

1 JEAN E. WILLIAMS,  
2 Deputy Assistant Attorney General  
3 SETH M. BARSKY, Chief  
4 S. JAY GOVINDAN, Assistant Chief  
5 RICKEY D. TURNER, Senior Trial Attorney  
6 U.S. Department of Justice  
7 Environment and Natural Resources Division  
8 Wildlife and Marine Resources Section  
9 999 18<sup>th</sup> Street  
10 South Terrace, Suite 370  
11 Denver, Colorado 80202  
12 (303) 844-1373  
13 rickey.turner@usdoj.gov

14 Attorneys for Defendants

11 **UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**  
12 **FOR THE DISTRICT OF ARIZONA**

14 WILDEARTH GUARDIANS,

15 Plaintiff,

16 v.

17 UNITED STATES FISH AND  
18 WILDLIFE SERVICE and UNITED  
19 STATES FOREST SERVICE,

20 Defendants.

CASE NO. 4:13-cv-151-RCC

**DEFENDANTS' REPLY IN SUPPORT OF  
THE MOTION TO DISSOLVE THE  
COURT'S INJUNCTION RE THE GILA,  
LINCOLN, CARSON, SANTA FE, TONTO  
NATIONAL FORESTS**

**[EXPEDITED REVIEW REQUESTED]**

21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

1 Defendants' motion to dissolve sought only to demonstrate Defendants'  
2 compliance with the two actions ordered by this Court – (1) completing reinitiated  
3 Section 7 consultation under the Endangered Species Act and (2) issuing a superseding  
4 biological opinion (“BiOp”). *See* ECF No. 89 at 36-39. In that motion, Defendants  
5 demonstrated that the agencies completed both actions ordered by the Court and argued  
6 the injunction enjoining all timber management actions on the forests at issue should, by  
7 its terms, be dissolved. All explanation and argument supporting the new BiOps are  
8 found in past briefing (and supporting declarations) and won't be repeated here. *See* ECF  
9 Nos. 104, 111, 112, 122.

10  
11 Dated: January 15, 2020

Respectfully Submitted,

12 JEAN E. WILLIAMS,  
13 Deputy Assistant Attorney General  
14 SETH M. BARSKY, Section Chief  
15 S. JAY GOVINDAN,  
Assistant Section Chief

16 /s/ Rickey D. Turner, Jr.  
17 RICKEY D. TURNER, JR.  
18 Senior Attorney  
19 U.S. Department of Justice  
20 Env't & Natural Resources Division  
21 Wildlife & Marine Resources Section  
22 999 18th Street  
South Terrace, Suite 370  
Denver, CO 80202  
Telephone: (303) 844-1373

23 *Attorneys for Defendants*  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE DISTRICT OF ARIZONA**

WILDEARTH GUARDIANS,

Plaintiff,

v.

UNITED STATES FISH AND  
WILDLIFE SERVICE and UNITED  
STATES FOREST SERVICE,

Defendants.

CASE NO. 4:13-cv-151-RCC

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that I electronically filed the foregoing with the Clerk of the Court using the CM/ECF system, which will send notification of such to the attorneys of record.

/s/ Rickey D. Turner, Jr.  
RICKEY D. TURNER, JR.