

Comparison of Carson National Forest Plan Alternatives 1 – 5

This table compares Alternatives 2 through 4 ONLY. Alternative 1 is the Carson National Forest’s (NF) current plan. Since plan components of the current plan cannot be easily compared with the proposed plan and alternatives, it is not included in this table. Alternative 5 is also not included, since it includes exactly the same plan components as Alternative 2, except it proposes 67,941 acres or 100% of evaluated areas.

Black text indicates the wording is the same as Alternative 2.

~~Strike through text~~ indicates the wording will not be in this alternative.

Blue text indicates a change in wording in this alternative.

Resource Area	Plan Code	Alternative 2 Proposed Plan	Alternative 3	Alternative 4
		Provides for Restoration of Diverse Ecosystem Services	Maximizes Access and Commodity Utilization	Maximizes Natural Processes
Forest-wide (FW)				
Mixed Conifer with Frequent Fire (VEG-MCD)	VEG-MCD-O	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> Mechanically treat at least 5,500 – 10,000 acres, during each 10-year period following plan approval. During each 10 year period following plan approval, treat at least 20,000 – 40,000 acres using a combination of prescribed fire and naturally ignited wildfire to make progress toward or to maintain desired conditions. 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> Mechanically treat at least 5,500—40,000 15,000 – 30,000 acres, during each 10-year period following plan approval. 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> Mechanically treat at least 5,500—40,000 acres, during each 10-year period following plan approval. During each 10 year period following plan approval, treat at least 20,000—40,000 25,000 – 50,000 acres using a combination of prescribed fire and naturally ignited wildfire to make progress toward or to maintain desired conditions.
Ponderosa Pine Forest (VEG-PPF)	VEG-PPF-O	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> Mechanically treat at least 22,000 – 50,000 acres, during each 10-year period following plan approval. During the 10 years following plan approval, treat at least 80,000 – 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> Mechanically treat at least 22,000—50,000 50,000 – 100,000 acres, during each 10-year period following plan approval. 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> Mechanically treat at least 22,000—50,000 acres, during each 10-year period following plan approval. During the 10 years following plan approval, treat at least 80,000—

Resource Area	Plan Code	Alternative 2 Proposed Plan	Alternative 3	Alternative 4
		125,000 acres using a combination of prescribed fire and naturally ignited wildfire to make progress toward or maintain desired conditions.		125,000 100,000 – 175,000 acres using a combination of prescribed fire and naturally ignited wildfire to make progress toward or maintain desired conditions.
Riparian Management Zones (WSW-RMZ)	WSW-RMZ-O	1 Restore structure and function of at least 200 – 300 acres of nonfunctioning and functioning-at-risk riparian areas annually. Treatments align with priority watersheds.	Same as Alternative 2	1 Restore structure and function of at least 200 – 300 acres of nonfunctioning and functioning-at-risk riparian areas annually. Treatments align with priority watersheds.
Streams (WSW-RMZ-STM)	WSW-RMZ-STM-DC	2 Stream ecosystems, including ephemeral watercourses, are not fragmented by infrastructure or development. Streams provide connectivity important for dispersal, access to new habitats, perpetuation of genetic diversity, as well as nesting and foraging for at-risk species.	Same as Alternative 2	2 Stream ecosystems, including ephemeral watercourses, are not fragmented by infrastructure or development except when the fragmentation serves to protect native aquatic species from nonnative aquatic species. Streams provide connectivity important for dispersal, access to new habitats, perpetuation of genetic diversity, as well as nesting and foraging for at-risk species.
Seeps and Springs Standards (FW-WSW-RMZ-SNS)	(FW-WSW-RMZ-SNS-S)	FW-WSW-RMZ-SNS-Standard 1	Same as Alternative 2	2 No new spring development shall be allowed.
Wildlife, Fish, and Plants (WFP)	WFP-O	3 Reduce nonnative fish within native fish populations in 4 - 6 stream reaches, during each 10-year period following plan approval. 4 Improve wildlife or aquatic habitat connectivity by removing unneeded	Same as Alternative 2	3 Reduce nonnative fish within native fish populations in 4 – 6 stream reaches, during each 10-year period following plan approval. 4 Improve wildlife or aquatic habitat connectivity by removing unneeded

Resource Area	Plan Code	Alternative 2 Proposed Plan	Alternative 3	Alternative 4
		<p>structures (e.g., fences, roads, cattleguards, culverts, and spring developments) or completing improvement projects (e.g., removing barriers and connecting fragmented habitat) in at least 10 - 20 locations, during each 10-year period following plan approval.</p> <p>5 Complete at least 5 projects to improve habitat connectivity for aquatic and riparian species (e.g., remove barriers, restore dewatered stream segments, connect fragmented habitat, wildlife passage friendly fences, etc.), during the 10 years following plan approval.</p>		<p>structures (e.g., fences, roads, cattleguards, culverts, and spring developments) or completing improvement projects (e.g., removing barriers and connecting fragmented habitat) in at least 10 - 20 locations, during each 10-year period following plan approval.</p> <p>5 Complete at least 5 projects to improve habitat connectivity for aquatic and riparian species (e.g., remove barriers, restore dewatered stream segments, connect fragmented habitat, wildlife passage friendly fences, etc.), during the 10 years following plan approval.</p>
Timber Suitability	FW-FFP	Acres of National Forest System (NFS) lands suitable for timber production to be calculated during analysis of effects.	More acres of NFS lands suitable for timber production than Alternatives 2, 3, and 5.	Less acres of NFS lands suitable for timber production than Alternative 2 and 3.
Recreation (REC)	REC-O	FW-REC-Objectives 1 - 6	<p>1 Convert 25% of existing campsites in 5 developed campgrounds from single use sites (i.e., one family) to multiple use sites (e.g. group, RV, horse riders), during the 10 years following plan approval.</p> <p>6 Redesign existing trails or construct new trails to create 1 trail system for mountain bikes, during the 5 years following plan approval.</p>	Same as Alternative 2
REC	REC-S	FW-REC-Standards 1 - 2	Same as Alternative 2	3 Cross-country motorized over-snow use shall not be permitted.

Resource Area	Plan Code	Alternative 2 Proposed Plan	Alternative 3	Alternative 4
Transportation & Forest Access (TFA)	TFA-O	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1 Obliterate or naturalize at least 20 miles of routes not identified on the MVUMs (e.g., unauthorized, decommissioned), within the 10-year period following plan approval. 2 Grade surfaces and clean culverts and ditches on at least 100 miles of open National Forest System roads annually. 3 Maintain at least 100 – 300 miles of trails (including motorized) annually. 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1 Obliterate or naturalize at least 20 miles of routes not identified on the MVUMs (e.g., unauthorized, decommissioned), within the 10-year period following plan approval. 2 Grade surfaces and clean culverts and ditches on at least 400 150 miles of open National Forest System roads annually. 3 Maintain at least 400—300 200 – 400 miles of trails (including motorized) annually. 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1 Obliterate or naturalize at least 20 40 miles of routes not identified on the MVUMs (e.g., unauthorized, decommissioned), within the 10-year period following plan approval.
TFA	TFA-S	FW-TFA-Standards 1 - 2	Same as Alternative 2	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 3 Construction of new or temporary roads shall be accompanied by a mitigating action (e.g., decommissioning, obliteration, restoration, closure) to other roads, unauthorized routes, or trails to offset any resource damage resulting from construction. 4 Temporary roads that support ecosystem restoration activities, fuels management, or other short-term projects shall be closed and rehabilitated upon project completion.
TFA	TFA-G	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 2 Construction of new or temporary roads should be accompanied by a mitigating action (e.g., decommissioning, obliteration, restoration, closure) to other roads, unauthorized routes, or trails to offset any resource damage resulting from construction. 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 2 Construction of new or temporary roads should be accompanied by a mitigating action (e.g., decommissioning, obliteration, restoration, closure) to other roads, unauthorized routes, or trails to offset any resource damage resulting from construction. 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 2 Construction of new or temporary roads should be accompanied by a mitigating action (e.g., decommissioning, obliteration, restoration, closure) to other roads, unauthorized routes, or trails to offset any resource damage resulting from construction.

Resource Area	Plan Code	Alternative 2 Proposed Plan	Alternative 3	Alternative 4
		7 Temporary roads that support ecosystem restoration activities, fuels management, or other short-term projects should be closed and rehabilitated upon project completion, to protect watershed condition, minimize wildlife disturbance, and prevent illegal motorized use.	3 Temporary Roads that support ecosystem restoration activities, fuels management, or other short-term projects should be considered for conversion to system roads or motorized trails. closed and rehabilitated upon project completion, to protect watershed condition, minimize wildlife disturbance, and prevent illegal motorized use.	8 Temporary roads that support ecosystem restoration activities, fuels management, or other short-term projects should be closed and rehabilitated upon project completion, to protect watershed condition, minimize wildlife disturbance, and prevent illegal motorized use.
Scenery (SCEN)	SCEN-DC	2 The forest appears predominantly natural and includes cultural landscapes valued by forest users and local communities for their scenic, and traditional values.	2 The Areas of the forest appears predominantly appear natural, and includes including cultural landscapes valued by forest users and local communities for their scenic, and traditional values.	Same as Alternative 2
Wildland Fire Management (FIRE)	FIRE-G	1 Naturally ignited fires (including those occurring in designated areas) should be managed to meet multiple resource objectives when fire weather conditions facilitate progress toward desired conditions (per Desired Conditions of various resources throughout the plan).	1 Naturally ignited fires (including those occurring in designated areas) should be managed to meet multiple resource objectives when fire weather conditions facilitate progress toward desired conditions (per Desired Conditions of various resources throughout the plan), but should be suppressed in suitable timber or when they would impact trails.	Same as Alternative 2
Designated Areas				
Wilderness Standards (DA-WILD)	(DA-WILD-S)	WILD Standards 1-4	Same as Alternative 2	5 Pack goats shall not be allowed in areas where bighorn sheep occur.

Resource Area	Plan Code	Alternative 2 Proposed Plan	Alternative 3	Alternative 4
Management Areas				
Recommended Wilderness MA (RWMA)	RWMA	11,780 acres or 17% of evaluated areas	0 acres or 0% of evaluated areas	45,412 acres or 67% of evaluated areas
Grassland Maintenance MA (GMMA)	GMMA	61,824 acres identified for maintenance as grasslands through active management	Same as Alternative 2	Grassland Maintenance Management Area
Valle Vidal MA (VVMA)	MA-VVMA-S	MA-VVMA-Standards 1 - 20	Valle Vidal Management Area	<p>21 Timber harvest for the purpose of timber production is prohibited.</p> <p>22 Military ground operations are prohibited.</p> <p>23 Motorized over-snow use is prohibited.</p>
San Antonio MA (SAMA)	MA-SAMA-O	Alternative 2 has no objectives for SAMA	San Antonio Management Area	<p>1 Improve wildlife or aquatic habitat connectivity by removing unneeded structures (e.g., fences, roads, cattleguards, and culverts) or completing improvement projects (e.g., removing barriers and connecting fragmented habitat) in at least 10 to 20 locations, during each 10-year period following plan approval. This objective may be accomplished outside of the San Antonio Management Area if improvement opportunities no longer exist there.</p> <p>2 Complete at least 5 projects to improve habitat connectivity for aquatic and riparian species (e.g., remove barriers, restore dewatered</p>

Resource Area	Plan Code	Alternative 2 Proposed Plan	Alternative 3	Alternative 4
				stream segments, connect fragmented habitat, wildlife passage friendly fences, etc.), during the 10 years following plan approval.
San Antonio MA (SAMA)	MA-SAMA-S	MA-SAMA-Standards 1 - 7	San Antonio Management Area	<p>8 Except for travel on open public roads, all public entry (including hiking) is prohibited on the Tres Piedras RD portion of this MA from January 1 to March 30 and May 1 to June 30, to provide security for elk winter range and calving.</p> <p>9 Except for travel on open public roads and Cebolla Mesa Trail, all public entry (including hiking) is prohibited on the Questa RD portion of this MA from January 1 to March 30, to provide security for elk winter range.</p> <p>10 Timber harvest for the purpose of timber production is prohibited.</p> <p>11 Motorized over-snow use is prohibited.</p> <p>12 Military ground operations are prohibited.</p>
San Antonio MA (SAMA)	MA-SAMA-G	MA-SAMA-Guideline 1	San Antonio Management Area	2 Vegetation management activities should not impact more than 3% of the management area in any one year period.
Off-Highway Vehicle MA (OHVMA)	MA-OHVMA-DC	Off-Highway Vehicle Management Area	1 Cross-country travel opportunities provide challenging terrain for trials motorcycles and OHV rock crawling.	Off-Highway Vehicle Management Area

Resource Area	Plan Code	Alternative 2 Proposed Plan	Alternative 3	Alternative 4
			2 Trail and road system development is limited to preserve rugged terrain and obstacles.	
Off-Highway Vehicle MA (OHVMA)	MA-OHVMA-S	Off Highway Vehicle Management Area	1 No new improvements are allowed except for management area boundary markers, a parking area, an information kiosk, and a restroom. 2 Non-motorized recreational uses are prohibited.	Off Highway Vehicle Management Area
Wetland Jewels MA (WJMA)	MA-WJMA-DC	Wetland Jewels Management Area	Wetland Jewels Management Area	1 Priority wetland functions are aquatic invertebrate habitat, fish habitat, waterfowl and water bird habitat, groundwater recharge capacity, streamflow maintenance capacity, surface water detention capacity, and carbon sequestration capacity are maintained or improving, consistent with the wetland's potential. 2 In cases where a WJMA is smaller than a watershed, that portion of the watershed is functioning properly (according to the Watershed Condition Framework or similar current protocol) and exhibits high geomorphic, hydrologic, and biotic integrity relative to its potential condition.
Wetland Jewels MA (WJMA)	MA-WJMA-O	Wetland Jewels Management Area	Wetland Jewels Management Area	1 Restore structure and function of at least 200 - 300 acres of nonfunctioning and functioning-at-risk riparian areas annually. Over ten years, distribute these

Resource Area	Plan Code	Alternative 2 Proposed Plan	Alternative 3	Alternative 4
				<p>restoration activities among at least 6 of the WJMAs.</p> <p>2 Annually install 35 to 100 erosion control treatments, to stabilize headcuts, road drainage impacts, and other erosional features.</p> <p>3 Within the 5-year period following plan approval, identify, prioritize, and schedule implementation of mitigation and restoration actions in all WJMAs, to address wetland stressors (e.g., recreation, wildlife and livestock grazing, road drainage).</p> <p>4 Obliterate or naturalize up to 40 miles of non-system roads (e.g., unauthorized, decommissioned), within the 10-year period following plan approval. If all needed obliteration and naturalization has been accomplished in the WJMA, this objective may be met through work in other areas of the forest.</p>
Wetland Jewels MA (WJMA)	MA-WJMA-S	Wetland Jewels Management Area	Wetland Jewels Management Area	<p>1 No new permanent roads or motorized trails shall be constructed.</p> <p>2 No new communication or electronic equipment, pipelines, powerlines, fiber optic lines, or associated infrastructure may be constructed.</p> <p>3 Outstanding (existing) mineral rights shall be recognized as authorized by the United States mining laws (30 U.S.C. 21-54). Any entry to access existing mineral rights will be conducted in an environmentally</p>

Resource Area	Plan Code	Alternative 2 Proposed Plan	Alternative 3	Alternative 4
				<p>sound way through appropriate administration of mineral laws and regulations so as to minimize adverse environmental effects on National Forest System resources. Site-specific analysis shall occur to evaluate potential effects and develop appropriate mitigation measures. Operating plans and bonds shall be used if needed, to ensure protection and restoration of surface resources.</p> <p>4 Military ground operations are prohibited.</p>
Rio Grande Cutthroat Trout MA (RGCTMA)	MA-RGCTMA-DC	Rio Grande Cutthroat Trout Management Area	Rio Grande Cutthroat Trout Management Area	<p>1 Habitat conditions are capable of supporting self-sustaining native aquatic species populations and are consistent with New Mexico Department of Game and Fish's fisheries management plans.</p>
Rio Grande Cutthroat Trout MA (RGCTMA)	MA-RGCTMA-O	Rio Grande Cutthroat Trout Management Area	Rio Grande Cutthroat Trout Management Area	<p>1 Reduce nonnative fish within native fish populations in 4 - 6 stream reaches, during each 10-year period following plan approval.</p>