Logistics & ground rules • Introductions • Reviewing Officer’s opening remarks 	Beth Pendleton, Regional Forester Jan Caulfield, Meeting Facilitator
10:45	Overview of the Forest Plan Amendment Process <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Planning process intent and milestones 	Earl Stewart, Forest Supervisor Susan Howle, Forest Planner
11:15	The Objection Process / Resolution Meeting <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Overview of the objection process • Range of issues submitted • Issues selected for objection resolution meeting • How these discussions relate to final decision on the forest plan amendment • Process for discussion of issues (<i>Attachment 2</i>) • Agenda for Day 3 and Day 6 (<i>Attachment 2</i>) 	Beth Pendleton Jan Caulfield
11:45	Lunch	
1:00	Issue 1 – Renewable Energy Development <i>(Attachment 1)</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Introduction to the Issue by the Reviewing Officer • Objectors present their perspective on the issue and suggestions for resolution • Additional input from Interested Persons • Discussion • Questions & Summary by Reviewing Officer 	Beth Pendleton Earl Stewart Objectors – 5 minutes per initial comment Interested Persons – 5 minutes per initial comment
4:45	Summary of the Day <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Reviewing Officer’s reflections • Review Day 2 agenda • Submit topics for Day 3 / Day 6 agendas • Questions • Thank You! 	Beth Pendleton Jan Caulfield
5:00	Adjourn	

Time	Topic	Who
	Sign-in / Teleconference Dial-In	
9:00	Opening, Introductions <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Introductions • Review process for discussion of issues <i>(Attachment 2)</i> • Review Day 2 agenda • Review Day 3 / Day 6 agendas 	Jan Caulfield
9:20	Issue 2 – Young Growth Inventory <i>(Attachment 1)</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Introduction to the Issue by the Reviewing Officer • Objectors present their perspective on the issue and suggestions for resolution • Additional input from Interested Persons • Discussion • Questions & Summary by Reviewing Officer 	Beth Pendleton Earl Stewart Objectors – 5 minutes per initial comment Interested Persons – 5 minutes per initial comment
12:00	Lunch	
1:15	Issue 3 – Timeframe for Transition to Young Growth <i>(Attachment 1)</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Introduction to the Issue by the Reviewing Officer • Objectors present their perspective on the issue and suggestions for resolution • Additional input from Interested Persons • Discussion • Questions & Summary by Reviewing Officer 	Beth Pendleton Earl Stewart Objectors – 5 minutes per initial comment Interested Persons – 5 minutes per initial comment
4:45	Summary of the Day <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Reviewing Officer’s reflections • Review Day 3 Agenda • Questions • Thank You! 	Beth Pendleton Jan Caulfield
5:00	Adjourn	

AGENDA Day 3 – October 14, 2016 9:00 AM – 3:30 PM Ketchikan		
Time	Topic	Who
	Registration and sign-in	
9:00	Opening, Introductions, Review Day 3 agenda	Jan Caulfield
9:20	Continue Discussion of Issue 1 (Day 1) – Renewable Energy Development: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Biomass listing as a renewable energy resource • Potential criteria – public vs. private renewable energy project 	Beth Pendleton Earl Stewart Objectors Interested Persons
10:20	Break	
10:40	Other Topics <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Impacts of Transition Plan on Timber-Dependent Communities – Ketchikan Gateway Borough 	
12:00	Lunch	
1:15	Other Topics (30 minutes per topic) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Harvest in high-volume old growth stands – Defenders of Wildlife • Limit on old growth clear-cutting – Defenders of Wildlife • Harvest constraints and the model implementation reduction factor (falldown) – Alaska Forest Association 	
2:45	Break	
3:00	Closing Remarks for Day 3 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Reviewing Officer’s reflections • Juneau meeting – Oct. 17-19 • Thank You! 	Beth Pendleton Jan Caulfield
3:30	Adjourn	

AGENDA Day 4 – October 17, 2016 10:00 AM – 5:00 PM Juneau		
Introduction to the Process Focus Topic – Inventoried Roadless Areas		
10:00	Sign-in / Teleconference Dial-In	
10:15	Welcome and Opening <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Welcome • Review meeting outcomes and agenda • Logistics & ground rules • Introductions • Reviewing Officer’s opening remarks 	Beth Pendleton, Regional Forester Jan Caulfield, Meeting Facilitator
10:45	Overview of the Forest Plan Amendment Process <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Planning process intent and milestones 	Earl Stewart, Forest Supervisor Susan Howle, Forest Planner
11:15	The Objection Process / Resolution Meeting <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Overview of the objection process • Range of issues submitted • Issues selected for objection resolution meeting • How these discussions relate to final decision on the forest plan amendment • Process for discussion of issues (<i>Attachment 2</i>) 	Beth Pendleton Jan Caulfield
11:45	Lunch	
1:00	Issue 4 – Application of the Roadless Rule <i>(Attachment 1)</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Introduction to the Issue by the Reviewing Officer • Objectors present their perspective on the issue and suggestions for resolution • Additional input from Interested Persons • Discussion • Questions & Summary by Reviewing Officer 	Beth Pendleton Earl Stewart Objectors – 5 minutes per initial comment Interested Persons – 5 minutes per initial comment
4:45	Summary of the Day <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Reviewing Officer’s reflections • Review Day 5 & Day 6 agendas • Questions • Thank You! 	Beth Pendleton Jan Caulfield
5:00	Adjourn	

AGENDA Day 5 – October 18, 2016 9:00 AM – 5:00 PM Juneau
 Focus Topic – Wildlife Habitat and the Conservation Strategy

Time	Topic	Who
	Sign-in / Teleconference Dial-In	
9:00	Opening, Introductions <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Introductions • Review process for discussion of issues (Attachment 2) • Review Day 5 agenda 	Jan Caulfield, Meeting Facilitator
9:20	Issue 5 – Harvest in Components of the Wildlife Conservation Strategy and Other Areas (Attachment 1) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Introduction to the Issue by the Reviewing Officer • Objectors present their perspective on the issue and suggestions for resolution • Additional input from Interested Persons • Discussion • Questions & Summary by Reviewing Officer 	Beth Pendleton Earl Stewart Objectors – 5 minutes per initial comment Interested Persons – 5 minutes per initial comment
12:00	Lunch	
1:15	Continue Issue 5 – Harvest in Components of the Wildlife Conservation Strategy and Other Areas	
4:45	Summary of the Day <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Reviewing Officer’s reflections • Review Day 6 agenda • Questions • Thank You! 	Beth Pendleton Jan Caulfield
5:00	Adjourn	

AGENDA Day 6 – October 19, 2016 10:00 AM – 5:00 PM Juneau		
Time	Topic	Who
	Registration and sign-in	
10:00	Opening, Introductions, Review Agenda	Jan Caulfield, Meeting Facilitator
10:20	Other Topics (30 minutes per topic) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Assessment of wolf and deer on Prince of Wales Island - Audubon Society • Mineral Land Use Designation – Jim Clark • Impacts of the Amended Plan on Mining – Frank Bergstrom 	
12:00	Lunch	
1:30	Issue – Market Demand (see Attachment) Introduction to the Issue by the Reviewing Officer Objectors present their perspective on the issue and suggestions for resolution Additional input from Interested Persons Discussion Questions & Summary by Reviewing Officer	Beth Pendleton Earl Stewart Objectors – 5 minutes per initial comment Interested Persons – 5 minutes per initial comment
4:30	Closing Remarks <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Reviewing Officer’s reflections • Next steps in the objection review and forest planning processes • Thank You! 	Beth Pendleton Jan Caulfield
5:00	Adjourn	

Tongass National Forest Plan Amendment Objection Resolution Meeting Topics for Discussion

October 12-14, 2016 – Ketchikan

Focus Topic – Renewable Energy

Issue 1 – Renewable Energy Development

Some objectors contend the forest plan amendment failed to develop sufficient renewable energy criteria to provide for a predictable, repeatable, and objective process for decisionmaking on renewable energy projects.

Objectors:

Alaska Power & Telephone	Jim Clark
Frank Murkowski	Ketchikan Chamber of Commerce
Resource Development Council	City of Wrangell
Alaska Miners Association	First Things First Alaska Foundation
Hyak Mining	Ketchikan Gateway Borough
State of Alaska	Alaska Forest Association
Southeast Conference	Earthjustice
Alaska Wilderness League	Center for Biological Diversity
Southeast Alaska Conservation Council	Defenders of Wildlife
GEOS Institute	Natural Resources Defense Council
Sierra Club	Greater SE Alaska Conservation Community
The Boat Company	Cascadia Wildlands
Greenpeace	

Interested Persons:

Ara Marderosian	Denise Boggs
Sealaska Corporation	Tony Gallegos, Ketchikan Indian Community
Jason Custer	

Issue 2 – Young Growth Inventory

Some objectors contend a final decision to transition out of old-growth harvest and into young growth cannot be made until there is a complete inventory of young-growth timber on the Tongass, which will determine whether there is sufficient economic timber to support a viable timber industry.

Objectors:

- | | |
|-----------------------------------|--|
| Alaska Power & Telephone | Jim Clark |
| Frank Murkowski | Ketchikan Chamber of Commerce |
| Resource Development Council | City of Wrangell |
| Alaska Miners Association | First Things First Alaska Foundation |
| Hyak Mining | Ketchikan Gateway Borough |
| State of Alaska | Alaska Forest Association |
| Southeast Conference | Alcan Forest Products |
| Sealaska Corporation | George Woodbury |
| Earthjustice | Alaska Wilderness League |
| Center for Biological Diversity | Southeast Alaska Conservation Council |
| Defenders of Wildlife | GEOS Institute |
| Natural Resources Defense Council | Sierra Club |
| The Boat Company | Greenpeace |
| Cascadia Wildlands | Greater SE Alaska Conservation Community |

Interested Persons:

- | | |
|-----------------|---|
| Ara Marderosian | Denise Boggs |
| Jason Custer | Tony Gallegos, Ketchikan Indian Community |

Issue 3 – Timeframe for Transition to Young Growth

Some objectors contend that transition to young growth within 10-15 years is untenable because there is no profitable market for young growth, there is insufficient volume available due to the constraints of the Selected Alternative, and there is no assurance of sufficient volume to justify the investments industry will need to make for transition to be achievable. Other objectors contend the transition timeframe of 10-15 years is too long and does not decrease the harvest of old growth more rapidly, thereby unnecessarily prolonging industry's investment in harvesting and marketing young growth.

Objectors:

Alaska Power & Telephone	Jim Clark
Frank Murkowski	Ketchikan Chamber of Commerce
Resource Development Council	City of Wrangell
Alaska Miners Association	First Things First Alaska Foundation
Hyak Mining	Ketchikan Gateway Borough
State of Alaska	Alaska Forest Association
Southeast Conference	Alcan Forest Products
Sealaska Corporation	George Woodbury
Earthjustice	Alaska Wilderness League
Center for Biological Diversity	Southeast Alaska Conservation Council
Defenders of Wildlife	GEOS Institute
Natural Resources Defense Council	Sierra Club
The Boat Company	Greenpeace
Cascadia Wildlands	Greater SE Alaska Conservation Community
Eric Lee	Margo Waring
Audubon	Trout Unlimited
Sitka Conservation Society	
Trust Land Office	

Interested Persons:

Ara Marderosian	Denise Boggs
Jason Custer	Tony Gallegos, Ketchikan Indian Community

Focus Topic – Inventoried Roadless Areas

Issue 4 – Application of the Roadless Rule

Some objectors raised issues about the Roadless Rule, its application to the Tongass National Forest, and whether “roaded roadless” and/or “2008 inventory” roadless should be subject to the timber harvest and road construction restrictions of the Roadless Rule. Additionally, some objectors contend the Roadless Rule impedes access for other needs, such as subsistence and recreational use, as well as renewable energy development, including hydropower.

Objectors:

Alaska Power & Telephone	Jim Clark
Frank Murkowski	Ketchikan Chamber of Commerce
Resource Development Council	City of Wrangell
Alaska Miners Association	First Things First Alaska Foundation
Hyak Mining	Ketchikan Gateway Borough
State of Alaska	Sealaska Corporation
George Woodbury	Earthjustice
Sierra Club	Alaska Wilderness League
Center for Biological Diversity	Southeast Alaska Conservation Council
Defenders of Wildlife	GEOS Institute
Natural Resources Defense Council	Trout Unlimited

Interested Persons:

Ara Marderosian	Denise Boggs
Jason Custer	Tony Gallegos, Ketchikan Indian Community

Issue 5 – Harvest in Components of the Wildlife Conservation Strategy and Other Areas

Some objectors contend adverse effects to wildlife will occur by allowing timber harvest in important components of the Tongass Conservation Strategy, including beach and estuary fringe, riparian management areas, and old growth reserves, as well as other areas the objectors believe should be protected, such as the “Tongass 77” watersheds and “Audubon/TNC Conservation Priority Areas.” Designating these areas as suitable for young growth timber harvest is challenged as inconsistent with the intent of the Conservation Strategy and the protection of resource values of the Tongass 77 watersheds and Audubon/TNC Conservation Priority Areas.

Objectors:

Alaska Power & Telephone	Jim Clark
Frank Murkowski	Ketchikan Chamber of Commerce
Resource Development Council	City of Wrangell
Alaska Miners Association	First Things First Alaska Foundation
Hyak Mining	Ketchikan Gateway Borough
State of Alaska	Sealaska Corporation
Earthjustice	Alaska Wilderness League
Center for Biological Diversity	Southeast Alaska Conservation Council
Defenders of Wildlife	GEOS Institute
Natural Resources Defense Council	Sierra Club
The Boat Company	Greenpeace
Cascadia Wildlands	Greater SE Alaska Conservation Community
Eric Lee	Trout Unlimited
Audubon	

Interested Persons:

Ara Marderosian	Denise Boggs
Jason Custer	Tony Gallegos, Ketchikan Indian Community

Issue 6 – Market Demand

Market Demand – Nearly all of the objections included issues related to the market demand analyses completed for the Plan Amendment. Objection points include concerns on both sides of the issue. On one side of the issue, objectors contend the Forest Service underestimated market demand and overestimated the timber supply from State and Native Corporation lands. Other objectors contend the Forest Service overestimated demand, and that the Forest Service wrongly used this inflated projection for all alternatives.

Objectors:

Alaska Power & Telephone	Jim Clark
Frank Murkowski	Alcan Forest Products
Ketchikan Chamber of Commerce	Resource Development Council
City of Wrangell	Alaska Miners Association
First Things First Alaska Foundation	Hyak Mining
Ketchikan Gateway Borough	Sealaska Corporation
State of Alaska	George Woodbury
Alaska Forest Association	Southeast Conference
Earthjustice	Alaska Wilderness League
Southeast Alaska Conservation Council	Defenders of Wildlife
GEOS Institute	Natural Resources Defense Council
Audubon	Trout Unlimited
Center for Biological Diversity	Sierra Club
The Boat Company	Cascadia Wildlands
Greenpeace	Greater SE Alaska Conservation Community

Interested Persons:

Ara Marderosian	Denise Boggs
Jason Custer	Tony Gallegos, Ketchikan Indian Community

Tongass National Forest Plan Amendment Objection Resolution Meeting Meeting Structure & Instructions

The Tongass National Forest Plan Amendment objection resolution meeting will be structured and facilitated to provide opportunity for identified Objectors and Interested Persons to speak with the Reviewing Official about issues raised during the objection process. The meeting is open to the public for observation only.

The agenda lists issues that the Reviewing Officer has identified for discussion on Days 1 and 2 in Ketchikan, and on Days 4 and 5 in Juneau. On Day 3 (Ketchikan) and Day 6 (Juneau), there are opportunities for Objectors to discuss additional issues that have not been identified for discussion on Days 1, 2, 4, or 5. Issues must be submitted by Objectors by the end of Day 1, see further instructions below.

Process for Discussion of Each Issue

- The agenda identifies issues for discussion. Objectors and interested persons who plan to make oral comment during any discussion will be asked to address the aspect(s) of the issues as identified on Attachment 1. The Objectors and Interested Persons eligible to speak with the Reviewing Officer about those issues are listed in Attachment 1.
- We will begin discussion for each issue at the start time shown on the agenda. If the previous issue discussion ends early, we will take a longer break – rather than starting early on the next issue.
- The meeting is being teleconferenced and recorded. Microphones will be used by all speakers.
- For each issue, we will follow these steps in facilitated discussion:
 1. Introduction to the Issue by the Reviewing Officer
 2. Objectors present their perspective on Issue and suggestions for resolution
 3. Additional input from Interested Persons
 4. Discussion
 5. Questions & Summary by Reviewing Officer
- The facilitator will set a maximum time of five minutes for Objectors' and Interested Persons' initial comments – to ensure that there is time reserved for facilitated discussion with the Reviewing Officer.
- If a prior speaker has already made your points, please simply indicate your agreement with that earlier statement, rather than restating it at length. This will help maximize time for discussion.

Day 3 & Day 6 Agendas – Additional Issues

- There will be time on Day 3 (Ketchikan) and on Day 6 (Juneau) to discuss *additional issues that were raised in the Objection process*, but were not identified for discussion on Days 1, 2, 4, or 5. To be eligible for discussion, the issue must have been identified in an eligible objection submitted earlier in the Objection process. “New” issues cannot be raised at the resolution meeting.
- If an Objector has an issue he or she would like to have discussed on Day 3 or Day 6:
By no later than 5:00 PM on Day 1, email objections-alaska-regional-office@fs.fed.us with a brief statement of the issue and the suggested resolution that you would like to discuss with the Reviewing Officer. **OR**, you can complete and submit the form available in the meeting room on Day 1.
- The agendas for Day 3 and Day 6 will be designed to provide time for discussion of the additional issues submitted by Objector(s) by 5:00 PM on Day 1. The agendas for Day 3 and Day 6 will be distributed in the meeting room and posted on-line on Day 2 at <http://www.fs.usda.gov/goto/R10/Tongass/PlanAmend>.