

Appendix I: Comparison of Alternatives by Objective

Comparison of Alternatives by Objective	Alt A	Alt B	Alt C	Alt D	Alt E
Physical Resources Program					
OBJ1. Achieve load reduction targets for upland forest and SEZs identified in the Lake Tahoe TMDL during the life of the plan.	X	X	X	X	X
OBJ2. Implement effective BMPs to achieve 95% implementation and effectiveness ratings forest-wide in BMP assessments annually, as determined by the Pacific Southwest Region’s Best Management Practices Effectiveness Program.	X	X	X	X	X
OBJ3. Maintain up to date inventory of water rights and uses on NFS lands, and meet state requirements for maintaining water rights.	X	X	X	X	X
OBJ4. Implement actions to restore geomorphic and habitat function to Reach 5 of the Upper Truckee River and Angora Creek within the Angora fire area by approximately 2016.	X	X	X	X	X
Forest Vegetation, Fuels and Fire Management Program					
OBJ5. Reduce surface, ladder and canopy fuels through thinning and fuel reduction treatments on 2,000 acres per year in the WUI.	X	X	X	X	X
OBJ6. Prescribed burning of surface fuels in the WUI occur on 1,800 acres per year when possible.	X	X			X
OBJ6. Prescribed burning of surface fuels in the WUI occur on 2,100 acres per year when possible.			X	X	
White fir – mixed conifer					
OBJ7. Create openings to shift approximately 50 acres of mid-seral white fir – mixed conifer type to early-seral each year over the latter 10 years of plan implementation (beginning 5 years after this Plan goes into effect).	X	X		X	X
OBJ7. Create openings to shift approximately 100 acres of mid-seral white fir – mixed conifer type to early-seral each year between 2019 and 2029.			X		
OBJ8. In stands historically dominated by pines, convert white fir-mixed conifer type generally in the early or mid-seral stages to Jeffrey pine by approximately 50 acres per year between 2019 and 2029. Retain pines during conversion treatments.	X	X		X	X
OBJ8. In stands historically dominated by pines, convert white fir-mixed conifer type generally in the early or mid-seral stages to Jeffrey pine by approximately 100 acres per year between 2019 and 2029. Retain pines during conversion treatments.			X		

Comparison of Alternatives by Objective	Alt A	Alt B	Alt C	Alt D	Alt E
OBJ9. Thin approximately 200 acres of white fir-mixed conifer each year between 2019 and 2029 to improve resiliency and reduce susceptibility to insects, disease, and drought.	X	X			X
OBJ9. Thin approximately 400 acres of white fir-mixed conifer each year between 2019 and 2029 to improve resiliency and reduce susceptibility to insects, disease, and drought.			X		
OBJ9. Thin approximately 120 acres of white fir-mixed conifer each year between 2019 and 2029 to improve resiliency and reduce susceptibility to insects, disease, and drought.				X	
Jeffrey pine					
OBJ10. From the mid-seral stages create approximately 40 acres of openings to early-seral Jeffrey pine each year between 2019 and 2029, and maintain it as the dominant species. Employ techniques to release early seral pine from competing vegetation if necessary. Post-disturbance event treatments will be used as opportunities to regenerate early seral Jeffrey pine. This objective may be accomplished in coordination with white fir – mixed conifer conversion objective, above.	X	X		X	X
OBJ10. From the mid-seral stages create approximately 80 acres of openings to early-seral Jeffrey pine each year between 2019 and 2029, and maintain it as the dominant species. Employ techniques to release early seral pine from competing vegetation if necessary. Post-disturbance event treatments will be used as opportunities to regenerate early seral Jeffrey pine. This objective may be accomplished in coordination with white fir – mixed conifer conversion objective, above.			X		
OBJ11. Thin approximately 250 acres of Jeffrey pine each year between 2019 and 2029 to improve resiliency and reduce susceptibility to insects, disease, and drought.	X	X			X
OBJ11. Thin approximately 500 acres of Jeffrey pine each year between 2019 and 2029 to improve resiliency and reduce susceptibility to insects, disease, and drought.			X		
OBJ11. Thin approximately 150 acres of Jeffrey pine each year between 2019 and 2029 to improve resiliency and reduce susceptibility to insects, disease, and drought.				X	
Red fir					
OBJ12. Create approximately 10 acres of openings in the mid-seral stages to shift stands to early-seral red fir type each year between 2019 and 2029. Utilize opportunities for treatment after disturbance events.	X	X		X	X

Comparison of Alternatives by Objective	Alt A	Alt B	Alt C	Alt D	Alt E
OBJ12. Create approximately 20 acres of openings in the mid-seral stages to shift stands to early-seral red fir type each year between 2019 and 2029. Utilize opportunities for treatment after disturbance events.			X		
OBJ13. Thin approximately 50 acres of red fir each year between 2019 and 2029 to improve resiliency and reduce susceptibility to insects, disease, and drought.	X	X			X
OBJ13. Thin approximately 100 acres of red fir each year between 2019 and 2029 to improve resiliency and reduce susceptibility to insects, disease, and drought.			X		
OBJ13. Thin approximately 30 acres of red fir each year between 2019 and 2029 to improve resiliency and reduce susceptibility to insects, disease, and drought.				X	
Aspen					
OBJ14. Restore or stimulate regeneration of at least 25 acres of aspen per year.	X	X		X	X
OBJ14. Restore or stimulate regeneration of at least 50 acres of aspen per year.			X		
Biological Resources Program					
Conservation of Habitat and Species Diversity					
OBJ15. Restore a minimum of two fens that are assessed to be at risk of conversion to meadow, based on fen inventory and ranking assessment (California Native Plant Society and LTBMU data) by 2029.	X	X	X		X
OBJ16. Restore stream segments with degraded habitat in a minimum of 2 streams using natural channel design methods/techniques to design elements such as large wood and pools in aquatic habitats to maintain or improve biological processes (e.g., expansion of native species populations), biological characteristics (e.g., species composition), physical processes (e.g., erosion and aggradation), and physical characteristics (e.g., channel and over-bank flows) by 2029. This will provide important aquatic habitat needed to support all life history processes.	X	X	X		X
OBJ17. By 2019, identify degraded aquatic habitat that historically supported native aquatic species. Restore a minimum of two sites to support self-sustaining aquatic populations by 2029.	X	X	X		X
OBJ 18. By 2029, maintain or increase vegetation cover in meadows where LTBMU data shows that cover is insufficient.	X	X	X	X	X
OBJ19. Identify cave, cave surrogate, and/or cliff sites that are important to the survival, migration, reproduction, and dispersal of dependent species where removal of human impacts will improve species success. Remove human impacts at a minimum of one site identified, by 2029.	X	X	X		X

Comparison of Alternatives by Objective	Alt A	Alt B	Alt C	Alt D	Alt E
OBJ20. Restore a minimum of three willow flycatcher nesting habitats in historic and currently occupied habitats by 2029.	X	X	X		X
OBJ21. Complete the Aquatic Organism Passage (AOP) action plan to identify management opportunities for improving aquatic connectivity by 2016.	X	X	X	X	X
OBJ22. Improve 5 high priority AOP barriers by 2029, based on AOP management and monitoring plan.	X	X	X	X	X
OBJ23. Develop a conservation assessment for Tahoe and Cup Lake draba (<i>Draba asterophora</i> var. <i>asterophora</i> , <i>D.a.</i> var. <i>macrocarpa</i>) by 2019.	X	X	X	X	X
Invasive Habitats and Species (Aquatic and Terrestrial)					
OBJ24. Screen hand-carried/non-motorized watercraft are screened or show proof of boat inspection or decontamination at all staffed developed recreation sites (campgrounds, day use areas, resorts) check-in points (i.e. kiosks), by 2016.	X	X	X	X	X
Protected Activity Centers (PACs) and Home Range Core Areas (HRCAs)					
OBJ25. Restore six California spotted owl PACs (representing approximately 30 percent of the known territories in the Lake Tahoe Basin) by 2029; treatments would be designed based on restoration needs of the specific PAC.		X	X		X
OBJ26. Restore seven northern goshawk PACS (representing approximately 30 percent of the known territories in the Lake Tahoe Basin) by 2029; treatments would be designed based on restoration needs of the specific PAC.		X	X		X
Lahontan cutthroat trout					
OBJ27. Establish at least one self-sustaining Lahontan cutthroat trout sub-population in Fallen Leaf Lake, and implement appropriate conservation measures in Glen Alpine Creek in cooperation with the Lake Tahoe Basin Recovery Implementation Team by 2029.	X	X	X	X	
OBJ28. Secure the existing Upper Truckee River (Meiss Meadows) Lahontan cutthroat trout sub-population (four miles of stream habitat) through maintenance removal of brook trout by 2016.	X	X	X	X	
OBJ29. Reestablish Lahontan cutthroat trout in ten stream miles of the Upper Truckee River (from Meiss Meadows to the southern extent of Christmas Valley), in cooperation with California Department of Fish and Game by 2029.	X	X	X	X	X
OBJ30. Identify five recovery locations. Initiate recovery of two subpopulations of LCT within fluvial and/or lacustrine ecosystems, as identified by the Tahoe Basin LCT Recovery Implementation team by 2029.	X	X	X	X	X

Comparison of Alternatives by Objective	Alt A	Alt B	Alt C	Alt D	Alt E
OBJ31. Collaborate with California Department of Fish and Game, US Fish and Wildlife Service, and Eldorado National Forest to identify and restore additional suitable habitat for yellow-legged frog as deemed appropriate. Complete restoration of seven high alpine lakes (composed of habitat areas that would support four sub-populations) adjacent to current yellow-legged frog populations in the Desolation wilderness by removing introduced trout species by 2029.	X	X	X	X	X
OBJ32. Conduct physical habitat maintenance or enhancement that promotes long-term water availability and structural conditions to create areas for basking and/or cover, for the Hellhole yellow-legged for sub-population, by 2029	X	X	X	X	X
OBJ33. By 2029, maintain or expand fishless high elevation aquatic habitats near existing or historic SNYLF sub-populations where such habitats are determined to support yellow-legged frog production and development and these actions will increase localized range of SNYLF.	X	X	X	X	X
OBJ31. Collaborate with California Department of Fish and Game, US Fish and Wildlife Service, and Eldorado National Forest to identify and restore additional suitable habitat for yellow-legged frog as deemed appropriate. Complete restoration of seven high alpine lakes (composed of habitat areas that would support four sub-populations) adjacent to current yellow-legged frog populations in the Desolation wilderness by removing introduced trout species by 2029.	X	X	X	X	X
Recreation Program					
OBJ34. Evaluate visitor satisfaction and user trends by completing the National Visitor Use Monitoring Survey every 5 years.	X	X	X	X	X
Cultural Resources Program					
OBJ35. Nominate for listing to the National Register of Historic Places - the Comstock Historic Logging District, Angora Lookout, Cave Rock, Hawley Grade, Camp Richardson Resort, Meiss Cabin and Barn, and Skunk Harbor on the National Register of Historic Places by 2029.	X	X	X	X	X
OBJ36. By 2019, develop a management plan for arborglyphs throughout the Lake Tahoe Basin.	X	X	X	X	X
OBJ37. Add new interpretive elements (i.e. signs, boards, graphics, or new publicly-available printed materials) highlighting historic or cultural areas not yet interpreted in the Lake Tahoe Basin, by 2029.	X	X	X	X	X
Tribal Relations Program					

Comparison of Alternatives by Objective	Alt A	Alt B	Alt C	Alt D	Alt E
OBJ38. Revise the consultation protocol defined in the 1996 Memorandum of Understanding between the LTBMU and the Washoe Tribe by 2019.	X	X	X	X	X
Access and Travel Management Program					
OBJ39. Implement BMP retrofits on 285 miles of NFS roads by 2025.	X	X	X	X	X
OBJ40. Implement BMP retrofits on 370 miles of NFS trails by 2025.	X	X	X	X	X
Built Environment Program					
OBJ41. Implement BMP retrofits at all USFS facilities (including visitor centers, campgrounds, and parking lots.) by 2029.	X	X	X	X	X
OBJ42. Develop, plan and schedule to adoption for retrofitting five developed facilities rated as Development Scale 3-5 to include universally accessible features by 2025.	X	X	X	X	X
OBJ43. Maintain 15 administrative sites to standard by 2029.	X	X	X	X	X
OBJ44. Maintain 44 recreation sites to standard by 2029.	X	X	X	X	X
Santini-Burton Acquired Lands/Urban Forest Parcels					
OBJ45. Complete initial fuels reduction and forest health restoration treatments as needed on all urban forest parcels by 2019.	X	X	X	X	X
OBJ46. Conduct follow-up fuels treatments every 10-15 years in urban forest parcels.	X	X	X	X	X
OBJ47. Restore and vegetate areas of existing disturbance on up to 20 urban forest parcels annually	X	X	X	X	X