

Summary of Changes from August 2018 to August 2019: Cibola Draft Land Management Plan and Draft Environmental Impact Statement

In response to input received from cooperating agencies, Region 3 Regional Office plan revision team review, and further internal analysis at the Cibola, the following substantive changes were made to the Cibola Draft Land Management Plan (LMP) and associated Draft Environmental Impact Statement (DEIS) between the August 2018 versions of the Draft LMP and the DEIS and the August 2019 formal draft publications:

Alternative C – Proposed Action (Cibola Draft LMP)

- **Restoration Management Areas:** Increased Restoration Management Area acreage from 266,290 acres to **318,148 acres** across all 4 districts. These increases aligned the proposed Restoration Management areas with planned and proposed treatment areas. This resulted in the following total acreage:
 - Mount Taylor District: Mount Taylor 3,132 acres, Zuni 176,941 acres
 - Magdalena District: San Mateo 57,840 acres
 - Mountainair District: Manzano 40,087 acres, Gallinas 4,388 acres
 - Sandia District: 35,760 acres
- **Conservation Management Areas:** Decreased Conservation Management Area acreage from 174,619 acres to **36,547 acres**. This allowed the proposed Conservation Management Areas to focus on large areas not contiguous to existing designated wilderness that have high value for primitive recreation. Conservation Management Areas are now limited to three areas: San Mateo (11,380 acres) and Datil (10,179 acres) on the Magdalena district and Guadalupe (14,988 acres) on the Mount Taylor district.
- **Place based Management Areas:** Removed 11 place based management areas proposed in alternative C; kept 10 of the areas in alternative B (removed the Enchanted Towers management area as did not meet original intent of proposal). These proposed management area descriptions can be found online at the [Cibola plan revision website](#) and in the administrative record under management areas. The 10 management areas are analyzed in the DEIS under alternative B. This change allows for the needed expansion of restoration management areas consistent with the theme of Alternative C.
- **Recommended Wilderness Areas:** Modified the recommended wilderness criteria to only include areas with high wilderness characteristics that are contiguous to existing congressionally designated wilderness without non-conforming uses for managing as recommended wilderness. This modified criteria resulted in an increase in recommended wilderness areas from 4,131 acres to **24,265 acres** under Alternative C. This resulted in the following total acreage:
 - Mountainair District: Manzano Wilderness Expansion 2 (364 acres), 3 (353 acres), 4 (357 acres), and 5 (246 acres)
 - Magdalena District: Apache Kid Wilderness Expansion 1 (11,328 acres), 2 (5,497 acres), 3 (2,595 acres), and 5 (3,525 acres)

Alternative A – No Action (1985 Plan)

- The eligibility study for Wild and Scenic Rivers conducted in 2015 under plan revision of the 1985 plan replaces the previous 2001 eligibility study, with the resulting eligible river segments being applied to alternative A as well.

Alternative B – Place Based Management Areas

- **Place based Management Areas:** Removed the Enchanted Towers Management Area from the Magdalena District as it does not meet the original intent for the area from the proponents. Ten place based management areas are analyzed in the current DEIS.

- Recommended Wilderness Areas: Recommend additional areas on the western Manzano unit on the Mountainair District including Manzano Wilderness Expansion 2 (364 acres), 3 (353 acres), 4 (357 acres), and 5 (246 acres).

Alternative D – Backcountry Uses

- Removed Conservation Management Areas under alternative D (only proposed in alternative C).

Objectives that were adjusted for the action alternatives are reflected in the alternative comparison table 1 in Chapter 2 of the DEIS (infrastructure, dispersed recreation, and fire and fuels). Objectives that were deleted due to not being achievable within the life of the plan, not in accordance with the 2012 planning rule, or would not differ by alternative include the following:

- Integrate project design or protection measures in a project or management activity annually that benefits forest resources and traditional use areas identified as important to rural historic communities (does not differ by alternative)
- Reduce the deferred maintenance on historic structures annually (not achievable within the life of the plan)
- Issue temporary closure order annually to tribes for traditional and ceremonial activities, based on tribal requests (does not differ by alternative)
- Integrate project design or protection measures in project or management activity annually that benefits traditional cultural properties, sacred sites, or other identified locations of traditional and cultural uses important to tribes (does not differ by alternative)
- Administer or issue free-use permits or authorization letters annually to accommodate and facilitate tribal harvesting of forest resources important for cultural and traditional uses and practices (does not differ by alternative)
- Annually, accomplish management activities to enhance scenic resources (does not differ by alternative)
- Address high risk and necessary conditions for facilities (for example, accessibility needs, safety hazards, environmental compliance, water systems, etc.) annually (does not differ by alternative)
- Collaborate with partnerships annually on developing or implementing projects or activities to move rangelands towards desired conditions (does not differ by alternative)
- Provide outreach efforts or opportunities to collaborators, partners, and volunteers to co-develop, co-implement, or both a mix of developed and dispersed recreation projects and activities annually (does not differ by alternative)
- Reduce the developed recreation deferred maintenance backlog at plan approval (not achievable within the life of the plan)
- The Continental Divide National Scenic Trail route will be relocated to occur off of roads in the life of the plan, to be consistent with the most current comprehensive management plan. The trail will be located as close to the geographic Continental Divide as possible (does not differ by alternative and not in accordance with the 2012 planning rule)

Changes made to plan components in the Draft LMP that are applicable to all action alternatives B, C, and D are noted as follows. The exception to the applicability of the plan components are objectives that vary by alternatives; the Cibola Draft LMP only reflects objectives for the proposed action, alternative C.

General Changes:

- Throughout the document there are changes in wordage in order to make plan components fit the intensions or requirements (per 2012 Planning Rule) for that desired plan component.
- Throughout the plan sections have been restructured as well as titles have change.
 - List of Commonly Used Acronyms moved.
 - Summary of Needs for Change now Need for Changing the 1985 Forest Plan
 - Core themes now in Introduction (was in Chapter 2 background)
 - Use of the Plan to Develop Management Activities now titled Project Consistency with the Forest Plan
- Throughout the Plan sections and tables were edited and formatted to be 508 compliant
- All tables and figures in the Plan have been re-numbered

Chapter 1-Introduction Changes:

- Description of Plan Area has been restructured and reworded
- Deletion of a Core Theme, Managing Risk
- Distinct Characteristics of each district has been reworded, restructured and edited
- Forest Plan coding has been updated to reflect new sections and to be 508 compliant
- Added new sections: Transition in the Implementation of the Forest Plan and Plan Monitoring and Evaluation and Best Available Scientific Information
- Vision statements by district can now be found in the DEIS: Appendix A, Public Engagement

Chapter 2- Forest-wide Direction Changes:

Vegetation:

- Updates and adjustments to be consistent with the Region 3 vegetation desired conditions
- Mixed Conifer now Wet Conifer; Dry Mixed Conifer now Mixed Conifer-Frequent Fire
- Added the title Pinyon-Juniper Grass and Juniper Grass
- Moved Table on Seral Stage for Pinyon- Juniper Evergreen Shrub Woodland (PJC) after Mid-Scale Desired Conditions
- Background on Riparian Vegetation Types now in Watershed Resources Section
- Deletions in this section: guideline within all vegetation types about mechanized tree harvest; two desired conditions within Pinyon- Juniper Grass, Landscape scale about the seral stage

Water Resources:

- Added Table on Priority watersheds (Table 22)
- Rewording of guidelines and management approaches to stay compliant with 2012 planning rule on planning components

Species:

- Added information into Species Introduction paragraph
- Moved a guideline to management approach

- New guideline under Terrestrial Species and Habitats
- Re-wording of introduction for Nonnative and Invasive Species
- Re-organization of plan components

Air:

- Deletion of desired condition about the expectations of air quality for visitors

Fire and Fuels:

- Fire and Fuel Objectives have been updated/changed

Sustainable Rangelands and Livestock:

- Deletion of desired condition about Range infrastructure functions to maintain or improve livestock grazing management and the condition of forest ecological and cultural resources

Federally Recognized Tribes:

- Addition of a new management approach

Rural Historic Communities:

- Editing on history for Rural Historic Communities

Cultural and Historic Resources:

- New standard

Land Ownership Adjustment and Boundary Management:

- Re-worded the Introduction/ Background
- New bullet point under guideline five

Minerals and Geology:

- Moved management approaches to desired conditions in Locatable Minerals
- Added a guideline in Salable Minerals.
- Deletion of desired condition in Salable Minerals
- Deletion of a standard in Salable Minerals that read, “Personal and commercial mineral material sites are administered according to 36 CFR 228 part C, Mineral Materials”
- Moved management approaches to be standards in Salable Minerals
- Deletion of an introduction paragraph on caves
- Moved two standards into desired conditions

Recreation:

- General recreation and developed recreation objectives deleted (see above rationale on objectives)

- Addition to bullet list under guideline six under dispersed recreation
- Deletions: management approach nine under developed recreation about fees helping maintain facilities and management approach two under dispersed recreation about preparing trail management objectives in national forest system

Scenic Resources:

- Addition to background in Scenic Resources
- Scenic objective deleted (see above rationale on objectives)

Special Uses:

- Change from 24 acts to several acts in special uses background
- Deletions in section: desired condition about, “Special uses are authorized in accordance with maintaining sustainability of national forest resources and multiple uses” and desired condition about, “Permitted outfitter and guide activities do not conflict with the experiences of other national forest visitors.” And standard about, “Special uses authorizations are administered to agency standards, and minimize conflicts with other national forest uses and resources.”

Chapter 3- Management Areas and Designated Areas Changes:

Management Areas:

- Description on place based Management Areas for each ranger district has been removed from Alternative C (Draft Plan) to Alternative B (See Chapter 2 of the Cibola DEIS and on website)
- Recommended Wilderness Areas section is no longer under Designated Areas, it is under Management Areas as they are not yet designated by Congress
- Eligible Wild and Scenic Rivers section is no longer under Designated Areas, it is under Management Areas as they are not yet designated by Congress
- Recommended Wilderness Area standard FW-STD-RECW-2 edited to include the following underlined language:
 - Commercial timber harvest is prohibited in recommended wilderness management areas.
 - Motorized travel and uses shall not be allowed with the following exceptions: unless specifically authorized for emergency use, for the limited needs required for management of a grazing allotment, and where they will not result in long-term degradation to wilderness characteristics to maximize future management flexibility.
- Recommended Wilderness Area guideline FW-GDL-RECW-2 edited to include the following underlined language:
 - Mechanical transport and motorized equipment for management activities (e.g., chainsaws, wheelbarrows) should be allowed in recommended wilderness areas if they preserve or enhance wilderness characteristics of the area.
- Deletions from this section are: standards on fire functionality under recommended wilderness areas, desired condition on planned and unplanned ignition under Conservation Management Area

Designated Areas:

- Added information in the following: Designated Areas background, Scenic byways background, Continental Divide National Scenic Trail, and T'uf Shur Bien Preservation Trust Area
- Added a new section on Significant Caves under Designated Areas
- Moved Langmuir Research Site and Magdalena Ridge Observatory, T'uf Shur Bien Preservation Trust Area to new section, Congressionally Designated Areas
- Kirtland Air Force Base/Withdrawal Areas changed to Withdrawal Area section. Made standards under Withdrawal Area management approaches as these withdrawal areas are managed by the Kirtland Air Force Base under withdrawal for military purposes through the Department of Defense.
- Deletion of two Scenic Byways from description Abo Pass and Sandia Crest as they are under State jurisdiction
- Deletion from this section are: guideline under Inventoried Roadless Areas, management approach in scenic byways about working with NMDOT, Continental Divide National Scenic Trail objective (see above rationale under objectives), and desired conditions and standards in T'uf Shur Bien Preservation Trust Area

Chapter 4- Suitability of Lands Changes:

- Timber Suitability modeling was updated to reflect treatment updates and Management Area updates for alternative C (Draft Plan)

Chapter 5- Monitoring and Evaluation Changes:

- Deletion of Aquatic Macroinvertebrates under focal species including monitoring questions
- Added Monitoring questions in table on Hermit thrush as a focal species
- Changed the monitoring question in the table for Climate Change
- Changed Productivity of Land monitoring questions in the table
- Added a new monitoring question for Social and Economic section of the table

Appendix Changes:

- Appendix A was changed to reflect updates made to management approaches by resource area throughout the Draft Plan. Revised objectives were also reflected in this appendix.
- No longer have maps as an Appendix; refer to Map packet included with hard copies and electronic versions of the maps available on the Cibola plan revision website:
<http://www.fs.usda.gov/goto/CibolaForestPlanRevision>