

Chapter 2. Alternatives, Including the Proposed Action

Introduction

The interdisciplinary team used the significant issues listed in chapter 1 to develop alternatives to the proposed action, as modified. Summarized briefly, the four significant issues are: amount and type of motorized access, motorized access for retrieving big game, motorized access for dispersed camping, and motorized areas. The alternatives approach the purpose and need—to provide for a designated system of roads, trails, and areas—differently. The alternatives respond to these significant issues.

In addition to the issues raised during the scoping period, the public provided an alternative for the forest staff to consider. The alternative provided was for only one district and reflected no change to the current motorized system, as displayed in alternative B. The action alternatives presented in the draft environmental impact statement incorporated elements of the proposal as well as other comments made by the public. The interdisciplinary team also used information from other agencies to develop and refine the alternatives.

Some people requested that the alternatives provide loops and/or trail systems for both single-track and ATV riding. Some of the alternatives incorporate aspects of this request, however, the purpose of this travel management plan is to designate a system of roads, trails, and areas open for motorized use, not to develop a comprehensive off-highway vehicle plan for ATV and single-track recreational experiences. An effort could be considered in the future, with appropriate NEPA analysis that would consider a plan for those specific types of activities.

No alternative curtails any nonmotorized activities; the change is where people can drive to get to places in the forest to do these activities. System roads and motorized trails would also be open for people to walk, hike, bike, or ride horses.

Development of the Alternatives

The interdisciplinary team developed alternatives to the proposed action to address the significant issues identified from public comments. The range of alternatives includes the modified proposed action (alternative F), no action (alternative B), all action alternatives, and alternatives considered but eliminated from detailed study. A decision can be made anywhere within the range.

Alternatives Considered in Detail

Alternative B – No Action

The no action alternative is required by 40 CFR 1502.14(d). No changes to the motorized system would occur and cross-country travel would continue to be permitted. This alternative would not meet the requirements of the Travel Management Rule to prohibit motor vehicle use off the designated system; however, it provides a baseline for comparison of effects of the alternatives. In this alternative the Gila National Forest would:

- remain open to cross-country motorized travel (except in off-road vehicle restricted areas such as wilderness and research natural areas);
- continue to keep 4,613 miles of roads and 16 miles of motorized trails (less than 50 inches wide) open to motorized vehicles and uses;

- continue to keep 3 miles of roads open seasonally from approximately April 1 to September 1 (table 5, p. 25);
- continue to allow motorized dispersed camping throughout the forest (except in off-road vehicle restricted areas such as wilderness and research natural areas (table 9 and table 11, p. 27);
- continue to allow motorized big game retrieval throughout the forest, (except in off-road vehicle restricted areas such as wilderness and research natural areas (table 10 and table 11, p. 27); and
- not amend the forest plan to prohibit motorized cross-country travel or to be made consistent with the Travel Management Rule.

Features Common to Two or More Alternatives

In alternatives that propose converting roads to motorized trails, reopening roads, changing roads from open to all vehicles to open to highway-legal vehicles only, designating motorized dispersed camping corridors, or providing for motorized big game retrieval, the following definitions and methods would apply:

Converting roads to motorized trails (Common to all action alternatives): The conversion of roads to motorized trails would entail such things as signing or restricting access based on vehicle type.

Reopening roads (Common to all action alternatives): Reopening of roads includes both maintenance level 1 closed roads and decommissioned roads. Due to the forest being open to cross-country motorized travel, unauthorized motorized use has led to their continuous use. Most do not need any work to allow passage except for NFS Road 3050 (0.2 mile) where existing berms would need to be removed or reworked to allow passage and maintain drainage features. If this segment of road is designated as open to motor vehicle use, additional NEPA would be needed to remove the berms and install drainage features.

Changing roads from open to all vehicles to open to highway legal vehicles only (Common to all action alternatives): The prohibition of certain vehicle types would be displayed on the motor vehicle use map and through signing. For all action alternatives, this would apply to roads shown in table 2.

Table 2. Roads and location descriptions to be open to highway-legal vehicles only that would be implemented under all action alternatives

Road Number	Mile Post (MP) Begin	MP End	Location Description	Ranger District
13	0.0	2.5	Within Quemado Lake Recreation Area boundary	Quemado
13 B	0.0	0.4	Within Quemado Lake Recreation Area boundary	Quemado
13 C	0.0	0.5	Within Quemado Lake Recreation Area boundary	Quemado
13 E	0.0	0.2	Within Quemado Lake Recreation Area boundary	Quemado
13 F	0.0	0.2	Within Quemado Lake Recreation Area boundary	Quemado
13 G	0.0	0.2	Within Quemado Lake Recreation Area boundary	Quemado
13 H	0.0	0.1	Within Quemado Lake Recreation Area boundary	Quemado
13 I	0.0	0.1	Within Quemado Lake Recreation Area boundary	Quemado
21 A	0.0	0.04	Ranger district office access	Reserve
21 B	0.0	0.1	Ranger district and facilities access	Reserve
40 D	0.0	0.2	Emory Pass Vista Point	Black Range
59	0.0	0.1	Ranger district office parking	Wilderness
95	0.0	0.1	Catwalk parking area	Glenwood
129	0.0	0.3	Ranger district office parking	Glenwood
141	0.6	18.8	State law prohibits off-highway (ATV) vehicles on paved roads	Reserve
319	0.0	0.2	Ranger district office parking	Quemado
363	0.0	0.2	Campground	Silver
506 A	0.0	0.3	Little Walnut Picnic Area	Silver
610	0.0	0.7	Campground	Wilderness
627	0.0	0.3	Lake Roberts Boat Ramp	Wilderness
630	0.0	0.1	State law prohibits off-highway (ATV) vehicles on paved roads	Wilderness
819	0.0	0.8	Forest has right-of-way thru Oak Grove subdivision—no ATVs to reduce noise conflict	Silver
970	0.0	0.6	Gila Visitor Center access	Wilderness
970 B	0.0	0.1	Gila Visitors Center parking area	Wilderness
971	0.0	0.1	Vista Village Day Use and parking	Wilderness
973	0.0	0.04	Campground	Wilderness
973 A	0.0	0.1	Upper Scorpion Campground	Wilderness
973 B	0.0	0.1	Parking lot for Gila Cliff Dwellings and West Fork Trail Head	Wilderness
974	0.0	0.3	Campground	Wilderness
981	0.0	0.4	Aldo Leopold Picnic Area and Vista Point	Glenwood
4187 K	0.0	0.3	Within Quemado Lake Recreation Area boundary	Quemado
4187 L	0.0	0.2	Within Quemado Lake Recreation Area boundary	Quemado
4187 M	0.0	0.1	Within Quemado Lake Recreation Area boundary	Quemado
4187 N	0.0	0.2	Within Quemado Lake Recreation Area boundary	Quemado
4206 P	0.0	0.2	Lake Roberts picnic area	Wilderness
4318 K	0.0	0.04	Accesses airstrip	Reserve

Designating Motorized Dispersed Camping Corridors (Common to alternatives C, D, F, and G): On the Gila National Forest, motorized dispersed camping is primarily characterized as vehicles towing travel trailers or other types of trailers and driving off of roads some distance and setting up camp. Activities or the makeup of the camp often center around the vehicle or trailers. The Travel Management Rule allows for the route designations to include the limited use of motor vehicles within a specified distance of certain designated routes, solely for the purposes of dispersed camping (36 CFR 212.51 (b)).

To continue this type of camping opportunity in the forest, motor vehicles may be driven a specified distance off of each side of certain roads designated for motorized dispersed camping and these designations would be displayed on the motor vehicle use map. The total number of miles of forest and county roads from which motorized dispersed camping would be available varies among the action alternatives (see detailed alternative descriptions). Motor vehicle use within these motorized dispersed camping corridors would be limited to what is needed to provide access to and from the campsite off of the road and does not include general driving.

Dispersed camping, such as tent camping, may occur anywhere on the forest. Riding horses and hiking to access a campsite is allowed anywhere on the forest. Parking for this type of dispersed camping may occur along any designated open road. Parking would be limited to one vehicle length, including any towed trailer, from the side of the road. Parking should occur where it is safe to park, does not cause resource damage (e.g., ruts), or is not already restricted.

Motorized Big Game Retrieval (Common to alternatives C, D, F, and G): The Travel Management Rule allows for route designations to include “the limited use of motor vehicles within a specified distance of certain designated routes, solely for the purposes of...retrieval of a downed big game animal by an individual who has legally taken that animal” (36 CFR 212.51 (b)).

Motorized big game retrieval would be implemented differently in each alternative (see detailed alternative descriptions). Hunters must possess a valid license for game management units within the Gila National Forest.

Motorized big game retrieval only applies to those portions of game management units within the Gila National Forest boundary. Use of motorized vehicles to retrieve a legally harvested and tagged big game animal would be limited to certain species and the specified distance on either side of the routes indicated in the alternative. The distance applies only to Gila National Forest lands. Motorized vehicles are prohibited within:

- National forest wilderness areas (36 CFR 261.18)
- National forest primitive areas (36 CFR 261.21)
- Restricted roads, trails, or areas specified in forest orders (36 CFR 261.50)

Hunters must follow all applicable New Mexico big game hunting regulations. To protect forest resources, retrieval of game should take a relatively direct and safe route (USDA Forest Service Southwestern Region Travel Management Rule Guidelines, June 2008) and follow applicable laws or regulations, such as:

- Roads should not be damaged or left in a damaged condition (36 CFR 261.12 (c))
- Retrieval of big game should take a relatively direct and safe route
- Motor vehicle use off-road should not damage or unreasonably disturb the land, wildlife, or vegetative resources (36 CFR 261.15 (h))
- Use the minimum number of trips to retrieve a downed animal (USDA Forest Service Southwestern Region Travel Management Rule Guidelines, June 2008)
- Only one vehicle would be allowed for game retrieval per harvested animal (USDA Forest Service Southwestern Region Travel Management Rule Guidelines, June 2008)
- Motor vehicle use should not damage any natural feature or other property of the United States (36 CFR 261.9 (a))

Forest Plan Amendments (Common to all action alternatives): Seven “Gila National Forest Plan” amendments are needed to bring the forest plan up to date with current management of the forest, and to comply with the Travel Management Rule and proposal.

The forest plan amendments (numbers 1 through 6) listed in table 3 would be implemented in all action alternatives.

Table 3. Land management plan amendments 1 through 6 that would be implemented in all action alternatives

Location and Management Area	Language to be Removed . . .	Will be Replaced with . . .
Mule Creek 4B (p. 131, Lands J11)	“Manage the areas above Mule Creek to remain open to all entry year-round”	Use of motor vehicles is managed by the travel management plan and displayed on the motor vehicle use map.
Mule Creek 4C (p. 139, Lands J11)	“... and the portion above Mule Creek will remain open year-round”	Use of motor vehicles is managed by the travel management plan and displayed on the motor vehicle use map.
Hells Hole 4C (p. 139, Lands J11)	“Hells Hole will remain open to vehicle use, but because of topography, vehicle use will not occur in most portions of the area.”	Use of motor vehicles in Hells Hole is managed by the travel management plan and displayed on the motor vehicle use map.
Gila Bird Area 7A (p. 201, Recreation A02)	“Maintain ORV (off-road vehicle) closure on the Gila River Bird Area.”	Use of motor vehicles is managed by the travel management plan and displayed on the motor vehicle use map.
Silver City Watershed 7D (p. 216, Recreation A02)	“Maintain current ORV restrictions.”	Use of motor vehicles is managed by the travel management plan and displayed on the motor vehicle use map.
Fort Bayard 7C (p. 212, Recreation A02)	“Maintain current ORV closure.”	All alternatives: Motorized vehicle use access is limited to designated roads with parking allowed one vehicle length from the side of the road. No motorized big game retrieval is allowed.

Amendment No. 7: The Gila National Forest Plan needs to be amended to add and remove language from the recreation standards and guidelines related to the Off-Road Vehicle Policy (page 22 of the forest plan as amended (Amendment #1 1987)) so it is consistent with the

Travel Management Rule and outdated schedules can be removed. The forest plan amendment 7 as shown in table 4 would be implemented in all action alternatives. (Language to be removed is indicated by a strikethrough and language to be added is in italics.). This would be implemented in all action alternatives.

Table 4. Proposed Forest Plan Amendment No. 7 to change recreation standards and guidelines related to the off-road vehicle policy

Resource*	Activity	Standards and Guidelines
Recreation	A01	<p>ORV <i>OHV</i> Policy: <i>Prohibit motor vehicle use off the designated system of roads, trails, and areas, except as displayed on the motor vehicle use map.</i></p> <p>During the travel management process, forest personnel will determine which roads, trails and areas will be open to motorized vehicle use and which will be restricted or closed. The public will be involved in this process. Priority areas will be identified and scheduled within one year and the travel management process completed on these areas within three years. In general, the forest will be closed to motorized vehicle travel off the designated road and trail system and outside of designated areas. The following criteria below will be used. Exceptions to motorized vehicle restrictions can be granted by permit only <i>written authorization only</i>. These restrictions do not apply to emergency vehicle use. Restrictions and closures will be reviewed annually and the public will be notified of any change.</p> <p>Restricted (definition): Road, trail or area could be closed to motorized vehicle use. Could be restricted to certain types of vehicle, motorized use could be restricted to specific periods, etc.</p> <p>Criteria to be used in designating open, closed or restricted roads, trails and areas are:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Management emphasis of a specified area; Level of conflict between existing types of use; Required resource protection; Seasonal constraints; Special needs of users and management.
	A01	<p>Off road vehicle <i>Travel management</i> implementation plan will be updated whenever changes occur as a result of travel management planning.</p>
	A01	<p>Recreation use of riparian zones will be managed to minimize damage to riparian resources.</p>

* Management Prescription Applicable to all Areas Except Wilderness

** Standards and Guidelines Will Apply Uniformly throughout the Gila National Forest

Alternative C

The Gila National Forest proposes to close the forest to motorized cross-country travel as stated in proposed plan amendment No. 7, except as described below:

- Add 7 miles of unauthorized routes and designate these routes as National Forest System (NFS) roads open to all vehicle types (table 5, p. 25).
- Reopen 6 miles of NFS maintenance level 1 roads and change to maintenance level 2 roads open to all vehicle types (table 5, p. 25).
- Change vehicle type on 28 miles of NFS roads from open to all motorized vehicles to open to highway legal vehicles only (table 2, p. 15 and table 5, p. 25). Highway legal vehicles are motor vehicles licensed under State law for general operation on all public roads within the state.
- Designate 1 mile of NFS roads to be open seasonally for all vehicle types from April 1 through September 1 (table 5 and table 6, p. 25).
- The following changes apply to motorized routes that will be open for the purpose of periodic administrative use or specific permitted uses only (table 7, p. 26):
 - Change the use on 173 miles of existing NFS roads currently open to all motorized uses.
 - Add 27 miles of unauthorized routes as roads.
 - Reopen 9 miles of maintenance level 1 closed roads or decommissioned roads and change to maintenance level 2.
 - Change 2 miles of NFS roads to NFS trails.
 - Add 3 miles of unauthorized ATV routes to NFS trails.
- Close 144 miles of open NFS roads to all motorized vehicle uses (table 5, p. 25).
- Close 1 mile of open NFS motorized trails to all motorized uses (table 8, p. 26).
- Add 61 miles of unauthorized routes and designate as NFS trails for motorized vehicles less than 50 inches in width (table 8, p. 26).
- Open and convert 30 miles of NFS maintenance level 1 closed roads or decommissioned roads and designate as NFS trails for motorized vehicles less than 50 inches in width (table 8, p. 26).
- Convert 35 miles of open NFS roads to NFS trails and designate for motorized vehicles less than 50 inches in width (table 8, p. 26).
- Add 13 miles of unauthorized routes and designate as NFS trails for single-track vehicles only (table 8, p. 26).
- Allow single-track vehicles (motorcycles) on 51 miles of previously nonmotorized NFS trails. Both motorized and nonmotorized uses would be allowed on the trails (table 8, p. 26).
- For the purpose of motorized dispersed camping, designate a specified distance of 300 feet on each side of (table 9 and table 11, p. 27):
 - 1,452 miles of specific designated open forest roads,
 - 0.2 mile of reopened maintenance level 1 closed roads or decommissioned roads,
 - 0.9 mile of unauthorized roads proposed to be added to the system, and
 - 70 miles of county roads.

- For the purpose of motorized big game retrieval, designate a specified distance of 1 mile on each side of open forest roads, county roads, and State and Federal highways located on NFS lands. Motorized big game retrieval would be limited to elk, deer, pronghorn, bear, javelina, and mountain lion (table 10 and table 11, p. 27).
- Areas:
 - Designate 36 small areas distributed over 24 acres open to all motorized vehicles. These areas have been traditionally used for motorized dispersed camping (table 12, p.27 and table 13, p. 28).
 - Designate an area of 3 acres open to ATV and motorcycle use only (table 14, p. 30).

Alternative D

The Gila National Forest proposes to close the forest to motorized cross-country travel as stated in proposed plan amendment No. 7, except as described below:

- Add 6 miles of unauthorized routes and designate these routes as NFS roads open to all vehicle types (table 5, p. 25).
- Reopen 2 miles of NFS maintenance level 1 and change to maintenance level 2 roads open to all vehicle types (table 5, p. 25).
- Change vehicle type on 28 miles of NFS roads from open to all motorized vehicles to open to highway legal vehicles only (table 2, p. 15 and table 5, p. 25). Highway legal vehicles are motor vehicles licensed under State law for general operation on all public roads within the State.
- Designate 3 miles of NFS roads to be open seasonally for all vehicle types from April 1 through September 1 (table 5 and table 6, p. 25).
- Designate 8 miles of NFS roads to be open seasonally to all vehicle types from September 1 through February 28 (table 5 and table 6, p. 25).
- The following changes apply to motorized routes that will be open only for the purpose of periodic administrative use or specific permitted uses (table 7, p. 26):
 - Change the use on 340 miles of existing NFS roads currently open to all motorized uses.
 - Add 27 miles of unauthorized routes as roads.
 - Reopen 9 miles of maintenance level 1 closed roads or decommissioned roads and change to maintenance level 2.
 - Change 4 miles of NFS roads to NFS trail.
 - Add 3 miles of unauthorized ATV routes to NFS trails.
 - Change the use on 1 mile of existing motorized NFS trails.
- Close 1,233 miles of open NFS roads to all motorized vehicle uses (table 5, p. 25).
- Close 7 miles of open NFS motorized trails to all motorized uses (table 8, p. 26).
- Add 34 miles of unauthorized routes and designate these as NFS trails for motorized vehicles less than 50 inches in width (table 8, p. 26).
- Open and convert 14 miles of NFS maintenance level 1 closed roads or decommissioned roads to NFS trails and designate for motorized vehicles less than 50 inches in width (table 8, p. 26).
- Convert 68 miles of NFS roads to NFS trails and designate for motorized vehicles less than 50 inches in width (table 8, p. 26).

- For the purpose of motorized dispersed camping, designate a specified distance of 300 feet on each side of (table 9 and table 11, p. 27):
 - 1,143 miles of specific designated open forest roads,
 - 0.2 mile of reopened maintenance level 1 closed roads or decommissioned roads,
 - 0.6 mile of unauthorized roads proposed to be added to the system, and
 - 34 miles of county roads.
- Motorized big game retrieval would be limited to the same corridors designated for motorized dispersed camping. Motorized big game retrieval would be limited to elk and deer (table 10 and table 11, p. 27).

Alternative E

The Gila National Forest proposes to close the forest to motorized cross-country travel, as stated in proposed plan amendment No. 7, except as described below:

- Add 2 miles of unauthorized routes and designate these routes as NFS roads open to all vehicle types (table 5, p. 25).
- Reopen 1 mile of NFS maintenance level 1 and change to maintenance level 2 roads open to all vehicle types (table 5, p. 25).
- Change vehicle type on 28 miles of NFS roads from open to all motorized vehicles to open to highway legal vehicles only (table 2, p. 15 and table 5, p. 25). Highway legal vehicles are motor vehicles licensed under State law for general operation on all public roads within the State.
- Designate 3 miles of NFS roads to be open seasonally for all vehicle types from April 1 through September 1 (table 5 and table 6, p. 25).
- The following changes apply to motorized routes that will open only for periodic administrative use or specific permitted uses only (table 7, p. 26):
 - Change the use on 427 miles of existing NFS roads currently open to all motorized uses.
 - Add 4 miles of unauthorized routes as roads.
 - Reopen 3 miles of maintenance level 1 closed roads or decommissioned roads and change to maintenance level 2.
 - Change 3 miles of NFS roads to NFS trails.
 - Add 3 miles of unauthorized ATV routes to NFS trails.
 - Change the use on 1 mile of existing motorized NFS trails.
- Close 1,866 miles of open NFS roads to all motorized vehicle uses (table 5, p. 25).
- Close 15 miles of open NFS motorized trails to all motorized uses (table 8, p. 26).
- Convert 2 miles of NFS maintenance level 1 closed roads or decommissioned roads to NFS trails and designate for motorized vehicles less than 50 inches in width (table 8, p. 26).
- No motorized dispersed camping corridors would be designated (table 9 and table 11, p. 27).
- Motorized big game retrieval would not be allowed (table 10 and table 11, p. 27).

Alternative F – Modified Proposed Action

The Gila National Forest proposes to close the forest to motorized cross-country travel as stated in proposed plan amendment No. 7, except as described below:

- Add 6 miles of unauthorized routes and designate these routes as NFS roads open to all vehicle types (table 5, p. 25).
- Reopen 3 miles of NFS maintenance level 1 roads and change to maintenance level 2 roads open to all vehicle types (table 5, p. 25).
- Change vehicle type on 28 miles of NFS roads from open to all motorized vehicles to open to highway legal vehicles only (table 2, p. 15 and table 5, p. 25). Highway legal vehicles are motor vehicles licensed under State law for general operation on all public roads within the State.
- Designate 3 miles of NFS roads to be open seasonally for all vehicle types from April 1 through September 1 (table 5 and table 6, p. 25).
- The following changes apply to motorized routes that will open for periodic administrative use or specific permitted uses only (table 7, p. 26):
 - Change the use on 291 miles of existing NFS roads currently open to all motorized uses.
 - Add 25 miles of unauthorized routes as roads.
 - Reopen 9 miles of maintenance level 1 closed roads or decommissioned roads and change to maintenance level 2.
 - Change 2 miles of NFS roads to NFS trails.
 - Add 3 miles of unauthorized ATV routes to NFS trails.
- Close 878 miles of open NFS roads to all motorized vehicle uses (table 5, p. 25).
- Close 1 mile of open NFS motorized trails (table 8, p. 26).
- Add 53 miles of unauthorized routes and designate these routes as NFS trails open for motorized vehicles less than 50 inches in width (table 8, p. 26).
- Open and convert 22 miles of NFS maintenance level 1 closed roads or decommissioned roads to NFS trails and designate for motorized vehicles less than 50 inches in width (table 8, p. 26).
- Convert 88 miles of NFS roads to NFS trails and designate for motorized vehicles less than 50 inches in width (table 8, p. 26).
- For the purpose of motorized dispersed camping, designate a specified distance of 300 feet on each side of (table 9 and table 11, p. 27):
 - 1,372 miles of specific designated open forest roads,
 - 0.2 mile of reopened maintenance level 1 closed roads or decommissioned roads,
 - 0.2 mile of unauthorized roads proposed to be added to the system, and
 - 64 miles of county roads.
- Designate a specified distance of one-half mile on each side of open forest roads, county roads, and State and Federal highways on Gila NFS lands for motorized big game retrieval. Motorized big game retrieval would be limited to elk only (table 10 and table 11, p. 27).

- Areas:
 - Designate 36 small areas distributed over 24 acres open to all motorized vehicles. These areas have been traditionally used for motorized dispersed camping (table 12, p. 27 and table 13, p. 28).
 - Designate an area of 3 acres open to ATV and motorcycle use only (table 14, p. 30).

Alternative G – Preferred Alternative

The Gila National Forest proposes to close the forest to motorized cross-country travel as stated in proposed plan amendment No. 7, except as described below:

- Add 7 miles of unauthorized routes and designate these routes as NFS roads open to all vehicle types (table 5, p. 25).
- Reopen 3 miles of NFS maintenance level 1 roads and change to maintenance level 2 roads open to all vehicle types (table 5, p. 25).
- Change vehicle type on 28 miles of NFS roads from open to all motorized vehicles to open to highway legal vehicles only (table 2, p. 15 and table 5, p. 25). Highway legal vehicles are motor vehicles licensed under State law for general operation on all public roads within the State.
- Designate 3 miles of NFS roads to be open seasonally for all vehicle types from April 1 through September 1 (table 5 and table 6 p. 25).
- The following changes apply to motorized routes that will open for periodic administrative use or specific permitted uses only (table 7, p. 26):
 - Change the use on 289 miles of existing NFS roads currently open to all motorized uses.
 - Add 26 miles of unauthorized routes as roads.
 - Reopen 9 miles of maintenance level 1 closed roads or decommissioned roads and change to maintenance level 2.
 - Change 2 miles of NFS roads to NFS trails.
 - Add 3 miles of unauthorized ATV routes to NFS trails.
- Close 908 miles of open NFS roads to all motorized vehicle uses (table 5, p. 25).
- Close 1 mile of open NFS motorized trails to all motorized uses (table 8, p. 26).
- Add 51 miles of unauthorized routes and designate these as NFS trails open to motorized vehicles less than 50 inches in width (table 8, p. 26).
- Open and convert 22 miles of NFS maintenance level 1 closed roads or decommissioned roads to NFS trails and designate for motorized vehicles less than 50 inches in width (table 8, p. 26).
- Convert 90 miles of NFS roads to NFS trails and designate for motorized vehicles less than 50 inches in width (table 8, p. 26).
- For the purpose of motorized dispersed camping, designate a specified distance of 300 feet on each side of (table 9 and table 11, p. 27):
 - 1,267 miles of specific designated open forest roads,
 - 0.2 mile of maintenance level 1 closed roads or decommissioned roads,
 - 0.6 mile of unauthorized roads proposed to be added to the system, and
 - 48 miles of county roads.

- Motorized big game retrieval would be limited to the same corridors designated for motorized dispersed camping. Motorized big game retrieval would be limited to elk and deer (table 10 and table 11, p. 27).
- Areas:
 - Designate 36 small areas distributed over 24 acres open to all motorized vehicles. These areas have been traditionally used for motorized dispersed camping (table 12, p. 27 and table 13, p. 28).
 - Designate an area of 3 acres open to ATV and motorcycle use only (table 14, p. 30).

Table 5. Changes to road system in miles

Features of the alternatives	Alt. B ¹	Alt. C	Alt. D	Alt. E	Alt. F ¹	Alt. G
Add unauthorized routes to NFS roads open to all vehicle types ²	0	7	6	2	6	7
Reopen NFS maintenance level 1 closed or decommissioned roads to all vehicle types ²	0	6	2	1	3	3
Change allowed vehicle type on NFS roads from all vehicles to highway legal vehicles only	0	28	28	28	28	28
Change time of year on NFS roads to be designated seasonally open for all vehicle types, April 1 through September 1	3	1	3	3	3	3
Change time of year on NFS roads to be designated seasonally open for all vehicle types, September 1 through February 28	0	0	8	0	0	0
Close existing NFS roads that are currently open to all motorized vehicle uses	0	144	1,233	1,866	878	908

¹ Alternative B = no action, alternative F = modified proposed action

² Appendix E lists the individual routes for this feature of the alternatives

Table 6. Road segments proposed to be designated seasonally open

Road No.	Begin MP	End MP	Total Miles	Description	Ranger District	Dates Open	Alt. B ¹	Alt. C	Alt. D	Alt. E	Alt. F ¹	Alt. G
38	3.3	4.3	0.9	Eagle Peak Lookout	Reserve	April 1 through September 1	X ²		X	X	X	X
154	6.9	7.1	0.2	Signal Peak Lookout	Silver City	April 1 through September 1	X ²		X	X	X	X
770	5.3	5.6	0.3	Fox Mountain Lookout	Quemado	April 1 through September 1	X ²	X	X	X	X	X
11 M	0.0	0.5	0.5	Mangas Mountain Lookout	Quemado	April 1 through September 1	X ²	X	X	X	X	X
119 A	0.0	0.9	0.9	Bearwallow Lookout	Glenwood	April 1 through September 1	X ²		X	X	X	X
4043 J	0.0	6.1	6.1	Resource Protection	Reserve	September 1 through February 28			X			
4172 O	0.0	1.1	1.1	Resource Protection	Reserve	September 1 through February 28			X			
4307 K	0.0	0.9	0.9	Resource Protection	Reserve	September 1 through February 28			X			

MP = milepost

¹ Alternative B = no action, alternative F = modified proposed action

² Currently, these roads are seasonally open from approximately April 1 through September 1

Table 7. Road and trail miles for use as “periodic administrative use” or “by written authorization only”

Features of the alternatives	Alt. B ¹	Alt. C	Alt. D	Alt. E	Alt. F ¹	Alt. G
Change use on existing NFS roads currently open to all motorized uses	0	173	340	427	291	289
Reopen maintenance level 1 closed roads or decommissioned roads and change to maintenance level 2 ²	0	9	9	3	9	9
Add unauthorized routes as roads ²	0	27	27	4	25	26
Total road miles	0	208	376	433	325	324
Change NFS roads to NFS trails (motorized)	0	2	4	3	2	2
Change use on existing motorized NFS trail	0	0	1	1	0	0
Add unauthorized routes to NFS motorized trail system ²	0	3	3	3	3	3
Total motorized trail miles	0	5	8	7	5	5

¹ Alternative B = no action, alternative F = modified proposed action

² Appendix E lists the individual routes for this feature of the alternatives

Table 8. Changes to motorized trails in miles

Features of the alternatives	Alt. B ¹	Alt. C	Alt. D	Alt. E	Alt. F ¹	Alt. G
Add unauthorized routes and designate as NFS trails for motorized vehicles less than 50 inches in width ²	0	61	34	0	53	51
Open and convert NFS maintenance level 1 closed roads or decommissioned roads to NFS trails for motorized vehicles less than 50 inches in width ²	0	30	14	0	22	22
Convert open NFS maintenance level 1 closed roads or decommissioned roads to NFS trails for motorized vehicles less than 50 inches in width	0	35	68	2	88	90
Allow single-track vehicles (motorcycles) on previously nonmotorized NFS trails. Both motorized and nonmotorized uses would be allowed on the trails. ²	0	51	0	0	0	0
Add unauthorized routes and designate as NFS trails for motorcycles (single track) ²	0	13	0	0	0	0
Close open NFS motorized trails to all motorized uses	0	1	7	15	1	1

¹ Alternative B = no action, alternative F = modified proposed action

² Appendix E lists the individual routes for this feature of the alternatives

Table 9. Motorized dispersed camping – 300 feet on both sides of the road

Features of the alternatives	Alt. B ¹	Alt. C	Alt. D	Alt. E	Alt. F*	Alt. G
Open forest roads	4,613	1,452	1,143	0	1,372	1,267
Unauthorized routes proposed to be added to the road system	0	0.9	0.6	0	0.2	0.6
Re-opened maintenance level 1 closed roads or decommissioned roads	0	0.2	0.2	0	0.2	0.2
County roads	463	70	34	0	64	48
Total miles motorized dispersed camping (300 feet both sides of road)	5,076	1,524	1,178	0	1,434	1,316

¹ In alternative B, no action, the forest is open to cross-country travel, so no limit on distance except for wilderness and other restricted areas.

* Alternative F = modified proposed action

Table 10. Description of motorized big game retrieval by alternative

Alternative	Motorized Big Game Retrieval Features of the Alternatives
B*	No limit on distance or species. Forest is open to cross-country travel except for wilderness and other restricted areas.
C	Allowed within 1 mile from each side of designated open roads, county roads, and State and Federal highways for retrieval of elk, deer, bear, mountain lion, javelina, and pronghorn.
D	Allowed within 300 feet using same motorized dispersed camping corridors for retrieval of elk and deer.
E	None allowed
F*	Allowed within 1/2 mile from each side of designated open roads, county roads, and State and Federal highways for retrieval of elk only.
G	Allowed within 300 feet using same motorized dispersed camping corridors. Retrieval limited to deer and elk.

* Alternative B = no action, alternative F = modified proposed action

Table 11. Estimated acreage of motorized dispersed camping and motorized big game retrieval

Motorized activity in acres	Alt. B*	Alt. C	Alt. D	Alt. E	Alt. F*	Alt. G
Motorized dispersed camping	2,443,391	108,180	84,388	0	101,916	94,008
Motorized big game retrieval	2,443,391	2,078,666	84,388	0	1,506,576	94,008

* Alternative B = no action, alternative F = modified proposed action

Table 12. Areas open to all motor vehicles

Features of the alternatives	Alt. B*	Alt. C	Alt. D	Alt. E	Alt. F*	Alt. G
Number	No limit, forest is open to cross-country motor vehicle travel except where motor vehicles are prohibited	36	0	0	36	36
Acres	2,443,391	24	0	0	24	24

* Alternative B = no action, alternative F = modified proposed action

Table 13. Areas open to all vehicle types

Label ID	Township	Range	Section	Associated Road Number or Description	Ranger District	Acres	Alt. B	Alt. C	Alt. D	Alt. E	Alt. F	Alt. G
QA1	4S	21W	10, 15	NFSR 385	Quemado	0.5		X			X	X
QA2	4S	21W	14	NFSR 385	Quemado	0.7		X			X	X
QA3	2S	15W	7	NFSR 13 D	Quemado	0.4		X			X	X
QA4	3S	18W	24	NFSR 770	Quemado	1.9		X			X	X
QA5	3S	18W	24, 25	Intersection of NFSR 93 and U.S. 180	Quemado	2.1		X			X	X
QA6	5S	20W	3	Intersection of CAT-B007 and B012	Quemado	1.2		X			X	X
QA7	3S	17W	22	NFSR 93	Quemado	2.1		X			X	X
QA8	5S	20W	20	Intersection of CAT-B007 and B009	Quemado	0.5		X			X	X
QA9	3S	15W	25	Cat A095	Quemado	0.8		X			X	X
QA10	4S	15W	28, 29	NFSR 4188 R - CDT South Trailhead	Quemado	1.9		X			X	X
RA1	6S	19W	34	End of 4161 W	Reserve	3.3		X			X	X
WA1	15S	12W	8, 9, 16, 17	Celebration Site (Intersection of 4202 W, 4202 X, 4078 U, and 4078Y)	Wilderness	78.6						
WA2	15S	11W	32	NFSR 4080 T	Wilderness	0.4		X			X	X
WA3	15S	11W	31	NFSR 4080 T; 2 Sites	Wilderness	2.3						
WA4	14S	11W	29	End of NFSR 4201 M	Wilderness	0.2		X			X	X
WA5	14S	11W	30	End of NFSR 4204 E	Wilderness	0.4		X			X	X
WA6	14S	11W	20	Intersection of NFSR 4204 E and NFSR 4204 D	Wilderness	0.5		X			X	X
WA7	14S	11W	30	End of NFSR 4204 D	Wilderness	0.2		X			X	X
WA8	14S	11W	30	NFSR 4079 P	Wilderness	0.4		X			X	X
WA9	14S	11W	30	NFSR 4079 P	Wilderness	0.1		X			X	X
WA10	14S	11W	30	NFSR 4079 P	Wilderness	0.4		X			X	X
WA11	14S	12W	36	End of 4079 P	Wilderness	0.7		X			X	X

Label ID	Township	Range	Section	Associated Road Number or Description	Ranger District	Acres	Alt. B	Alt. C	Alt. D	Alt. E	Alt. F	Alt. G
WA12	14S	12W	25	End of NFSR 4205 F	Wilderness	0.5		X			X	X
WA13	14S	12W	25	End of NFSR 4205 G	Wilderness	0.6		X			X	X
WA14	14S	12W	35, 36	End of NFSR 4203 A	Wilderness	0.3		X			X	X
WA15	14S	12W	35	NFSR 4203 A	Wilderness	1.4		X			X	X
WA16	14S	12W	35	NFSR 4203 A	Wilderness	0.4		X			X	X
WA17	15S	11W	6	End of NFSR 4079 U	Wilderness	1.5						
WA18	15S	12W	11, 12	NFSR 4079 T	Wilderness	0.4		X			X	X
WA19	15S	12W	14	NFSR 4079 T	Wilderness	0.6		X			X	X
WA20	15S	12W	14	NFSR 4079 T	Wilderness	0.5		X			X	X
WA21	15S	12W	14	NFSR 4079 T	Wilderness	0.3		X			X	X
WA22	15S	12W	14, 15	NFSR 4079 T and NFSR 4085 Y	Wilderness	0.8		X			X	X
WA23	15S	12W	15	NFSR 4079 Tand NFSR 4085 Z	Wilderness	0.5		X			X	X
WA24	15S	12W	15	NFSR 4079 T	Wilderness	0.6		X			X	X
WA25	15S	11W	11	NFSR 4080 W	Wilderness	0.2		X			X	X
WA26	15S	11W	11	NFSR 4080 W	Wilderness	0.2		X			X	X
WA27	15S	11W	23	End of NFSR 4086 V	Wilderness	0.2		X			X	X
WA28	15S	11W	27	NFSR 4204 B	Wilderness	0.7		X			X	X
WA29	15S	11W	34	End of NFSR 4204 B	Wilderness	0.4		X			X	X

* Alternative B = no action, alternative F = modified proposed action

Table 14. Areas restricted to ATVs and motorcycles only

Features of the alternatives	Alt. B*	Alt. C	Alt. D	Alt. E	Alt. F*	Alt. G
Number	No limit, forest is open to cross-country motor vehicle travel except where motor vehicles are prohibited	1	0	0	1	1
Acres	2,443,391	3	0	0	3	3

* Alternative B = no action, alternative F = modified proposed action

Mitigations

The Council on Environmental Quality’s regulations for implementing NEPA define a mitigation as measures that avoid, minimize, reduce, rectify, or compensate for impacts to the physical environment resulting from Federal actions (40 CFR 1508.20). They are things the Forest Service will do as part of implementing the decision to lessen any potential damage to natural or cultural resources. The mitigation measures listed here apply to all of the action alternatives.

Cultural Resources

Where we identify impacts that may adversely affect cultural or historical resource sites (as it is defined in the National Historic Preservation Act, 36 CFR 800.5.a.1) from proposed motorized designations, we will apply appropriate mitigations, such as:

- dropping proposed motorized road, trail, area, or corridor designations to avoid or reduce direct or indirect effects on historic properties
- re-routing or modifying designated roads or trails to protect historic properties. Rerouting or modifying roads will be subject to Section 106 compliance prior to ground disturbance, as provided for in the Programmatic Agreement
- using temporary emergency closures, if needed, while unacceptable effects on historic properties are addressed
- revising designations, if determined necessary to protect historic properties from adverse effects
- monitoring to ensure that impacts to historic properties are not occurring or that protection measures are working
- leaving roads, trails, areas off the motor vehicle use map distributed to the public until after all Section 106 compliance needs are met.
- removing fire rings and trash
- using fencing or other barriers
- posting signs

Where we identify impacts that may adversely affect traditional cultural or historical properties from motorized access, appropriate mitigations will be applied, such as:

1. Where motorized access to traditional cultural properties is reduced because of designation, we will grant special use or other authorizations to users. Consultation with appropriate or traditional communities or practitioners may develop other mitigation measures
2. Where traditional cultural properties have the potential to be physically impacted by routes, fixed-distance corridors, or areas, mitigation will consist of not designating or using other kinds of mitigation to reduce adverse effects. In some cases, consultation with appropriate or traditional communities or practitioners may develop other mitigation measures resulting in traditional cultural or historical properties being avoided or not adversely affected by designation.

Alternatives Considered but Eliminated from Detailed Study

This section describes the alternatives considered but eliminated from detailed study and the reasons why. These are presented in no particular order. The Forest Service and public both developed alternatives that have not been carried forward in detail. Most suggestions from the public were not fully developed alternatives.

Alternative A – The Proposed Action

The proposed action was not studied in detail. The original proposed action (alternative A) has been eliminated from detailed analysis. Alternative F is the modified proposed action carried forward in the FEIS. Alternative A was eliminated for the following reasons:

- Technical errors were found in the data within this alternative. Errors included such things as: missing Forest Service constructed routes, wrong alignment, length errors, maintenance level identification, and incorrect jurisdiction identification. Technical errors have been corrected in the other action alternatives.
- Errors were found in the proposal (e.g., the proposed action originally proposed to close routes that were identified as a need by the public or forest staff for administrative uses or to access private inholdings).
- Approximately 100 miles of roads identified in the proposed action have been formally conveyed to counties and are no longer under Forest Service jurisdiction.
- A recent land exchange added new roads to the forest road system.
- There have been changes in route designations based on acquired rights-of-way.
- This alternative is very similar to alternative F; distinctions are not clear enough to show a major difference between this and the other alternative.
- All of the elements of the proposed action can be found in the other action alternatives.

Public Alternative for Wilderness Ranger District

The alternative submitted concerned only the Wilderness Ranger District. The alternative recommended no changes to be made to the current road system. Reasons why this alternative was not analyzed in detail follow:

- It was not comprehensive for the whole forest.
- All roads suggested were considered individually and incorporated into alternatives as appropriate, except where resource concerns or other administrative needs were identified.
- Alternative C incorporates nearly all of the routes identified in the public's alternative.

Comparison of Alternatives

Table 15. Overview of the elements of the alternatives that would be open to the public and included in the motor vehicle use map

Key Elements	Alt. B*	Alt. C	Alt. D	Alt. E	Alt. F*	Alt. G
Miles of roads open to the public for motorized use	4,613	4,272	2,976	2,318	3,363	3,334
Miles of motorized trails (less than 50 inches in width)	16	205	125	0	179	179
Miles of single-track (motorcycle) trails	0	64	0	0	0	0
Total percent change in motorized roads and trails	0%	-2%	-33%	-50%	-24%	-24%
Miles open for motorized dispersed camping (300 feet on each side of road)	5,076 (no distance limit, forest is open)	1,524	1,178	0	1,434	1,316
Motorized big game retrieval (MBGR) description (acres open for MBGR)	No limit on distance or species. Forest is open (approx. 2,443,391 acres).	1 mile from each side of designated open roads, county roads, and State and Federal highways for retrieving elk, deer, bear, mountain lion, javelina, pronghorn (approx. 2,078,666 acres)	300 feet using same motorized dispersed camping corridors for retrieving elk and deer (approx. 84,388 acres)	No motorized big game retrieval allowed (0 acres)	1/2 mile from each side of designated open roads, county roads, and State and Federal highways for retrieving elk only (approx. 1,506,576 acres)	300 feet using same motorized dispersed camping corridors for retrieving elk and deer (approx. 94,008 acres)
Number of areas (acres) open to all vehicles	No limit, forest is open	36 (24)	0 (0)	0 (0)	36 (24)	36 (24)
Number of areas (acres) restricted to ATV and motorcycles only	No limit, forest is open	1 (3)	0 (0)	0 (0)	1 (3)	1 (3)

* Alternative B = no action, alternative F = modified proposed action

Table 16. Comparison of resources by alternatives

Resource	Alternative B	Alternative C	Alternative D	Alternative E	Alternative F	Alternative G
Roads						
Public safety	Route safety concerns relatively low.	No change.				
Deferred maintenance needs (cost)	\$5,169,689	\$5,130,016	\$4,791,394	\$4,616,603	\$4,889,869	\$4,880,903
Recreation						
Miles of roads open to the public for motorized uses	4,573	4,234	2,943	2,290	3,329	3,300
Miles of motorized trails open to the public (less than 50 inches in width and single-track)	16	204	124	1.6	178	178
Motorized trail maintenance and opportunities (cost)	\$14,220	\$183,060	\$111,150	\$1,350	\$160,020	\$160,020
Miles of motorized routes within 300 feet of eligible wild and scenic rivers	6.0	6.0	5.4	5.4	6.0	6.0
Total number of intermittent and perennial road crossings within eligible wild and scenic rivers	24	24	23	23	24	24
Number of crossings by motorized routes across the Continental Divide National Scenic Trail	73	70	53	41	59	59
Inventoried Roadless Areas						
Miles of roads open to the public for motorized uses within IRAs	362.1	296.7	198.1	156.4	226.4	223.3
Miles of motorized trails (less than 50 inches in width and single-track motorcycles) open to the public within IRAs	4.5	52.4	9.0	0.0	20.9	22.3

Resource	Alternative B	Alternative C	Alternative D	Alternative E	Alternative F	Alternative G
Hell Hole Wilderness Study Area						
Motorized routes – miles of roads open to the public for motorized uses within Hell Hole WSA	10.4	5.4	2.1	3.7	1.8	4.1
MDC – miles / acres of MDC corridors within Lower San Francisco WSA	n/a / 19,540	1.4 / 114	0.2 / 21.7	0.0 / 0.0	0.3 / 29.0	0.2 / 21.7
MBGR – miles / acres of MBGR corridors within Lower San Francisco WSA	n/a / 19,540	5.77 / 9,777	0.2 / 21.7	0.0 / 0.0	2.1 / 3,819	0.2 / 21.7
Lower San Francisco Wilderness Study Area						
Motorized routes – miles of roads open to the public for motorized uses within Lower San Francisco WSA	8.2	8.0	0.7	0.0	8.0	0.4
MDC – miles / acres of MDC corridors within Lower San Francisco WSA	n/a / 4,144	8.1 / 580	0.0 / 0.27	0.0 / 0.0	0.5 / 37.7	0.0 / 0.27
MBGR – miles / acres of MBGR corridors within Lower San Francisco WSA	n/a / 4,144	8.1 / 4,063	0.0 / 0.27	0.0 / 0.0	8.1 / 3,329	0.0 / 0.27
Air Quality						
Acres (percent change from Alt. B) of motorized routes with potential to contribute to fugitive dust and add to visibility impairment:						
Forestwide	6,918	9,899 (~0%)	5,240 (-24%)	4,219 (-39%)	5,789 (-16%)	5,746 (-17%)
Gila Wilderness Class I Airshed	250	245 (-2%)	203 (-19%)	175 (-30%)	221 (-12%)	221 (-12%)
Aldo Leopold Wilderness Class II Airshed	126	123 (-2%)	96 (-24%)	84 (-33%)	113 (-10%)	113 (-10%)
Blue Range Wilderness Class II Airshed	31	36 (16%)	36 (16%)	30 (-3%)	35 (13%)	36 (16%)

Resource	Alternative B	Alternative C	Alternative D	Alternative E	Alternative F	Alternative G
Soils with Moderate or Severe Erosion Hazard Ratings						
Motorized routes (acres)	2,468	2,504	1,829	1,443	2,099	2,076
MBGR (potential acres)	1,210,241	950,931	28,200	0	605,485	29,914
MDC (potential acres)	1,210,241	34,241	28,200	0	32,442	29,914
Parking (potential acres)	1,210,241	18,712	12,748	10,106	14,724	14,511
Areas (acres)	1,210,241	12	0	0	12	12
Soils with Unsatisfactory or Unsuitable Condition Ratings						
Motorized routes (acres)	2,870	2,874	2,282	1,908	2,428	2,403
MBGR (potential acres)	1,161,775	949,094	35,327	0	679,407	39,625
MDC (potential acres)	1,161,775	46,981	35,327	0	43,130	39,625
Parking (potential acres)	1,161,775	23,290	17,474	15,277	18,856	18,658
Areas (acres)	1,161,775	9	0	0	9	9
Riparian Areas						
Motorized routes – acres of disturbance	443	441	330	273	382	374
MDC – acres of potential disturbance	31,581	4,357	3,334	0	3,828	3,568
MBGR – acres of potential disturbance	31,581	27,356	3,334	0	20,565	3,568
Areas – acres of potential disturbance	31,581	0	0	0	0	0
Wetlands/Wet Meadows						
Motorized routes – acres of disturbance	18	17	13	10	14	14
MDC – acres of potential disturbance	1,568	296	239	0	293	265
MBGR – acres of potential disturbance	1,568	1,561	239	0	1,485	265
Areas – acres of potential disturbance	1,568	0	0	0	0	0

Resource	Alternative B	Alternative C	Alternative D	Alternative E	Alternative F	Alternative G
Water Quality						
Number of motorized road/trail stream crossings on perennial, intermittent, and ephemeral channels	8,847	9,088	6,526	4,971	7,516	7,424
Number of motorized road/trail stream crossings on impaired waterbodies	187	165	144	139	148	148
Motorized routes – miles of perennial / intermittent streams within 300 feet of open routes	295	293	297	163	247	240
Motorized routes – miles of ephemeral drainages within 300 feet of open routes	1,771	1,785	1,346	1,069	1,502	1,493
Motorized routes – miles of impaired (303d) streams within 300 feet of open routes	47	43	37	35	38	38
Motorized routes – miles of Outstanding National Resource Waters (ONRW) streams within 300 feet of open routes	0.17	0.05	0.00	0.00	0.05	0.05
Motorized routes – miles of motorized routes within 300 feet of ONRW wetlands	0.75	0.69	0.69	0.69	0.69	0.69
MDC – miles of perennial / intermittent streams within MDC corridors	886	63	32	0	50	42
MDC – miles of ephemeral drainages within MDC corridors	9,410	582	445	0	555	512
MDC – miles of impaired (303d) streams within MDC corridors	132	6	4	0	5	6
MDC – acres of MDC corridors within 300 feet of ONRW streams	91	0	0	0	0	0
MDC – acres of MDC corridors within 300 feet of ONRW wetlands	96	0	0	0	0	0

Resource	Alternative B	Alternative C	Alternative D	Alternative E	Alternative F	Alternative G
MBGR – miles of perennial / intermittent streams within MBGR corridors	886	688	32	0	476	42
MBGR – miles of ephemeral drainages within MBGR corridors	9,410	7,996	445	0	5,872	512
MBGR – miles of impaired (303d) streams within MBGR corridors	132	107	4	0	69	6
MBGR – acres of MBGR corridors within 300 feet of ONRW streams	70	67	0	0	28	0
MBGR – acres of MBGR corridors within 300 feet of ONRW wetlands	96	38	0	0	21	0
Areas – miles of perennial / intermittent streams within 300 feet of motorized areas	886	0.03	0	0	0.03	0.03
Areas – miles of ephemeral drainages within 300 feet of motorized areas	9,410	1.86	0	0	1.67	1.67
Areas – miles of impaired (303d) streams within 300 feet of motorized areas	132	0.14	0	0	0.14	0.14
Areas – acres of motorized areas within 300 feet of ONRW streams	0	0	0	0	0	0
Areas – acres of motorized areas within 300 feet of ONRW wetlands	0	0	0	0	0	0
Aquatic Species and Habitat						
Miles of motorized routes within 300 feet of perennial, intermittent, and ephemeral streams and rivers	302	302	209	163	246	242
Total number of intermittent and perennial road crossings	967	882	631	489	805	788

Resource	Alternative B	Alternative C	Alternative D	Alternative E	Alternative F	Alternative G
Total number of ephemeral road crossings	7,880	8,206	5,895	4,482	6,711	6,636
Miles of routes within 300 feet of impaired streams with off-road vehicles or highway/road/ bridge as probable sources of impairment	27.5	26.1	19.7	20.0	21.5	21.5
Miles of motorized routes within 300 feet of loach minnow designated critical habitat	28	27	18	17	26	19
Number of stream crossings within loach minnow designated critical habitat	89	87	53	53	57	54
Miles of motorized routes within 300 feet of spikedace designated critical habitat	26	26	18	17	25	18
Number of stream crossings within spikedace designated critical habitat	85	80	46	46	80	47
Miles of motorized routes within 300 feet of <i>Gila chub</i> designated critical habitat	3	3	2	2	2	2
Number of stream crossings within <i>Gila chub</i> designated critical habitat	4	4	3	2	3	3
Miles of motorized routes within 300 feet of <i>Chihuahua chub</i> occupied habitat	2	1	1	1	1	1
Number of stream crossings within <i>Chihuahua chub</i> occupied habitat	15	0	0	0	0	0
Miles of motorized routes within 300 feet of <i>Gila trout</i> occupied habitat	1.29	1.29	1.29	1.22	1.29	1.29
Number of stream crossings within <i>Gila trout</i> occupied habitat	3	3	3	3	3	3

Resource	Alternative B	Alternative C	Alternative D	Alternative E	Alternative F	Alternative G
Wildlife Habitat						
Chiricahua Leopard Frog – Reasonable Dispersal Areas						
Motorized routes – Miles (percent change) of motorized routes within dispersal areas	82	81 (-1%)	70 (-14%)	46 (-43%)	75 (-9%)	78 (-5%)
Motorized routes – Number of stream crossings (percent change) within dispersal areas	76	75 (-1%)	54 (-29%)	33 (-57%)	58 (-24%)	74 (-3%)
MDC – Change in acres (percent change) of MDC corridors within dispersal areas	43,600	-42,102 (-97%)	-42,517 (-98%)	-43,600 (-100%)	-42,224 (-97%)	-42,185 (-97%)
MBGR – Change in acres (percent change) of MBGR corridors within dispersal areas	43,600	-5,489 (-13%)	-42,517 (-98%)	-43,600 (-100%)	-18,499 (-42%)	-42,185 (-97%)
Areas – Acres of motorized areas within dispersal areas	0	0	0	0	0	0
Chiricahua Leopard Frog – Designated Critical Habitat						
Motorized routes – Miles (percent change) of motorized routes within designated critical habitat	5.2	5.2 (0%)	4.8 (-7%)	3.9 (-24%)	4.8 (-7%)	4.8 (-7%)
Motorized routes – Number of stream crossings (percent change) within designated critical habitat	22	22 (0%)	22 (0%)	21 (-5%)	22 (0%)	22 (0%)
MDC – Change in acres (percent change) of MDC corridors within designated critical habitat	1,873	-1,849 (-99%)	-1,868 (-99%)	-1,873 (-100%)	-1,862 (-99%)	-1,849 (-99%)
MBGR – Change in acres (percent change) of MBGR corridors within designated critical habitat	1,873	-227 (-12%)	-1,868 (-99%)	-1,873 (-100%)	-951 (-51%)	-1,849 (-99%)
Areas – Acres of motorized areas within designated critical habitat	0	0	0	0	0	0

Resource	Alternative B	Alternative C	Alternative D	Alternative E	Alternative F	Alternative G
Mexican Spotted Owl – Protected Activity Centers (PACs)						
Motorized routes – Miles (percent change) of motorized routes within PACs	245	252 (3%)	128 (-48%)	80 (-67%)	184 (-25%)	182 (-26%)
MDC – Change in acres (percent change) of MDC corridors within PACs	132,729	-128,782 (-97%)	-131,184 (-99%)	-132,729 (-100%)	-129,261 (-97%)	-130,158 (-98%)
MBGR – Change in acres (percent change) of MBGR corridors within PACs	132,729	-16,388 (-12%)	-131,184 (-99%)	-132,729 (-100%)	-49,901 (-38%)	-130,158 (-98%)
Areas – Acres of motorized areas within PACS	0	0	0	0	0	0
Mexican Spotted Owl – Designated Critical Habitat						
Motorized routes – Miles (percent change) of motorized routes within designated critical habitat	1,310	1,347 (3%)	880 (-33%)	569 (-57%)	1,047 (-20%)	1,043 (-20%)
MDC – Change in acres (percent change) of MDC corridors within designated critical habitat	604,771	-577,378 (-95%)	-584,604 (-97%)	-604,771 (-100%)	-578,283 (-96%)	-580,834 (-96%)
MBGR – Change in acres (percent change) of MBGR corridors within designated critical habitat	604,771	-77,797 (-13%)	-584,604 (-97%)	-604,771 (-100%)	-220,107 (-36%)	-580,834 (-96%)
Areas – Acres of motorized areas within designated critical habitat	1.2	0	-1.2	-1.2	0	0
Southwest Willow Flycatcher – Occupied Areas						
Motorized routes – Miles (percent change) of motorized routes within occupied areas	0.73	0.73 (0%)	0.73 (0%)	0.73 (0%)	0.73 (0%)	0.73 (0%)
MDC – Change in acres (percent change) of MDC corridors within occupied areas	62	-58 (-93%)	-58 (-93%)	-62 (-100%)	-58 (-93%)	-58 (-93%)

Resource	Alternative B	Alternative C	Alternative D	Alternative E	Alternative F	Alternative G
MBGR – Change in acres (percent change) of MBGR corridors within occupied areas	62	0 (0%)	-58 (-93%)	-62 (-100%)	0 (0%)	-58 (-93%)
Areas – Acres of motorized areas within occupied areas	0	0	0	0	0	0
Southwest Willow Flycatcher – Designated Critical Habitat						
Motorized routes – Miles (percent change) of motorized routes within designated critical habitat	3.0	3.1 (3%)	2.6 (-13%)	2.4 (-20%)	2.6 (-13%)	2.6 (-13%)
MDC – Change in acres (percent change) of MDC corridors within designated critical habitat	949	-895 (-94%)	-896 (-94%)	-949 (-100%)	-896 (-94%)	-896 (-94%)
MBGR – Change in acres (percent change) of MBGR corridors within designated critical habitat	949	-65 (-7%)	-896 (-94%)	-949 (-100%)	-241 (-25%)	-896 (-94%)
Areas – Acres of motorized areas within designated critical habitat	0	0	0	0	0	0
Mexican Gray Wolf						
Motorized routes - Change in average road density-miles/sq miles (percent change) within watersheds	0.98	0.03 (3%)	-0.26 (-26%)	-0.43 (-44%)	-0.19 (-19%)	-0.19 (-20%)
MDC – Change in average acres (percent change) of MDC corridors within watersheds	49,864	-47,656 (-96%)	-48,141 (-97%)	-49,864 (-100%)	-47,784 (-96%)	-47,945 (-96%)
MBGR – Change in average acres (percent change) of MBGR corridors within watersheds	49,864	-7,443 (-15%)	-48,141 (-97%)	-49,864 (-100%)	-19,118 (-38%)	-47,945 (-96%)
Areas – Change in average acres (percent change) of motorized areas within watersheds	27	0 (0%)	-27 (-100%)	-27 (-100%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)

Resource	Alternative B	Alternative C	Alternative D	Alternative E	Alternative F	Alternative G
Sensitive Plant Species						
Acres of potential disturbance of known sensitive plan locations from MBGR / MDC						
Heartleaf groundsel	0.23 / 0.23	0.23 / 0.0	0.0 / 0.0	0.0 / 0.0	0.23 / 0.0	0.0 / 0.0
Blumer's dock	0.45 / 0.45	0.45 / 0.0	0.0 / 0.0	0.0 / 0.0	0.45 / 0.0	0.0 / 0.0
Davidson's cliff carrot	0.23 / 0.23	0.23 / 0.0	0.0 / 0.0	0.0 / 0.0	0.23 / 0.0	0.0 / 0.0
Gila thistle	0.08 / 0.08	0.08 / 0.0	0.0 / 0.0	0.0 / 0.0	0.08 / 0.0	0.0 / 0.0
Goodding's onion	18.02 / 18.02	17.72 / 0.21	0.08 / 0.08	0.0 / 0.0	13.83 / 0.21	0.21 / 0.21
Villous groundcover milkvetch	0.08 / 0.08	0.0 / 0.0	0.0 / 0.0	0.0 / 0.0	0.0 / 0.0	0.0 / 0.0
Metcalf's penstemon	0.40 / 0.40	0.08 / 0.0	0.0 / 0.0	0.0 / 0.0	0.0 / 0.0	0.0 / 0.0
Rusby hawkweed	0.08 / 0.08	0.08 / 0.0	0.0 / 0.0	0.0 / 0.0	0.08 / 0.0	0.0 / 0.0
Mimbres figwort	1.67 / 1.67	1.44 / 0.0	0.0 / 0.0	0.0 / 0.0	1.44 / 0.0	0.0 / 0.0
Pinos Altos flame flower	3.87 / 3.87	3.80 / 0.0	0.0 / 0.0	0.0 / 0.0	3.65 / 0.0	0.0 / 0.0
Porsild's starwort	0.53 / 0.53	0.49 / 0.21	0.21 / 0.21	0.0 / 0.0	0.45 / 0.21	0.21 / 0.21
Mogollon clover	1.89 / 1.89	1.85 / 0.25	0.25 / 0.25	0.0 / 0.0	1.59 / 0.25	0.25 / 0.25
Wooton's hawthorn	1.60 / 1.60	1.60 / 0.0	0.0 / 0.0	0.0 / 0.0	1.60 / 0.0	0.0 / 0.0
Wright's dogweed	0.23 / 0.23	0.23 / 0.23	0.23 / 0.23	0.0 / 0.0	0.23 / 0.23	0.23 / 0.23
Invasive Species						
Amount of potential risk of introduction, establishment and spread of invasive species	Highest level of potential risk of introduction, establishment and spread	Highest potential risk of introduction, establishment and spread amongst the action alternatives because of 1 mile MBGR corridor	Least potential risk of introduction, establishment and spread amongst all action alternatives except alternative E	Greatest decrease in the potential risk of introduction, establishment and spread because no MDC or MBGR corridors, no areas, and greatest	High potential risk, but less than alternative B and C due to less road miles and ½ mile MBGR corridor. But greater than G due to ½ mile MBGR corridor.	Similar potential risk as alternative F for motorized routes, 4 corridors and areas. But is less due to MBGR corridors being

Resource	Alternative B	Alternative C	Alternative D	Alternative E	Alternative F	Alternative G
				reduction of route miles		limited to the same MDC corridors
Cultural Resources						
Motorized routes - Change in number of sites (percent change) within newly proposed motorized routes	5,346	49 (-99.1%)	27 (-99.5%)	6 (-99.9%)	33 (-99.4%)	34 (-99.4%)
MDC – Change in number of sites (percent change) within MDC corridors	5,346	983 (-82%)	657 (-88%)	0 (-100%)	844 (-84%)	755 (-86%)
MBGR – Change in number of sites (percent change) within MBGR corridors	5,346	5,181 (-3%)	657 (-88%)	0 (-100%)	4,721 (-12%)	755 (-86%)
Areas –Number of sites within motorized areas	5,346	1	0	0	1	1
Social and Economic						
Jobs related to motorized recreation activities	73-138	68-128	47-89	37-69	53-101	53-100
Labor income from motorized recreation activities	\$1,532,501 - \$2,884,365	\$1,419,096 - \$2,670,922	\$988,463 - \$1,860,415	\$769,316 - \$1,447,951	\$1,117,193 - \$2,102,702	\$1,107,998 - \$2,085,396