

## APPENDIX C

### Annual Monitoring Report Form for Actions covered under the Service's Biological Opinion for Grazing on Allotments Managed by the Salmon Challis National Forest.

Please submit annually by **March 1** to the Supervisor of the Service's Eastern Idaho Field Office:  
**4425 Burley Dr., Suite A, Chubbuck, Idaho 83202**  
**Telephone (208)237-6975.**

Please include name and contact information in case additional information is needed.

1. What was the name of that stream in this allotment surveyed for impacted redds?  
**Wet Creek**
2. What was the date of the survey, and what were the water conditions?  
**Date: September 24, 2012**  
**Water Conditions: Baseflow**
3. Which stream segment was surveyed and how many redds and impacted redds were found? (Please give GPS start and stop points for segments)?  
**Beginning Point: UTM Zone 12, 303647E, 4879727N (NAD1927)**  
**Ending Point: UTM Zone 12, 303252E, 4879441N (NAD1927)**  
**Length: 627 m**  
**Redds Found: 0**  
**Redds Impacted: 0**
4. What was the date that livestock removed from the pasture with surveyed stream segment?  
**September 14, 2012**
5. Did this number exceed the scale anticipated in section VII of the Biological Opinion?  
**No**
6. Were there any changes to the grazing management that differed from the proposed grazing management in the Forest's Biological Assessment? If yes, what were they?  
**Yes, Upper and Lower Big Creek units had cattle present throughout the summer with livestock documented on 8/28, 9/6, and 9/7 prior to scheduled grazing. The cattle were then removed from the Forest prior to the majority of cattle grazing the Big Creek units.**  
**A few cattle entered the Basin Creek enclosure during the prescribed grazing period, and then cattle entered the enclosure again later in the season (10/2 and 10/9) while there were not supposed to be cattle in the North Basin Creek Unit and therefore some additional livestock grazing did occur in the enclosure. Cattle entered the Wet Creek enclosure on multiple occasions with minimal impact on the riparian area. The Upper Big Creek enclosure was grazed by livestock to the same level of use as outside the enclosure.**
7. Were there any unexpected circumstances or events that resulted in impacts beyond those anticipated in the Forest's in the Biological Assessment or the Service's Biological Opinion? If yes, please describe.  
**Yes, Wet Creek in the Wet Creek Unit received 32% alteration with a 15% standard and a 3" stubble height with a 6" standard. The North Wet Creek Basin Unit was grazed to a 4" stubble height with a 6" standard.**

Salmon-Challis NF Official: Bart Gamett and Thad Berrett

Date: January 23, 2013

Contact Information: (208)588-3400

# Pass Creek C&H Allotment

## 2012 Implementation Monitoring Evaluation

### Summary

The Pass Creek Allotment Management Plan (2000-2005) was developed by a team consisting of representatives of the Forest Service, the Pass Creek Association, and the Natural Resource Conservation Service to improve resource conditions on the Pass Creek Allotment. This plan requires that participants meet annually to 1) evaluate the success in implementing the plan, 2) identify actions to improve the management of the allotment, and 3) develop a grazing strategy for the following season. This report follows these guidelines and summarizes the results of this effort for the 2012 grazing season.

TERM GRAZING PERMIT				AUTHORIZED USE				ACTUAL USE			
NO.	ON DATE	OFF DATE	HM	NO.	ON DATE	OFF DATE	HM	NO.	ON DATE	OFF DATE	HM
1,660	7/15	10/1	4,312	1,497	7/15	10/1	3,888	1,394	7/15	9/20	3,117

Actual use was 72% of full permitted head months, and 84% of full permitted cattle.

**Table 1. Summary of the 2012 grazing season. (Total of 68 days actual use)**

Order of Use	Unit Name	Number of Head	On Date	Off Date	AUM's Permitted 5691	End of Growing Season Stubble Height Indicator/Streambank Alteration/Woody Browse	Trigger Stubble Height	Actual End of Season Stubble Height/streambank Alteration/Woody Browse	Use Exceeded
1	North Wet Creek Basin <sup>1</sup>		7/15			6/NA/50%	7	4"/23%alt/45%Brws	Yes, Stubble height
2	South Wet Creek Basin <sup>1</sup>			8/9		4/NA/50%	5	4"/25%alt/39%Brws	No
3	Twin Lakes <sup>2</sup>		8/10			4/NA/50%	5	4"/NA/NA	No
4	Southeast Pass Creek <sup>2</sup>			8/14		Upper Mud Lake 4/NA/50%  Lower Mud Lake 4/NA/50%	5	4"/NA/NA  3"/NA/49%Brws	Yes, Stubble height
5	South Pass Creek <sup>3</sup>		8/15			Main Key Area 4/NA/50%  Below Admin Past 4/NA/50%	5	3"/28%alt/12%Brws  4"/NA/22%Brws	Yes  No
6	North Pass Creek <sup>3</sup>			9/11		4/NA/50%	5	3"/NA/33%Brws	Yes, Stubble height
7	Pine Creek <sup>4</sup>		9/2	9/14		Wet Creek 4/NA/50%  Pine Creek 4/NA/50%	5/5	4"/11%alt/18%Brws  4"/49%alt/52%Brws	Yes, Browse Use

Order of Use	Unit Name	Number of Head	On Date	Off Date	AUM's Permitted 5691	End of Growing Season Stubble Height Indicator/Streambank Alteration/Woody Browse	Trigger Stubble Height	Actual End of Season Stubble Height/streambank Alteration/Woody Browse	Use Exceeded
8	Wet Creek (Upper) <sup>4</sup>		9/4	9/13		6/15%/50%	7	3"/32%alt/42%Brws	Yes, Stubble height and Streambank Alteration
9	Sands/Coal Creek		9/10	9/18		4/NA/50%	5	4"/NA/26%Brws	No
10	Upper Big Creek <sup>5</sup>		9/19			4/NA/30%	5	6"/10%alt/12%Brws	No
11	Lower Big Creek <sup>5</sup>			9/20		4/NA/30%	5	7"/7%alt/11%Brws	No
	<b>Total</b>			<b>68</b>					

<sup>1</sup>The number of head is based on approximately 50% of the use occurring in the South Wet Creek Basin unit and 50% of the use occurring in the North Wet Creek Basin unit.

<sup>2</sup>The number of head is based on approximately 73% of the use occurring in the South East Pass Creek unit, and approximately 27% of the use occurring in the Twin Lakes unit.

<sup>3</sup>The number of head is based on approximately 50% of the use occurring in the South Pass Creek unit and 50% of the use occurring in the North Pass Creek unit.

<sup>4</sup>The number of head is based on approximately 70% of the use occurring in Pine Creek unit and 30% of the use occurring in the Wet Creek unit

<sup>5</sup> Upper and Lower Big Creek will be run together this year.

**Information:** The precipitation for the Hilts Creek Snotel site on the allotment was average for the precipitation year of October 2011 through September 2012. The growing season precipitation for the months of April through September was well below average at 60% of the 30 year average for the site. The precipitation information for the Hilts Creek Snotel site is included in the table below. The totals for 2012 are compared to the average total precipitation by month for the Hilts Creek Snotel site from 1982-2012.

Month	Oct.	Nov.	Dec.	Jan.	Feb.	March	April	May	June	July	Aug.	Sept.	Year Total	Growing Season Total
2012 Precip. (in inches)	5.3	2.1	0.7	1.2	0.8	7	1.2	1.2	1.2	1.3	0.4	0.9	23.3	6.2
Average Precip. 1982-2012	1.8	2.1	2.4	2.2	1.9	2.8	2.0	2.1	2.2	1.3	1.4	1.3	23.6	10.3

The temperature for the growing season as measured at the Hilts Creek Snotel site shows a much warmer growing season than average at 2.9 degrees F warmer than the 24 year average as indicated in the table below. The 6 month growing season temperature is the 3<sup>rd</sup> warmest out of the 24 year record for the Hilts Creek Snotel site. The warm temperature and limited moisture during the growing season greatly limited vegetation growth on the District later in the season.

Month	Apr	May	Jun	Jul	Aug	Sept	Apr-Sept Total
<b>2012 Temperature (°F)</b>	37.0	43.0	52.0	61.0	63.0	54.0	51.7
<b>Average Temp. 1982-2012</b>	33.1	41.3	49.5	59.8	58.7	50.3	48.8

**Utilization:** Standards were not met on North Wet Creek Basin (4" stubble instead of 6"), Southeast Pass Creek (3" stubble instead of 4"), South Pass Creek (3" stubble instead of 4"), North Pass Creek (3" stubble instead of 4"), Pine Creek (52% browse instead of 50%) and Upper Wet Creek (3" stubble and 32% alteration instead of 6" and 15%). All other standards were met. Upland utilization was light to moderate on grasses throughout much of the allotment with moderate to heavy utilization of grasses observed in the Wet Creek Basin pastures and the Blue Jay Canyon portion of the South Pass Creek pasture. Cattle were found throughout the season outside of the units they were scheduled to be in. Back riding needs to be improved upon to ensure that all cattle are in their scheduled unit. Continue to move cattle away from high concentrated use areas adjacent to roads and streams.

Browse standards of 30% in Big Creek and 50% on all other units in the allotment are included in your permit and should be watched carefully. While this standard has not been focused on by range specialists in the past because minimal use of woody browse by livestock was observed, browse on willows, aspen, and riparian shrubs is an important consideration especially in dry years. Generally speaking, cattle began to shift to woody browse species as the four inch stubble height on grasses and sedges was met which could be used as an indicator for riders/ permittees to move cattle in the future. Using this tool to adjust movement dates could avoid overuse or missing end of season standards for herbaceous and woody species in these riparian areas during years of low precipitation.

**The following actions are required of you during the 2013 and 2014 grazing seasons to remedy the non-compliance:**

1. All livestock are to be kept in the scheduled pasture according to the AOI or direction from myself or a rangeland management specialist as adjustments are made throughout the season.
2. End of season indicators are not exceeded.
3. Cattle are kept out of exclosures.

Prepare for another hot and dry season. The precipitation from this winter will prove insignificant to forage production if we do not get any moisture during the spring and active growing season. In preparing, thoughts of running fewer cattle, less time in each unit and lighter use will reduce the chances of long lasting impacts to the forage species on the allotment.

**Table 2. Evaluation of livestock operations for the 2012 grazing season and recommended improvements for 2013 grazing season.**

Order of Use	Unit Name	Amount of Available Forage Left Unused	Priority for Providing for Better Livestock Distribution	Things That Worked/Did Not Work	Recommended Improvements to Better Protect Resource, Utilize Forage, etc.
1	North Wet Creek Basin	Low	Moderate	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Temporary water pump, pipeline, and trough were maintained while cattle were in North Wet Creek Basin to keep cattle away from the Basin Creek enclosure.</li> <li>• The few cattle that entered the Basin Creek enclosure were removed promptly while cattle were planned in the unit. – Cattle entered the enclosure later in the season (10/2 and 10/9) while there were not supposed to be cattle in the unit and therefore some additional livestock grazing did occur in the enclosure. Photo documentation.</li> <li>• Cattle were cleaned from the unit around 8/20 and no cattle were found in the unit again until 10/2.</li> <li>• 4 inch stubble height exceeded 6 inch stubble height allowable use at key area. It was at 5 inches on 8/6, the day the allotment was inspected and then the permittees were told to move the livestock.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Move cattle out of North Wet Creek Basin an *estimated 28 days from entering unit, <b>or when trigger is met.</b></li> <li>• Continue to maintain temporary water pump, pipeline and trough to water cattle away from the Basin Creek enclosure.</li> <li>• <b>Keep livestock out of enclosures.</b> Check the enclosure periodically even when cattle are not in the pasture to ensure no cattle are there, especially since the fence is often down due to ATV use.</li> <li>• Potentially replace some of the enclosure fence with jack and rail to reduce likelihood of cattle pushing through the electric fence.</li> <li>• Look into placing cattle crossing in enclosure to improve livestock movement at the bottom of the pasture.</li> <li>• Look at potential gate in SE corner of Basin enclosure to allow permittees to remove livestock without letting fence down.</li> <li>• Potentially put storage tank above enclosure for trough.</li> <li>•</li> </ul>

Order of Use	Unit Name	Amount of Available Forage Left Unused	Priority for Providing for Better Livestock Distribution	Things That Worked/Did Not Work	Recommended Improvements to Better Protect Resource, Utilize Forage, etc.
2	South Wet Creek Basin	Low	Moderate	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Pasture met end of season allowable uses.</li> <li>• Little Basin spring enclosure was grazed by cattle.</li> <li>• Cattle got into the Pine Creek pasture a couple of times while in the South Wet Creek Basin pasture.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Little Basin troughs are next to each other – should move second trough down slope as originally planned.</li> <li>• Move cattle out of South Wet Creek Basin an *estimated 28 days from entering either units, when trigger is met, or if cattle congregate along fence.</li> <li>• Look into some jack fence on enclosures.</li> <li>• <b>Keep livestock out of enclosures.</b></li> <li>• Blacktail pipeline and headbox may need replaced.</li> <li>• We may want to put a spring box in the Upper South Wet Creek Basin pond and fence pond to provide water to an off-site trough. The trough holds good water and would provide better water quality this way. There is some old pipe on the ground indicating that a trough once existed.</li> </ul>
3	Twin Lakes	Moderate	Moderate	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Met end of season allowable uses.</li> <li>• Both spring enclosures were grazed by cattle later in the summer.</li> <li>• Troughs had not been drained as of 11/28/12.</li> <li>• Cattle were found in the unit (9/7, 9/13, 9/14) well after clean date of 8/24.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Ensure pastures are cleaned so that cattle do not get in spring enclosures later in the year.</li> </ul>
4	Southeast Pass Creek	Moderate	High	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Electric fence was put up to standard. By the end of the season the fence was down in some locations.</li> <li>• Cattle pushed the fence at the bottom of Mud Lake drainage creating some impacts to the riparian area near electric fence.</li> <li>• Placing additional cattle in Mud Lake following Forest Service request around 8/15/2012 caused cattle to bail out of Mud Lake unit.</li> <li>• Small bunches of cattle were seen (through 9/14) in the unit after move date of 8/24.</li> <li>• End of season allowable use was exceeded as 3 inch stubble height was measured near Mud Lake key area – allowable use is 4 inch stubble.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Looking to modify fencing at lower Mud Lake to improve livestock movement reduce bottle neck and resource damage on riparian area.</li> <li>• Monitor number of cattle in Twin Lakes and Southeast Pass Creek pastures closely and begin to move cattle into next unit when needed.</li> <li>• Communication is needed if permittees or riders feel Forest Service direction will create grazing management problems.</li> </ul>

Order of Use	Unit Name	Amount of Available Forage Left Unused	Priority for Providing for Better Livestock Distribution	Things That Worked/Did Not Work	Recommended Improvements to Better Protect Resource, Utilize Forage, etc.
5	South Pass Creek	Low	High	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Cattle left the allotment through the narrows on 8/27/2012. They were pushed back on to the allotment in the South Pass Creek pasture within the day.</li> <li>• Cattle were seen in the pasture several times from 9/1 to 9/14 following the move date.</li> <li>• The uplands in the Blue Jay area were grazed between moderate and heavy with bluebunch wheatgrass utilization estimated at 50-60%.</li> <li>• Forest Service measured stubble height on key area at 4 inches on 8/22/2012 and let permittees and the rider know that the key area was at 4 inch stubble. Forest Service recommended moving from pasture early, but left it up to permittees to monitor key area.</li> <li>• Cattle started moving from Pass Creek to Pine Creek on 8/28/2012.</li> <li>• End of season allowable use was exceeded as 3 inch stubble height was measured at key area – allowable use is 4 inch stubble.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Blue Jay Canyon Jack Fence needs replaced and potentially modified to improve the bottle neck slightly. The fence to the south of the enclosure needs repaired prior to grazing next year.</li> <li>• We may want to limit livestock grazing in Blue Jay portion of the pasture next year to allow optimal plant growth.</li> <li>• <b>Cattle need to be moved from the unit when trigger is met and not allowed to continue grazing with the hope that they will not graze the trigger down further.</b></li> <li>• Evaluate making the fence along Cave Gulch to Mud Lake a hard fence to improve likelihood of keeping cattle off the road.</li> </ul>
6	North Pass Creek	Low	High	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• End of season allowable use was exceeded as 3 inch stubble height was measured at key area – allowable use is 4 inch stubble.</li> <li>• Cattle were entering Pine Creek pasture by walking over the cattle guard while in North Pass Creek. Rider said he was pushing cattle out of Pine Creek, but they kept going back.</li> <li>• The cattle guard was cleaned by the Forest Service later in the summer.</li> <li>• Cattle were seen in the pasture several times from 9/1 to 9/14 following the move date.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Move cattle out of North Pass Creek an *estimated 21 days from entering unit, <b>or when trigger is met.</b> (*Total of an estimated 29 days in the entire Pass Creek drainage.)</li> <li>• Look at replacing cattle guards with pipe cattle guards.</li> </ul>

Order of Use	Unit Name	Amount of Available Forage Left Unused	Priority for Providing for Better Livestock Distribution	Things That Worked/Did Not Work	Recommended Improvements to Better Protect Resource, Utilize Forage, etc.
7	Pine Creek	Low	Low	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Cattle were entering unit while they were scheduled to be in South Wet Creek Basin. Cattle were removed promptly.</li> <li>• Cattle were entering unit while in North Pass Creek by crossing over cattle guard.</li> <li>• Cattle were in the Pine Creek pasture from around 9/1 to 9/14/2012. The trigger of 5 inch stubble height was measured on 9/7 at the Pine Creek key area. The Forest Service directed permittees to have cattle out of the Pine Creek pasture by 9/10 with a clean date of 9/12. The rider started moving cattle out of the pasture 9/8 but there were still 200 head as of 9/13.</li> <li>• End of season allowable use of 4 inch stubble height was met at both key areas – browse was exceeded on the Pine Creek key area with a measurement of 52%.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Fence between South Wet Creek Basin and Pine Creek should be maintained to keep cattle from drifting between pastures.</li> <li>• Carefully monitor Pine Creek. If cattle drift into this unit please remove immediately.</li> <li>• Cattle need to be removed from the pasture when trigger is met and pasture cleaned quicker than 7 days since this is a smaller pasture.</li> <li>• Cattle guard has been cleaned so permittees should be able to keep cattle out of Pine Creek when not scheduled for grazing in the future.</li> <li>• Put fence back up around aspen on upper unnamed tributary to Wet Creek i.e. Pine Creek.</li> <li>• Look at potential to move fence between Pine and Basin pastures to decrease use on Wet Creek in the Pine Creek pasture and graze the uplands with the Basin pastures.</li> </ul>
8	Wet Creek	Low	High	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• On 9/8 Thad Berrett called permittees and said to move cattle from Wet Creek up high to the west to prepare going into Big Creek and get them away from the key area on Wet Creek.</li> <li>• On 9/11 cattle were documented in the Wet Creek key area and Mel stated that he would have the rider start pushing cattle up towards Nolan Lake.</li> <li>• On 9/13 the Forest Service visited Wet Creek and the rider had just moved 20 pair from the key area and 8 pair from the Wet Creek enclosure.</li> <li>•</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Limit number of cattle to go through Wet Creek pasture to around 200 in years that it is grazed.</li> <li>• Monitor while in Sands/Coal Creek, and Big Creek to ensure no drift into unit.</li> <li>• Forest Service to repair enclosure to standard prior to livestock grazing in 2013, with permittees expected to maintain the enclosure following that. The jack fence needs additional kickers.</li> <li>• Closely monitor enclosure and maintain to ensure cattle don't get in. If cattle do drift in remove them immediately.</li> <li>• Evaluate permittees request to extend Wet Creek enclosure further upstream.</li> </ul>
8	Wet Creek Continued			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Upper Wet Creek key area grazed to 3 inch stubble height and 32% alteration, exceeding allowable uses of 6 inch stubble height and 15% alteration.</li> <li>• Cattle entered the enclosure on multiple occasions with minimal impact on the riparian area. Photo documentation.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>•</li> </ul>

Order of Use	Unit Name	Amount of Available Forage Left Unused	Priority for Providing for Better Livestock Distribution	Things That Worked/Did Not Work	Recommended Improvements to Better Protect Resource, Utilize Forage, etc.
9	Sands/Coal Creek	Moderate	Low	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>End of season allowable uses were met.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li></li> </ul>
10	Upper Big Creek	High	Moderate	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>End of season allowable uses were met.</li> <li>Cattle were documented in the pasture on 8/28, 9/6, and 9/7 prior to scheduled grazing. Permittees had been notified of cattle following the first sighting and failed to remove all livestock.</li> <li>While the pasture had limited grazing the stubble height was measured at 6 inches during the year and post grazing season.</li> <li>The Upper Big Creek enclosure fence never had a fence charger installed and was grazed by livestock to the same level of use as outside the enclosure.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Monitor Upper Big Creek occasionally throughout the season to ensure no cattle have drifted into the unit.</li> <li>Back riding to ensure unit is clean</li> <li>Keep livestock out of the Upper Big Creek enclosure.</li> <li>Evaluate intent and use of enclosure.</li> </ul>
11	Lower Big Creek	High	Moderate	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>End of season allowable uses were met.</li> <li>Cattle were documented in the pasture on 8/28, 9/6, and 9/7 prior to scheduled grazing. Permittees had been notified of cattle following the first sighting and failed to remove all livestock.</li> <li>While the pasture had limited grazing the stubble height was measured at 7 inches during the year and post grazing season.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Continue to maintain fence between BLM/Forest Service boundary to prevent early use on Forest Service.</li> <li>Monitor Lower Big Creek occasionally throughout the season to ensure no cattle have drifted into the unit.</li> <li>Back riding to ensure unit is clean</li> </ul>

**Table 3. Summary of implementation review and management action being taken in units where end of season indicator was exceeded.**

<b>Unit</b>	<b>Was the indicator exceeded?</b>	<b>Why was the indicator exceeded?</b>	<b>How will the plan be revised to ensure the indicator is not exceeded?</b>	<b>What was the extent of the overuse?</b>	<b>How can the resource damage caused by the overuse be restored?</b>
Lower Big Creek	No				
Upper Big Creek	No				
Sands/Coal Creek	No				
Wet Creek	Yes	Cattle numbers and days were too high for the unit.	Wet Creek will be rested in 2013.	High	Resting Wet Creek for one year should restore bank stability to levels prior to 2012 grazing.
Pine Creek	Yes	Cattle in unit for too long.	Restrict number of days cattle are allowed in Pine Creek.	Low	No Recommendation.
South Pass Creek	Yes	Cattle not moved based on stubble height trigger at key area.	Improve management of pasture and ensure cattle are moved based on triggers.	Low	No Recommendation.
North Pass Creek	Yes	Cattle not moved based on stubble height trigger at key area.	Improve management of pasture and ensure cattle are moved based on triggers.	Low	No Recommendation.
Southeast Pass Creek	Yes	Cattle not moved based on stubble height trigger at key area.	Improve management of pasture and ensure cattle are moved based on triggers.	Low	No Recommendation.
Twin Lakes	No				

<b>Unit</b>	<b>Was the indicator exceeded?</b>	<b>Why was the indicator exceeded?</b>	<b>How will the plan be revised to ensure the indicator is not exceeded?</b>	<b>What was the extent of the overuse?</b>	<b>How can the resource damage caused by the overuse be restored?</b>
North Wet Creek Basin	Yes	Cattle not moved based on stubble height trigger at key area.	Ensure cattle are moved based on triggers.	Low	No Recommendation.
South Wet Creek Basin	No				