

Nantahala and Pisgah NFs Plan Revision Scoping Comments: March 12, 2014 - April 28, 2014

A total of 199 individual emails/letters were received during the scoping period for plan revision. Ninety-four percent of input was received electronically (62% of which came in through the Comment and Analysis Response Application – CARA). All letters received during the scoping period have been posted online at: <https://cara.ecosystem-management.org/Public//ReadingRoom?Project=43545>.

All comments were coded as of May 12, 2014, resulting in a total of 1,163 individual comments.

Comments were submitted by federal, state, county and local governments and agencies, non-profit organizations, and interested publics.

	# of letters
Federal Agency/Elected Official	4
State Government	7
County Government	8
Municipality	2
Individuals	178

The majority of people commenting were interested in more active management of the forest, particularly for the management of wildlife species. There was overwhelming concern from hunters that they were not fairly recognized in the Preliminary Need for Change document. While we did receive a few very specific proposals for designated areas (see below), there was generally very little support for new designations in the revised forest plan.

Comments addressed a diversity of topics, with the most comments on wildlife habitat, timber management, vegetation management, recreation (including trails), fire and fuels, economic contributions of the forest, designated areas, water, and roads. See Report 2: Coding Structure Report for a breakdown of how comments were coded.

- Two organized collaboratives that submitted letters were the Nantahala and Pisgah Forest Partnership and the Nantahala and Pisgah NF Restoration Collaborative. The Partnership had not reached agreement on consolidated comments to submit at this time. The Restoration Collaborative comments were organized primarily around the group's six restoration focus areas.
- The Southern Environmental Law Center submitted comments on behalf of The Wilderness Society, Western North Carolina Alliance, and Wild South. While they addressed all 41 items in the need for change, much of the emphasis of their comments was on the natural range of variation.
- The Nature Conservancy submitted a detailed proposal for Management and Restoration in Priority Core Forests which identifies 30 blocks of forest.
- The NC Natural Heritage Program submitted a proposal for 36 new special interest areas.
- We received several comments from minerals and geology organizations urging recognition of 1) geologic hazards and risks to public safety, 2) mineral resources, and 3) the geologic resources and geologic framework of ecosystems of the Nantahala and Pisgah NFs. Comments received from the general public regarding minerals tended towards establishing further restrictions for leasing.
- We received one request for an extension to the scoping period.

Report 1. List of Agencies and Organizations that Submitted Comments

Letter Number	Name	Organization Name
42	Hennessy, Rita	National Park Service
102	Meinert, Larry	U.S. Geological Survey, Minerals Resources Program
36	Meadows, Mark	US Congress
191	Davis, Jim	NC Senate
129	Fowler, Dick	NC Association of Soil and Water Conservation Districts
185	Waggett, Chrissy	NC Department of Agriculture
146	Whitmire, Chris	NC House of Representatives
193	Wooten, Rick	North Carolina Dept. of Environment and Natural Resources
100	Boyette, Jay	North Carolina Farm Bureau Federation
356	Apodaca, Tom	North Carolina General Assembly
352	Reid, Jeffrey	North Carolina Geological Survey - Division of Energy, Mineral, and Land Resources
108	Buchanan, Misty	North Carolina Natural Heritage Program
37	Besler, Doug	North Carolina Wildlife Resources Commission
358	Wood, Edgar	Cherokee County Soil & Water Conservation District
19	Cable, Greg	Graham County
87	Smart, Don	Haywood County Farm Bureau Board of Directors
139	Dove, Ira	Haywood County, NC
41	Yarborough, Bill	Haywood Soil and Water Conservation District
49	Ferguson, Carlyle	Haywood Soil and Water Conservation District
357	Brannon, Andrew	Henderson County Soil & Water Conservation District
182	Ross, Tyler	McDowell County Soil and Water Conservation District
51	Lemkes, Bert	Town of Mills River
98	Laughter, Jaime	Town of Mills River
89	McCombs, Erin	American Rivers
86	Jenkins, Marcia	NC Sierra Club
192	Gerken, DJ	Southern Environmental Law Center
194	Sutton, Megan	The Nature Conservancy
111	McGarvey, James	Backcountry Horsemen Of America
65	Peters, Gary	National Wild Turkey Federation

Letter Number	Name	Organization Name
8	Kidd, Jim	Ruffed Grouse Society
15	Frazier, Scott	Ruffed Grouse Society
32	Buchanan, Josh	Ruffed Grouse Society
67	Mallicoat, Don	Ruffed Grouse Society
99	Stewart, Andrew	Ruffed Grouse Society
104	Stewart, Andrea	Ruffed Grouse Society
140	Storm, Gary	Ruffed Grouse Society, Eastern NC Chapter
11	Robbins, Kurt	Ruffed Grouse Society-Appalachian Highlands Chapter
128	Ordiway, Linda	Ruffed Grouse Society-Appalachian Highlands Chapter
16	Robbins, Shon	Quail Forever
184	Ross, Tyler	Quality Deer Management Associations
88	Anon, Erik Murdock	Access Fund
175	Murdock, Erik	Access Fund
94	Boland, Maeve	American Geosciences Institute
81	Colburn, Kevin	American Whitewater
58	Lightsey, Deirdre	Back Country Horsemen of NC
151	Cerulli, Tovar	Backcountry Hunters & Anglers
130	Harris, Coleman	Barnhill/Balfour Beatty Joint Venture
106	Crotts, Sue	Blue Ridge Environmental Defense League
84	Hobson, Jack	Brown Trout Fly Fishing LLC
12	Desjardins, Tish	Carolina Mountain Club
17	Kyle, Kathy	Carolina Mountain Club
50	Hartzler, Ruth	Carolina Mountain Club
64	White, Kasey	Geological Society of America
363	Whitmire, David	Headwaters Outfitters
90	Reed, Ernie	Heartwood
113	Lightsey, Deirdre	Nantahala Pisgah Forest Partnership
45	Francis, Judy	Nantahala Pisgah NF Restoration Collaborative
114	Spruill, Richard	National Association Of State Boards of Geology
97	Hastings, Cara	Natural Resources
181	Gestwicki, Tim	NC Wildlife Federation

Letter Number	Name	Organization Name
52	Smith, Andy	North Carolina Bowhunters Association
26	Oslund, Barbara	North Carolina Horse Council
56	Oslund, Barbara	North Carolina Horse Council
115	Stahlschmidt, Paul	Northwest NC MTB Alliance
72	Strout, Chris	Pisgah Area SORBA
14	O'Nan, Elizabeth	Protect All Children's Environment
24	Dick, Arthur	Quality Deer Management Associations
22	Adams, Kip	Quality Deer Management Associations
23	Mulcahy, Patrick	Quality Deer Management Associations
39	Buchanan, Jimmy	Quality Deer Management Associations
46	Phillips, Jim	Quality Deer Management Associations

Report 2: Coding Structure Report (Generated by Comment Analysis and Response Application – CARA)

Code #	Code Name	Comment Count
Issue/Action		
103	Education/Interpretation	20
104	biomass	5
110	Decision Process	3
110.0603	Adaptive Mgmt	3
111	Public Involvement	4
111.02	Collaboration, Meetings	8
112	Agency Organization	9
112.01	Funding, General	21
112.02	Staffing	1
112.03	Outsourcing, Contracting	14
120	Proposed Action, Decision	29
130	Resource & Area Mgmt	117
130.01	Monitoring	15

Code #	Code Name	Comment Count
Issue/Action		
130.02	Inventories, Mapping, GIS	19
132	Water, Watershed Mgmt	82
133	Air and Climate	24
134	Soils Mgmt	27
135	Minerals & Geology Mgmt	59
136	Fire and Fuels Mgmt	94
141	Vegetation Mgmt	152
142	Timber Mgmt	158
143	Wildlife/Animals Mgmt	248
149	Other Activities Mgmt	2
149.01	Utility Corridors, Facilities	5
149.04	Hydroelectric	1
149.07	Special Forest Prod. Collection	5
150	Trans. Sys. Mgmt (& non-rec. access)	22
151	Roads Management	27
152	Trails Management	62
160	Recreation Mgmt	40
160.04	Visual Resource Mgmt	40
161	Recreation Use Permits	2
162	Recreational Access	16
164	Motorized Recreation Mgmt	2
165	Dispersed Recreation Mgmt	12
165.01	Hiking, Backpacking	6
165.02	Dispersed Camping	1
165.03	Hunting, Shooting	56

Code #	Code Name	Comment Count
Issue/Action		
165.04	Fishing	28
165.05	Equestrian/Pack Animals	7
165.06	Bicycling	5
165.07	Canoeing, Kayaking, Rafting	4
165.09	Rec. in Wilderness, Roadless, etc.	4
165.10	rockhounding	2
165.11	rock climbing	9
170	Land Ownership, Uses	26
170.01	Special Use Authorizations	6
171	Land Designations/Mgmt	33
171.01	Roadless Areas	14
171.02	Designated Wilderness Areas	26
171.03	Wilderness Study, Recommend.	8
171.05	Research Natural Areas/ACECs	2
171.06	Scenic Roads & Trails	2
171.07	Wild and Scenic Rivers	8
171.08	other designated areas	92
171.09	wilderness inventory	59
181	Econ. Actions, Analyses	93
182	Social Actions or Analyses	3
182.01	Cultural, Hist., Anthro. Mgmt	9