

Citation of Work for the MSO/Goshawk/ Old Growth Working Group

Background

In 1996, Region 3 completed a regional amendment to 11 forest plans to add management direction for 3 areas of interest: Mexican spotted owl (MSO), northern goshawk, and old growth. A Final Environmental Impact Statement (FEIS) was prepared that analyzed the proposed direction and amended the forest plans. Subsequently in 2006, a Final Supplement to the FEIS and Record of Decision was prepared and signed to disclose, review, and assess scientific arguments challenging the Agency's conclusions regarding the northern goshawk's habitat requirements¹.

In 2005, the Region embarked on forest plan revision. Regional leadership desired that any revision of direction in the 1996 Amendment and the Supplement related to MSO, northern goshawk, and old growth, be addressed in a consistent fashion across the forests. A team, the MSO/ Goshawk/ Old Growth Working Group², was chartered to investigate how this could best be done and to develop the regional guidance necessary to achieve this consistency while retaining flexibility for unit specific situations. Specialists from the areas of vegetation, fire/fuels, wildlife/ESA, planning, appeals, silviculture, and goshawk research were represented. The workgroup was directed to base their guidance on the 1996 Amendment, the MSO/Goshawk Implementation Guide, the Mexican spotted owl Recovery Plan, best available science, and recent MSO/goshawk/old growth project-specific plan amendments.

Development of Products

The team convened its first meeting in July of 2008 and met a total of 8 times for multiple day meetings in addition to having numerous conference calls. Several meetings included time in the field on various forests and discussions with forest staffs regarding challenges in interpreting and implementing plan direction related to these areas. The team also spent time in discussion with Bill Block of Rocky Mountain Research Station-MSO Recovery Team, academics from Northern Arizona University, and the members of the Ecological Restoration Institute. The team spent extensive time identifying and reviewing the most current science related to management in these areas and the resulting products were based on the best available science as referenced at the end of this write-up. After several discussions the team decided the best way to address the need for a consistent approach to plan revision for these areas was to develop region wide base level desired conditions for forested vegetation communities, customizable by unit (Forest) to

¹ See *Center for Biodiversity v. USFS*, 349 F.3d 1157 (9th Cir.2003)

² See the [Workgroup Charter](#) for an outline of the team's direction and purpose as well as team membership.

meet their specific circumstances. These products describe the desired characteristics including structure, composition, and process of the communities that are sustainable over time and provide for the needs of the Mexican spotted owl and the northern goshawk, as well as for “old growth” as a sustainable forest component. Desired conditions were developed for the following forested communities:

- Ponderosa pine (including bunchgrass and Gambel oak subtypes)
- Ponderosa pine evergreen oak (perennial grasses and evergreen shrub subtypes)
- Dry (frequent fire) mixed conifer
- Wet (infrequent fire) mixed conifer
- Spruce-fir (including lower and upper elevation types)
- Pinyon juniper
 - Pinyon juniper grassland / Juniper grassland
 - Pinyon juniper sagebrush
 - Pinyon juniper evergreen shrub
 - Pinyon juniper woodlands (persistent)

An introduction was also developed that provides the context, including concepts and definitions of terms, in which desired conditions should be construed.

The team presented their approach to the Regional Leadership Team in November of 2008 for approval, which was obtained at that meeting. Sample draft products were provided for review as well.

Draft products for each vegetation community were sent out to the forests for review and comment on several occasions between October of 2008 and April of 2009. The team reviewed and discussed each comment; changes were made as appropriate. Additional products were developed based on forest requests to meet unique situations that exist in more than one place across the region. Other comments were solicited from Regional Office specialists in vegetation ecology.

Each forest has the flexibility to customize these Desired Conditions and add to them to meet their unit specific situations as long as the intent of the overall direction is maintained. This will be done through a collaborative public process by each forest during plan revision. Adjustments will be reviewed by team members as appropriate to ensure that any changes are incorporated within the bounds of best science. The scientific references used in the development of these products are listed below.

References used in development of R3 base Desired Conditions

- Abella, S.R., 2008. Managing oak in southwestern ponderosa pine forests: the status of our knowledge. General Technical Report RMRS-GTR 218. Fort Collins, CO: U.S. Department of Agriculture, Forest Service, Rocky Mountain Research Station. 27 pp.
- Abella, S. R., W. W. Covington, P. Z. Fulé, L. B. Lentile, A. J. Sánchez Meador, and P. Morgan. 2007. Past, present, and future old growth in frequent-fire conifer forests of the Western United States. *Ecology and Society* 12(2): 16. [online] URL: <http://www.ecologyandsociety.org/vol12/iss2/art16/>
- Bernardos, D.A., C.L. Chambers, M.J. Rabe. 2003. Selection of Gambel oak roosts by Southwestern myotis in ponderosa pine-dominated forests, Northern Arizona. *Journal of Wildlife Management*, Volume 68, Number 3, pp. 595-601.
- Brown, J. K., E.D. Reinhardt, K. A. Kramer. 2003. Coarse woody debris: managing benefits and fire hazard in the recovering forest. Gen. Tech. Rep. RMRS-GTR- 105. Ogden, UT: U.S. Department of Agriculture, Forest Service, Rocky Mountain Research Station. 16 pp.
- Bush, R., A. Leach. 2009. Detailed estimates of old growth and large-snags on the Lewis and Clark National Forest. USDA-Forest Service technical report available online http://www.landsinfo.org/ecosystem_defense/Federal_Agencies/Forest_Service/Region_1/Lewis_and_Clark_NF/Supervisor_Office/Old%20Growth%20and%20Snag%20estimation-2004.doc. (accessed August 31, 2009). Northern Region, Missoula MT.
- Cooper, C. E. 1961. Patterns on ponderosa pine forests. *Ecology* 42: 493-499.

WORKING DRAFT: Vegetation Working Group Citations

- Covington, W. W., P. Z. Fulé, M. M. Moore, S. C. Hart, T. E. Kolb, N. J. Mast, S. S. Sackett, and M. R. Wagner. 1997. Restoring ecological health in ponderosa pine forests of the Southwest. *Journal of Forestry* 95: 23-29.
- Ffolliott, P. F., G. J. Gottfried, C. L. Stropki. 2008. Vegetative characteristics and relationships in the oak savannas of the Southwestern Borderlands. Research Paper RMRS-RP-74. Fort Collins, CO: U.S. Department of Agriculture, Forest Service, Rocky Mountain Research Station. 16 p.
- Friederici, P., editor. 2003. Ecological restoration of southwestern ponderosa pine forests. Island Press, Washington, D.C.
- Ganey, J.L. 1999. Snag density and composition of snag populations on two National Forests in Arizona. *Forest Ecology and Management*. 117, 169-178.
- Gori, D., J. Bate. 2007. Historical range of variation and state and transition modeling of historical and current landscape conditions for pinyon-juniper of the Southwestern U.S. Prepared for the U.S.D.A. Forest Service, Southwestern Region by The Nature Conservancy, Tucson, AZ. 141 pp.
- Kaufmann, M. R., D. Binkley, P. Z. Fulé, M. Johnson, S. L. Stephens, and T. W. Swetnam. 2007. Defining old growth for fire-adapted forests of the western United States. *Ecology and Society* 12(2): 15. [online] URL: <http://www.ecologyandsociety.org/vol12/iss2/art15/>.
- Ludwig, J.A., B.P. Wilcox, D.D. Bresshears, D.J. Tongway and A.C. Imeson. 2005. Vegetation patches and runoff-erosion as interacting ecohydrological processes in semiarid landscapes. *Ecology* 86(2): 288-297.
- Noss, R.F., P. Beier, W.W. Covington, R.E. Grumbine, D.B. Lindenmayer, J.W. Prather, F. Schmiegelow, T.D. Sisk, and D.J. Vosick. 2006. Recommendations for integrating

WORKING DRAFT: Vegetation Working Group Citations

restoration ecology and conservation biology in ponderosa pine forests of the Southwestern United States. *Restoration Ecology* Vol 14, No.1 : 4-10.

Moore, M. M., W. W. Covington, and P. Z. Fulé. 1999. Evolutionary environment, reference conditions, and ecological restoration: a southwestern ponderosa pine perspective. *Ecological Applications* 9: 1266-1277.

Reynolds, R. T., R. T. Graham, M. H. Reiser, R. L. Bassett, P. L. Kennedy, D. A. Boyce, Jr., G. Goodwin, R. Smith, and E. L. Fisher. 1992. Management recommendations for the northern goshawk in the Southwestern United States. General Technical Report RMRS-GTR-217, 90 pp. USDA Forest Service, Rocky Mountain Forest and Range Experiment Station, Fort Collins, Colorado.

Reynolds, R. T., R. T. Graham, and D. A. Boyce, Jr. 2006. An ecosystem-based conservation strategy for the northern goshawk. *Studies in Avian Biology* 31: 299-311.

Rosenstock, S. S. 1998. Influence of Gambel oak on breeding birds in Northern Arizona. *The Condor* ICQ:485-4920. The Cooper Ornithological Society.

Smith, E. 2006. Historical range of variation and state and transition modeling of historical and current landscape conditions for mixed conifer of the Southwestern U.S. Prepared for the U.S.D.A. Forest Service, Southwestern Region by The Nature Conservancy, Tucson, AZ. 31 pp.

Smith, E. 2006. Historical range of variation and state and transition modeling of historical and current landscape conditions for ponderosa pine of the Southwestern U.S. Prepared for the U.S.D.A. Forest Service, Southwestern Region by The Nature Conservancy, Tucson, AZ. 43 pp.

Smith, E. 2006. Historical range of variation and state and transition modeling of historical and current landscape conditions for spruce-fir of the Southwestern U.S. Prepared for the

WORKING DRAFT: Vegetation Working Group Citations

U.S.D.A. Forest Service, Southwestern Region by The Nature Conservancy, Tucson, AZ.
37 pp.

USDA-Forest Service. 1997. Coarse woody material guidelines -- habitat type groups of the Kootenai NF. Unpublished resource report on file. Libby MT.

USDA-Forest Service. 2000. Local snag levels using Northern Region snag management protocol -- VRU categories. FSVeg database summary of all stand data 1991-1999, unmanaged lands of the Fortine District, Kootenai NF. Fortine MT.

Vandendriesche, D. 2009. PNVT vegetation state attributes. USDA-Forest Service unpublished technical report on file. Southwestern Region, Albuquerque NM.

Walker, B., C. S. Holling, S. R. Carpenter, and A. Kinzig. 2004. Resilience, adaptability and transformability in social–ecological systems. *Ecology and Society* 9(2): 5. [online] URL: <http://www.ecologyandsociety.org/vol9/iss2/art5/>).

White, A. S. 1985. Presettlement regeneration patterns in a Southwestern ponderosa pine stand. *Ecology* 66:

Woolsey Jr., T.S. 1911. Western yellow pine in Arizona and New Mexico. Forest Service - Bulletin 101. U. S. Department of Agriculture, Forest Service. Government printing Office, Washington.

Youtz, J. A., R. T. Graham, R. T. Reynolds, and J. Simon. 2007. Implementing northern goshawk habitat management in Southwestern forests: A template for restoring fire-adapted forest ecosystems. In Deal, R. L., ed. *Integrated restoration of forested ecosystems to achieve multi-resource benefits: Proceeding of the 2007 National Silviculture Workshop*. PNW-GTR-733. Portland, OR: U. S. Department of Agriculture, Pacific Northwest Research Station.