

4FRI Rim Country Alternatives

Alternative 2 (Modified Proposed Action)

This is the Proposed Action as presented for scoping, with additional detail, clarifications, corrections, and modifications in response to public comments received.

The even-aged shelterwood treatments originally proposed have been replaced with regular restoration treatments focused on dwarf mistletoe. Design features will focus mechanical thinning treatments on addressing dwarf mistletoe infections. Alternative 2, as modified, responds to the Dwarf Mistletoe Mitigation issue.

The restoration activities listed for Alternative 2 include vegetation treatments (mechanical thinning and burning) as well as comprehensive restoration treatments (other restoration treatments) for grassland, aquatics, wildlife habitat, and rare species restoration.

- Mechanically thin trees and/or implement prescribed fire on approximately 899,340 acres.
 - Implement mechanical thinning and prescribed fire on up to 520,300 acres including –
 - Up to 151,390 acres of intermediate thinning
 - Up to 71,800 acres of stand improvement
 - Up to 14,350 acres of single tree selection
 - Up to 282,760 acres of uneven-aged group selection
 - Implement prescribed fire alone on approximately 48,720 acres.
 - Mechanically thin and/or implement prescribed fire on up to 78,900 acres of Mexican spotted owl (MSO) protected activity centers (PACs) including --
 - Up to 22,010 acres of mechanical thinning and/or prescribed fire
 - Up to 48,720 acres of prescribed fire only
 - Up to 8,170 acres of facilitative operations
 - Mechanically thin and/or implement prescribed fire on approximately 25,960 acres of MSO replacement nest/roost recovery habitat.
 - Conduct facilitative operations in non-target cover types to support treatments in target cover types, including –
 - Up to 133,150 acres of facilitative thinning and prescribed fire
 - Up to 7,880 acres of facilitative prescribed fire only in PACs
 - Up to 300 acres of facilitative thinning and prescribed fire in PACs
 - Restore aspen on approximately 1,230 acres, including up to 30 acres in PACs.
 - Restore approximately 125,820 acres that have experienced severe disturbance, including up to 3,610 acres in PACs.
 - Restore approximately 17,590 acres of savanna.

Alt 2 Mechanical and Fire Treatments

Treatment	Acres
Areas of Severe Disturbance Treatment	125,824
Aspen Restoration	1,231
Facilitative Operations Mechanical	133,450
Facilitative Operations Prescribed Fire Only	7,875
Intermediate Thin	151,389
MSO Recovery - Replacement Nest/Roost	25,963
PAC - Mechanical	18,371
Prescribed Fire Only	48,721
Savanna	17,592
Stand Improvement	71,803
Single Tree Selection	14,354
Uneven Age	282,763
Grand Total	899,335

- Restore approximately 36,340 acres of grassland, including –
 - Maintaining or restoring montane meadow connectivity in pronghorn corridors.
- Restore hydrologic function and vegetation on approximately 6,760 acres of meadows.
- Restore approximately 184 springs.
- Restore function and habitat in up to 777 miles of streams, including stream reaches with habitat for threatened, endangered, and sensitive aquatic species.
- Restore up to 14,730 acres of riparian areas for aquatic stream habitat.
- Decommission approximately 230 miles of existing system and unauthorized roads on the Coconino and Apache-Sitgreaves NFs.
- Decommission approximately 20 miles of unauthorized roads on the Tonto NF.
- Improve approximately 150 miles of existing non-system roads and construct approximately 350 miles of temporary roads for haul access; decommission all temporary roads when treatments are completed.
- Relocate and reconstruct existing open roads adversely affecting water quality and natural resources, or of concern to human safety.
- Construct up to 200 miles of protective barriers around springs, aspen, native willows, and big-tooth maples, as needed for restoration.

Alternative 3 (Focused Alternative)

This alternative is designed to focus restoration treatments in areas that are the most highly departed from the natural range of variation (NRV) of ecological conditions, and/or that put communities at risk from undesirable fire behavior and effects. High value assets will be better protected and burn boundaries will be designed to create conditions safe for personnel and to ensure fire can meet objectives. Treatment areas would be chosen to optimize ecological restoration, those areas that are most important to treat and can be moved the furthest

toward desired conditions. Focusing on the higher priority ecological restoration will result in fewer acres being treated.

The restoration treatments proposed in Alternative 3 will be used to address moderate and high levels of mistletoe infection, but to a lesser extent on the fewer acres proposed for mechanical treatment and fire. The presence of dwarf mistletoe will not be used to prioritize areas for treatment, but it will be addressed where it exists, using the same types of treatments as Alternative 2. Design features will be developed to focus activity on addressing dwarf mistletoe infestations during implementation of mechanical treatments.

Alternative 3 responds to the Smoke/Air Quality, Economics, Roads, and Dwarf Mistletoe Mitigation issues.

- Mechanically thin trees and/or implement prescribed fire on approximately 447,315 acres.
 - Implement mechanical thinning and prescribed fire on up to 304,880 acres including –
 - Up to 108,480 acres of intermediate thinning
 - Up to 37,220 acres of stand improvement
 - Up to 7,280 acres of single tree selection
 - Up to 151,900 acres of uneven-aged group selection
 - Implement prescribed fire alone on approximately 34,610 acres.
 - Mechanically thin and/or implement prescribed fire on up to 55,010 acres of Mexican spotted owl (MSO) protected activity centers (PACs) including --
 - Up to 17,110 acres of mechanical thinning and/or prescribed fire
 - Up to 34,610 acres of prescribed fire only
 - Up to 3,290 acres of facilitative operations
 - Mechanically thin and/or implement prescribed fire on approximately 20,120 acres of MSO replacement nest/roost recovery habitat.
 - Conduct facilitative operations in non-target cover types to support treatments in target cover types, including –
 - Up to 46,250 acres of facilitative thinning and prescribed fire
 - Up to 2,990 acres of facilitative prescribed fire only in PACs
 - Up to 300 acres of facilitative thinning and prescribed fire in PACs
 - Restore aspen on approximately 1,010 acres, including up to 30 acres in PACs.
 - Restore approximately 19,230 acres that have experienced severe disturbance, including up to 430 acres in PACs.
 - Restore approximately 1,270 acres of savanna.

Alt 3 Mechanical and Fire Treatments

Treatment	Acres
Areas of Severe Disturbance Treatment	19,231
Aspen Restoration	1,009
Facilitative Operations Mechanical	46,548
Facilitative Operations Prescribed Fire Only	2,990
Intermediate Thin	108,483
MSO Recovery - Replacement Nest/Roost	20,117
PAC - Mechanical	16,649
Prescribed Fire Only	34,613
Savanna	1,270
Stand Improvement	37,217
Single Tree Selection	7,284
Uneven Age	151,904
Grand Total	447,315

- Restore approximately 36,340 acres of grassland, including –
 - Maintaining or restoring montane meadow connectivity in pronghorn corridors.
- Restore hydrologic function and vegetation on approximately 6,760 acres of meadows.
- Restore approximately 184 springs.
- Restore function and habitat in up to 777 miles of streams, including stream reaches with habitat for threatened, endangered, and sensitive aquatic species.
- Restore up to 14,730 acres of riparian areas for aquatic stream habitat.
- Decommission approximately 230 miles of existing system and unauthorized roads on the Coconino and Apache-Sitgreaves NFs.
- Decommission approximately 20 miles of unauthorized roads on the Tonto NF.
- Improve approximately 150 miles of existing non-system roads and construct approximately 350 miles of temporary roads for haul access; decommission all temporary roads when treatments are completed.
- Relocate and reconstruct existing open roads adversely affecting water quality and natural resources, or of concern to human safety.
- Construct up to 200 miles of protective barriers around springs, aspen, native willows, and big-tooth maples, as needed for restoration.

Detailed Mechanical and Fire Treatments by Alternative

Treatment	Acres Alt 2 (MPA)	Acres Alt 3 (FA)
Areas of Severe Disturbance Treatment	125,824	19,231
Areas of Severe Disturbance Treatment	122,215	18,799
PAC - Areas of Severe Disturbance Treatment	3,609	431
Aspen Restoration	1,231	1,009
Aspen Restoration	1,203	980
PAC - Aspen Restoration	28	28
Facilitative Operations Mechanical	133,450	46,548
Facilitative Operations Mechanical	133,152	46,250
PAC - Facilitative Operations Mechanical	298	298
Facilitative Operations Prescribed Fire Only	7,875	2,990
PAC - Facilitative Operations Prescribed Fire Only	7,875	2,990
Intermediate Thin	151,389	108,483
IT 10% - 25%	33,310	25,709
IT 25% - 40%	60,139	37,087
IT 40% - 55%	57,940	45,687
MSO Recovery - Replacement Nest/Roost	25,963	20,117
MSO Recovery - Replacement Nest/Roost	25,963	20,117
PAC - Mechanical	18,371	16,649
PAC - Mechanical	18,371	16,649
Prescribed Fire Only	48,721	34,613
PAC - Prescribed Fire Only	48,721	34,613
Savanna	17,592	1,270
Savanna	17,592	1,270
Stand Improvement	71,803	37,217
SI 10% - 25%	15,349	8,559
SI 25% - 40%	39,758	18,894
SI 40% - 55%	16,697	9,765
Single Tree Selection	14,354	7,284
ST	14,354	7,284
Uneven Age	282,763	151,904
UEA 10% - 25%	89,162	55,059
UEA 25% - 40%	126,489	65,217
UEA 40% - 55%	46,411	13,724
UEA 55% - 70%	20,700	17,904
Grand Total	899,335	447,315