

## Summary of changes between Carson Preliminary Draft Proposed Plan

### Version 2 (Dec 2017) and the Draft Land Management Plan and Alternatives (May 2018)

Minor changes have been made throughout the plan to correct grammar, spelling, and formatting. There are several areas where significant and substantive updates have been made. Page numbers that follow refer to the plan, other changes can be found in the description of alternatives (Appendix B of the DEIS).

- Suitable timber acreages have been calculated and are displayed in Table 3 (p. 113) as well as in the FFP section for each alternative. Projected timber and wood harvest levels have been calculated and are displayed in Tables 4 and 5 (p. 114). Projected timber and wood harvest levels for each alternative are also shown in the FFP section for each alternative.
- The language used to describe roads and road classifications has been revised to be consistent with Forest Service terminology. New definitions have been added to the in the Transportation and Forest Access introduction (p. 122-124) and the glossary. TFA Guidelines 1, 2, and 4 have been replaced by TFA Guidelines 1, 2, 3, and 4 using this revised terminology (p 126). TFA Guideline 3 about decommissioning temporary roads has been slightly reworded and changed to a Standard (TFA-S-3) (p. 125).
- TFA-O-2 has been changed from 100 to 500 miles of road maintenance (grade surfaces and clean culverts and ditches) to align with current levels of management (p. 125). TFA-O-2 in alternative 3 was adjusted accordingly, from 150 miles to 600 miles.
- All plan components that made or would require travel management decisions have been removed or reworded, including REC-S-3 in alternative 4 (removed), VVMA-S-23 in alternative 4 (removed), SAMA-S-11 in alternative 4 (removed), and OHV-DC-1 in alternative 3 (reworded).
- The Partnership section Desired Conditions were reworded to focus direction on the Carson National Forest's role in partnerships (p. 139).
- The Eligible Wild and Scenic Rivers introduction has been updated to reflect changes made to the eligible rivers evaluation (p. 159). Table 7 has been added, listing eligible wild and scenic rivers, their classification and outstanding resource values (p. 160). The map of eligible rivers has been updated (p. A-10)
- The Outstanding National Resource Waters section has been removed, as it duplicates existing law that the Carson National Forest is required to follow. A discussion of Outstanding National Resource Waters has been added to the Watersheds and Water introduction (p. 68).
- The monitoring program has been added (Chapter 4, beginning on page 177).
- A map of desired recreation opportunity spectrum has been added to Appendix A (p. A-2).
- A map of utility corridors and communication sites was added to Appendix A (p.
- Acreage errors in the wilderness evaluation were corrected (resulting in an overall increase of 55 acres). An additional criteria was added for the selection of areas with wilderness characteristics for alternative 2. Areas included as RWMAs in alternative 2 fit the theme of the alternative and their boundaries were adjusted to make them more easily identifiable based on existing natural features, locatable human-made features, or existing surveyed lines (see the updated Recommended Wilderness Management Area map, page A-9). The RWMA acreage dropped from 11,780 to 9,189 in alternative 2.
- VVMA-S-24 was added to alternative 4, prohibiting construction of motorized trails in VVMA.
- DEVRES MA was expanded under alternative 3.

## Changes

**All changes to the plan and alternatives, including those mentioned above (shown here in bold and preceded by an asterisk \*) are listed below.**

Clarified that all Vegetation seral state proportions are applicable at the landscape scale.

Added a Desired Condition about visual and ecological integrity across land ownership (VEG-DC-13)

Added a similarity to site potential Desired Condition (VEG-DC-15) (replaces old VEG-DC-21)

Removed old VEG-DC-15: *Ecological conditions, as described in these desired conditions, provide suitable habitat for at-risk species.* [This language duplicated VEG-DC-21 for rare and endemic species, at-risk species were added to VEG-DC-21.]

Added Guideline about consistency with Conservation Agreements (VEG-DC-2)

Spruce Fir patch and tree density Desired Conditions were moved from landscape scale to midscale (SFF-DC-8, 9)

MCW snag Desired Condition was moved from the midscale to the landscape scale (MCW-DC-5)

MCD snag and downed log Desired Conditions were moved from landscape to midscale (MCD-DC-11)

Added openness language to MCD-DC-8

PPF snags Desired Condition moved from landscape to midscale (PPF-DC-10)

Added even aged language to PPF-DC-8

Removed old VEG-PJO-G-2 and old VEG-PJS-G-6 that restricted fuelwood in areas that produce piñon seeds: *In areas that produce pinon seeds, the harvesting of pinon producing trees for fuelwood or other forest products should be restricted (e.g., allow dead and down, not green; diameter restrictions) to reduce impacts to at-risk species.*

Removed old VEG-PJO-G-5 and old VEG-PJS-G-3 that required leaving slash piles for several years: *Slash piles should be retained across the landscape for several years, to increase small mammal occupancy in areas where coarse woody debris is deficient and provide nesting habitat and cover for turkeys, birds, small mammals, reptiles, and invertebrates.*

Moved (mid-scale to fine scale) and revised patch size Desired Condition in PJS (VEG-PJS-DC-13)

Added snag and woody debris Desired Condition in PJS (VEG-PJS-DC-9)

Removed old VEG-PJS-G-2 about managing PJS on created grasslands: *On non-grassland soils in PJS, seral grasslands created by previous vegetation treatments should be managed toward restoration of PJS desired conditions unless they are in a Grassland Maintenance Management Area (GMMA).*

Added VEG-PJS-G-4 about key habitat features

Added a heading under Watersheds and Water introduction about ONRWs

Added WSW-DC-7 about meeting state water quality standards

WSW-G-2: changed “reconstructed” to “rerouted”

Added WSW-RMZ-DC-6 about habitat components

WSW-RMZ-STM-DC-2: added exception for protection of native species

Moved WSW-RMZ-STM-G-5 to WSW-RMZ-STM-S-2

Moved WSW-RMZ-WB-G-1 to WSW-RMZ-WB-S-2

WSW-RMZ-SNS-O-1 clarified that this objective refers to spring function

WSW-RMZ-FSR-DC-5 added statement about habitat for riparian species

Removed CAM-S-1: *Abandoned mine underground workings shall not be entered unless certified as a Qualified Certified Mineral Examiner (QCME) or accompanied by a QCME.* [Duplicates law]

CRF-G-3 reworded to change “permit” to “prior written authorization” and “impacts” to “demonstrated impacts that have been communicated to the public”.

Clarified that WFP-O-1 may be done in conjunction with vegetation objectives

Added WFP-management approach-9 about converting sheep allotments

Changed NIS-S-3 from “core range” to “occupied habitat”

Added preventive measures language to NIS-G-6

Added AIR-DC-3 about visibility in designated wilderness

Added to the Federal authorities list under the Federally Recognized Tribes introduction

Clarified that FRT-DC-6 applies to recognition and valuing identified locations

Added “as allowed by law” to FRT-S-1

Moved the requirement to incorporate perspectives and knowledge from FRT-G-2 to FRT-management approach-3

Removed statement about outdoor recreation from Rural Historic Communities introduction: *Some rural historic communities have evolved to accommodate tourism and the increasing demand for outdoor recreation as an element of their identity, but most rural historic communities and families continue to look to the forest for economic opportunity and vitality through traditional uses.*

Changed RHC-G-4 to inform “interested and affected” governing bodies

Replaced RHC-management approach-5: *Consider FS employees working with traditional communities to understand their needs and build respectful, collaborative relationships, in order to achieve desired conditions.* with RHC-management approach-3 about incorporating perspectives and knowledge

CR-DC-1 changed “are stable” to “preserved and protected”, added language about site integrity and stability.

Changed CD-DC-4 from “the public” to “traditional communities”

Removed CR-O-1: *Obtain at least 45 points annually for Heritage Program Managed to Standard (HPMTs) to ensure annual Heritage Program targets are met.* [duplicates policy]

Added CR-management approach-6 about interpretation

Removed GRZ-O-1 about annual operating instructions: *Through annual operating instructions (AOI), evaluate allotment management every year with permit holders for consistency with timing, intensity, and frequency of livestock grazing, to respond to changing ecological resources and the needs of grazing permit holders.* [Not appropriate as an objective because it is not quantifiable, also duplicates policy and is reiterated by GRZ-management approaches-1, 2, and 4]

Changed GRZ-O-1 from 60-120 over the life of the plan to 6-10 annually

Replaced “disease free domestic sheep” with “scientifically supported strategies” and changed “prevent” to “mitigate” in GRZ-S-4

Clarified GRZ-management approach-6 about nonuse

Removed old GRZ-management area-7 about fence pass throughs: *Where an allotment fence intersects a designated trail, consider a pass-through section (e.g., walk-through gate, self-closing gate) to provide access for recreation users, unless it interferes with range management and resource protection.* [Was misinterpreted as creating an option to block trail access with fences]

Clarified the shifting focus of the forestry program in the FFP introduction

**\*Added values for suitable timber in Table 3**

**\*Added projected timber and wood harvest levels section**

FFP-DC-4: changed “achieves” to “moves toward”

FFP-DC-7: changed “is collected and stored” to “is available”

FFP-G-1: removed the exception for wildland urban interface [was not consistent with National Forest Management Act]

Removed old, duplicated FFP-management approach-6: *Consider making fuelwood within a project area more available to the public, such as providing some decked woody material along roads or allowing collection within utility or road corridors that are being thinned.*

Deleted from REC-DC-10: “Changes in recreational use are consistent within the recreation setting.”

Removed old REC-O-5: *Reduce the backlog of needed maintenance (i.e., deferred maintenance) at developed recreation areas by 50 – 60% from baseline levels, during the 10-year period following plan approval.* [Not necessarily compatible with REC-DC-3 and 5 or within the Carson’s ability to control]

REC-S-1: changed “routes” to roads, trails, or areas for public, administrative, or permitted use

REC-S-2: changed “routes” to “roads, trails, or areas” for “public, administrative, or permitted use”. Changed “ROS” to “desired recreation opportunity spectrum”. Changed “rehabilitated” to “decommissioned”

REC-G-1: changed “prevent” to “minimize”. Added at-risk species.

REC-G-2: changed ROS to desired recreation opportunity spectrum

REC-G-3: changed “prevent” to “minimize”

## Clarification

**\*Added clarification of the Carson transportation system, maintenance levels, temporary roads, and unauthorized roads in the Transportation and Forest Access introduction**

TFA-DC-5 clarified that unauthorized roads should be determined for their purpose and that unneeded roads should be decommissioned

TFA-O-1 replaced “not identified on the MVUMs” with “unneeded”

**\*TFA-0-2 changed 100 miles to 500 miles**

Converted old TFA-G-3 to TFA-S-3

**\*Deleted old TFA-G-1, 2, 4:**

***\*Reconstruction and rehabilitation of existing roads should be emphasized over new road construction, to minimize impacts on ecological and cultural resources.***

***\*Construction of new or temporary roads should be accompanied by a mitigating action (e.g., decommissioning, obliteration, restoration, closure) to other roads, unauthorized routes, or trails to offset any resource damage resulting from construction.***

***\*After management activities are completed in areas with high potential for unauthorized motor vehicle use, methods (e.g., barriers, signs, law enforcement) should be used, to prevent unauthorized motor vehicle use.***

**\*Replaced with TFA-G-1, 2, 3, 4:**

***\*Unauthorized and maintenance level 1 roads within a project area should be evaluated for use (e.g., temporary, administrative use, placed in storage) prior to any new road construction, to minimize negative impacts to ecological and cultural resources.***

***\*Construction of new system roads should be accompanied by a mitigating action (e.g., decommissioning) of other unneeded roads, and trails to offset any resource damage resulting from their construction.***

***\*All system roads not open to the public and unauthorized roads within an ecosystem restoration project area should be evaluated for need (e.g., administrative use, placed in storage, open to the public) or determined to be unneeded (available for decommissioning) to reduce the amount of system roads that need to be maintained.***

***\*Unauthorized roads and maintenance level 1 roads should be evaluated based on transportation system need, long term effects to adjacent resources, and capacity to maintain additional system roads in order to identify roads eligible for decommissioning.***

TFA-G-6: added “known” at-risk species

FAC-DC-2: reworded to provide examples and include water efficiency

FAC-DC-2: “prevent or mitigate” changed to “minimize”

Added a description of the scenery management system to the Scenery introduction

Added SCEN-DC-2 about connected natural landscapes

Added SCEN-DC-3 about scenic values and sense of place

Added SCEN-DC-4 about opportunities to experience scenic elements

Moved old SCEN-DC-2 to SCEN-DC-5 and reworded to say human activities do not dominate

Removed old SCEN-DC-5: *Scenery is enhanced or maintained to have resilience to changing conditions, while supporting ecological, social, and economic sustainability on the forest and surrounding landscapes.*

SCEN-G-1: changed “closely following” “desired scenic character” to “compliment the natural setting”

Added SCEN-G-4

SU-DC-2: changed do not conflict to “conflicts are minimized”

SU-S-2: changed “ranges” to “occupied habitat”

Added SU-management approach-2

Moved LAND-DC-4 to VEG-DC-13

Added LAND-DC-4

Added LAND-management approach-3

Removed old FIRE-G-2: *Response to unplanned ignitions that cross jurisdictional boundaries should be coordinated and managed to meet the responsible agency’s objectives.* [duplicates policy]

Added to FIRE-management approach-6: “the ability to manage future fires or protect values at risk”

MM-DC-2: removed “as nearly as possible”

Removed old MM-S-1: *Plans of operation shall be required for all locatable and leasable mineral requests.*

Removed old MM-S-2: *Plans of operation will include contingencies to address stabilization and interim reclamation of mineral sites during periods of unforeseen shutdown according to 36 CFR 228.10. This applies to any time of mine cessation during development and production and before planned closure.* [duplicates policy]

Removed old MM-S-3: *Site-specific reclamation plans shall be prepared as part of all plans of operation. These plans must be applicable for the setting (e.g., soils, vegetation, climate, or slope).*

**\*PART-DC-1 added**

**\*PART-DC-1 moved to PART-DC-3 and reworded**

**\*PART-DC-2 reworded**

**\*Old PART-DC-3 removed: *The Carson NF has a network of dependable partners and volunteers who provide additional capacity to effectively and efficiently meet plan desired conditions, deliver information and services to the public, and provide expertise and capacity to undertake monitoring activities beyond the ability of the Carson NF to achieve on its own. The forest and partners have an expressed mutual interest in, benefit from, and understanding of a common purpose that achieves their respective missions. Partnerships and/or collaborative processes help accomplish projects in the shared interest.***

Old PART-DC-4 removed: *Partnership arrangements are transparent to the public and free from real or apparent conflicts of interest or the endorsement of commercial products, services, or entities.*

Added PART-management approach-1

WILD-S-1: “livestock” changed to “pack stock”

Added WILD-S-1 restricting pack goats

Added to WILD-G-3 regarding authorization of prohibited uses

Removed the sentence related to the Rio Grande Wild and Scenic River, *The Red River section is within BLM’s Wild Rivers Recreation Area* from the WSR introduction

Added WSR-S-4 restricting pack goats

Added a sentence about limitations on road construction and cutting of timber to the IRA introduction

Removed sensitive species from the list of timber removal purposes that are reviewed by the Regional Forester

Added “provide public drinking water” to IRA-DC-1

Changed citation of the roadless rule from 36 CFR 294 to 66 FR 3244

Removed IRA-G-1: *Management activities in an IRA should maintain or improve its Inventoried roadless characteristics.* [Inconsistent with policy (roadless rule direction)]

Added NTRL-S-2 about motorized use on the Continental Divide Trail

Added NTRL-G-5 about special uses in the Continental Divide Trail viewshed

Clarified in NTRL-G-11 that existing motorized uses may continue on national recreation trails

NSBW-DC-2: “intrinsic qualities identified” changed to “values for which a national scenic byway is designated”

Corrected the acreage for the Jarita Mesa Wild Horse Territory in the WHT introduction

BOT-G-1: Changed “permit” to “authorization”

Clarified that RWMAs are managed according to plan direction until designated or released (RWMA introduction)

Reworded RWMA-DC-5 about sustainable rangelands

Removed “public health and safety and recreational opportunities” from RWMA-G-3

**\*Updated the EWSR introduction based on changes to the eligibility evaluation**

**\*Added Table 7 showing eligible rivers**

EWSR-DC-2: changed “immediate environs” to “corridors”

EWSR-G-1 removed “generally”

**\*Removed the ONRW section** [duplicates law, ONRW discussion was added to WSW section]

Removed old DEVRES-DC-2: *Forest conditions within DEVRES are conducive to achieving the desired recreational settings and experiences and contribute to the enjoyment of recreationists.*

Removed old DEVRES-S-1: *Any road/trail system within DEVRES shall be developed and maintained by the permittee. Only permitted motor-vehicle use within this management area is allowed.*

GMMA-DC-1: changed “is maintained mechanically, chemically, or with fire” to “remains”

VVMA-DC-3: removed “are consistent with NMDGF fisheries management plans”

Changed VVMA-S-3 to reference “most updated over-snow vehicle use map”

Clarified that VVMA-S-6 applies to areas outside of campgrounds

Clarified that VVMA-S-7 applies to Cimarron and McCrystal campgrounds only

Clarified that VVMA-S-10 applies to Cimarron and McCrystal campgrounds only

Clarified that VVMA-S-15 refers to private for-profit commercial facilities

VVMA-S-18: added “subject to valid existing rights”

VVMA-S-19 reworded

VVMA-G-1 “must” changed to “should”

VVMA-management approach-2 added

**\*Added Chapter 4. Plan Monitoring Program**

**In Appendix A:**

**\*Added the Desired Recreation Opportunity Spectrum map**

**\*Adjusted the Recommended Wilderness Management Area map**

**\*Adjusted Eligible Wild and Scenic Rivers map based on WSR evaluation**

All maps were updated to include the Miranda Canyon area

## **Changes to alternatives:**

WSW-RMZ-STM-DC-2 versions were switched between alternative 2 and alternative 4. Alternatives 2, 3 and 5 now include the language “except when fragmentation serves to protect native aquatic species from nonnative aquatic species” and alternative 4 does not.

Adjusted GRZ-S-4 under alternative 4: *Domestic sheep grazing allotments shall not be authorized within bighorn sheep occupied habitat to mitigate the potential transfer of disease from domestic sheep to bighorn sheep.*

**\*Calculated suitable timber acres under each alternative**

**\*Calculated projected timber and wood harvest levels for each alternative**

**\*Removed all plan components that made or required travel management decisions, including:**

**\*Deleted old REC-S-3 from alternative 3: *Motorized over-snow use shall only occur on designated trails. Cross-country motorized over-snow use is prohibited.***

**\*Changed TFA-O-2 from 100 miles to 500 miles (and from 150 miles to 650 miles under alternative 3) to better reflect the amount of maintenance currently occurring.**

**\*TFA-S-3 replaces the old TFA-G-3 and was slightly reworded using updated terminology, “closed and rehabilitated” was changed to “decommissioned”. In alternative 3, this standard was moved to TFA-G-11. In alternative 4, “decommissioned” is replaced with “obliterated or naturalized”**

**\*TFA-G-2 (TFA-S-2 in alternative 4) was reworded slightly to reflect updated road terminology, “other roads, unauthorized routes, or trails” was replaced with “unneeded roads and trails”**

SCEN-DC-5 was reworded slightly using the language “human activities do not dominate the landscape.”

FIRE-G-3 in alternative 3 was clarified to refer to impacts to “trail access”

**\*Wilderness acreages were updated slightly in alternatives 4 and 5 to reflect mapping corrections in the evaluation**

**\*Areas evaluated as having wilderness characteristics included as RWMAs in alternative 2 were adjusted in order to make boundaries more easily identifiable based on existing natural features, locatable human-made features, or existing surveyed lines.**

Added DEVRES-S-1 to Alternative 3

Added DEVRES-S-2 to Alternative 3

Added DEVRES-G-4 to alternative 3

Added DEVRES-G-5 to alternative 3

**\*Enlarged the Sipapu DEVRES MA in alternative 3 by 921 acres.**

**\*Deleted VVMA-S-23 from alternative 4: *Motorized over-snow use is prohibited.***

**\*Added VVMA-S-24 to alternative 4: Construction of motorized trails is prohibited.**

SAMA-O-1 in alternative 4: removed the second sentence about reaching the objective elsewhere if improvement opportunities no longer exist.

**\*Removed SAMA-S-11 from alternative 4: *Motorized over-snow use is prohibited.***

**\*Reworded OHV-DC-1 in alternative 3 to remove reference to cross country travel**

Clarified that OHVMA-S-1 in alternative 3 refers to “no new structural improvements”

Reworded OHVMA-S-2: *Any trail construction must be for motorized use. Multi-purpose trails shall not be constructed.*

WJMA-DC-1 in alternative 4 reworded slightly to replace “maintained and improving” with “provide”

WJMA-O-3 in alternative 4 reworded

WJMA-G-1 changed “priority functions” to “wetland function”

RGCTMA-DC-1 removed language about consistency with NMDGF management plans