

COMPARISON OF PROPOSED COLORADO ROADLESS RULE, 2001 ROADLESS RULE,  
TASK FORCE RECOMMENDATIONS, AND GOVERNOR’S PETITION

Issue	2001 Roadless Rule	Roadless Area Review Task Force Recommendation	Governor’s Petition (Ritter)	Draft Colorado Rule (preferred alternative)
Inventory	Based on old inventory data. 4 NFs (GMUG, PSI, SJ, & Manti LaSal) are from 1979.	Allowed for revisions to take place to “correct mapping errors or address Congressional designation”, but once revised, acres and boundaries get locked.	Same as Task Force. pg.5 Petition “uses the most updated IRA boundaries available.”	Same as Task Force and Petition.
Roads: Fire	Roads can be built if needed “to protect public health & safety in case of <i>imminent</i> threat of.. fire.. that w/o intervention would cause loss of life or property”. “imminent threat” has been interpreted as “the fire is coming over the ridge” (no requirement that roads be temporary or for restoration, no limitations on reach)	Same as 2001 for “threat” except it is <i>not</i> preceded by <i>imminent</i> and in addition to loss of life and property, adds <i>or natural resource values</i> . + Temporary roads can be built; areas identified: CWPP or HFRA definition of WUI (1½ mile from communities). + includes requirement for restoration after established use is no longer needed.	Same as Task Force	Same as Task Force Except does not include <i>natural resource value</i> .
Roads: Coal	Temporary roads can be built, but only for “continuation, extension, or renewal” of a lease existing prior to Jan. 12, 2001; no roads on all new leases issued after that date.	Same as 2001 rule; except that the date would be moved to date of promulgation of a CO Rule & except, ”upon leasing of federal coal reserves” (pg. 8 Petition) roadless areas overlaying coal leases in the North Fork Area were taken out of inventory & forest plans governed road building on these lands and no public use would be allowed on such roads & roads would be reclaimed and restored.	Same as Task Force; except that the North Fork coal areas would not be taken out of the roadless inventory. Coal leases allowing roads could be issued during the period of coal exploration and development.	Same as Governor’s Petition except that a new classification for coal roads is to be used “long-term temporary roads”, task force used ‘temporary roads’. Also, Rule defines 29,000 acres as North Fork Coal mining area.

<b>Issue</b>	<b>2001 Roadless Rule</b>	<b>Roadless Area Review Task Force Recommendation</b>	<b>Governor's Petition (Ritter)</b>	<b>Draft Colorado Rule (preferred alternative)</b>
Roads: Oil and Gas	Same as coal exception	Same as 2001 rule; except that the date would be moved to date of promulgation of a Colorado Rule and there are no geographic area exceptions for new oil and gas leases that would allow roads. Also removed 2001 language that allows for new leases issued immediately upon expiration of an existing lease.	Same as Task Force	Same as Governor's Petition except that a new classification for oil/gas roads is to be used "long-term temporary roads", task force used 'temporary roads'.
Roads: Grazing	No specific exception (but could fit under exception allowing roads "pursuant to reserved or outstanding rights")	Specifically allowed an exception for access to existing and future grazing allotments	Same as Task Force	Same as Task Force
Roads: Ski Areas	No specific exception	Roadless areas within ski area permit boundaries and Forest Plan ski area allocations are taken out of the inventory	Same as Task Force (with the proviso that when any project is proposed in a formerly roadless area at a ski area, DOW would be offered cooperating agency status)	Same as Governor Petition – except the 'Wolf Creek Expansion' on the San Juan NF was not removed from CRAs (about 2,000 acres).
Roads: Utilities	No specific exception (but could fit under exception allowing roads "pursuant to reserved or outstanding rights")	Roads allowed for existing utility and water conveyance structures	Roads allowed for existing and future utility and water conveyance structures	Same as Petition (except defines utilities as power lines and precludes reservoirs)
Roads: Mining	No specific exception needed. 1872 mining act provides right of access.	Same as 2001 Rule	Same as 2001 Rule	Same as 2001 Rule

<b>Issue</b>	<b>2001 Roadless Rule</b>	<b>Roadless Area Review Task Force Recommendation</b>	<b>Governor's Petition (Ritter)</b>	<b>Draft Colorado Rule (preferred alternative)</b>
Roads: Oil and Gas Pipelines	Pipelines allowed but you can't build roads	Same as 2001 Rule	Same as 2001 Rule	Same as 2001 Rule (except pipelines that transport oil/gas through a CRA are specifically precluded if the source originates from outside a CRA)
Roads: State Lands	No specific exception (but could fit under exception allowing roads "pursuant to reserved or outstanding rights")	Roads allowed to develop State Land Board minerals; adjusted a roadless boundary to carve out one section of SLB land; and encouraged land exchanges	Same as Task Force	Same intent as Task Force – language is included in preamble, but with ANILCA* requirements, no need to repeat in Rule.
Roads: Superfund	Roads allowed to remediate Superfund sites	Same as 2001 Rule	Same as 2001 Rule	Same as 2001 Rule
Roads: Public Safety	Roads allowed for imminent threat.	Same as 2001 Rule except roads allowed for threats.	Same as Task Force	Same as Task Force
Roads: Realignment	Roads allowed	Same as 2001 Rule	Same as 2001 Rule	Same as 2001 Rule
Roads: Federal Aid Highways	Roads allowed	Same as 2001 Rule	Same as 2001 Rule	Same as 2001 Rule
Tree cutting **: Fire	Allowed to "reduce the risk of uncharacteristic wildfire effects"	Temporary roads can be built for treatment actions; areas identified: CWPP or HFRA definition of WUI (1 ½ mile from communities)	Same as Task Force	Same as Task Force
Tree cutting: Wildlife	Allowed to improve habitat for T&E species	"wildlife habitat management and improvement for wildlife species including TES" Same as Task Force (with proviso that agency work with DOW)	Same as Task Force	Management and improvement of wildlife plant species including TES (w/proviso that agency work w/DOW)
Tree cutting: Incidental or Administrative	Allowed	Same as 2001 Rule	Same as 2001 Rule	Same as 2001 Rule

<b>Issue</b>	<b>2001 Roadless Rule</b>	<b>Roadless Area Review Task Force Recommendation</b>	<b>Governor's Petition (Ritter)</b>	<b>Draft Colorado Rule (preferred alternative)</b>
Tree cutting: when roadless characteristics have been substantially altered	Allowed in substantially altered areas.	Substantially altered areas are removed from updated inventory, no need for this exception.	Same as Task Force	Same as Task Force
Cooperating agency status w/ DOW	No specific mention	Specifically required for projects and planning activities in CRAs	Same as Task Force	Same as Task Force
* ANILCA – Alaska National Interest Lands Conservation Act				
** “Tree cutting” as used above is equivalent to “cutting, sale or removal of timber.”				