



United States  
Department of  
Agriculture

Forest  
Service

Coronado National Forest  
Supervisor's Office

300 W. Congress  
Tucson, Arizona 85701  
Phone (520) 388-8300  
FAX (520) 388-8305  
Deaf & Hearing Impaired 711

---

File Code: 2320

Date: December 7, 2011

George Barnes  
City Clerk/Manager  
City of Tombstone  
613 E. Allen Street  
P. O. Box 339  
Tombstone, AZ 85638

Dear Mr. Barnes,

I have received your letter of December 5, 2011 regarding your request for authorization to do repair work on five springs that the City of Tombstone utilizes for their water system within the Coronado National Forest.

In your letter you are asking for a "permit" to access all of the spring sites described in the attached map that you sent and not one spring at a time. In previous discussions with your staff, we have informed your office that we are willing to address all of your proposed actions; however, we need site specific information to determine the effects before we can consider authorizing such use. I understand that in order to expedite the approval process for Miller Springs and Gardner Springs your office provided detailed information for only those areas. Other than the information that you have previously provided us for work at Miller and Gardner Springs, we have no other information from you as to the type and amount of work that you are proposing to do at any of the other spring locations. Indicating the location of the springs on a map is not sufficient information for us to determine the effects of the repair work on the Wilderness resource or on other natural resource values that I am responsible for.

Before I can authorize the use of mechanized or motorized equipment within designated Wilderness I am required to complete a Minimum Resource Decision Guide (MRDG) for Regional Forester's approval. An additional NEPA analysis and decision as well as consultation with US Fish and Wildlife Service are also required. Without site specific information on what you are proposing to do, we cannot do the required analysis. Please include all of the remaining work you plan to do into one proposal, which will help both of our staffs to be more efficient with their time.

Our initial examination of your proposal for the Gardner Springs site indicates that the type of equipment that you have described is not the minimum tool necessary to complete the project while protecting the Wilderness resource and thus would not be approved by the Regional Forester. Our engineer has suggested to your staff what types of mechanized equipment would be acceptable, but we have not heard back from you as to your agreement with this. Without concurrence on your part, the approval process is delayed and we cannot move forward.



Please understand that we have dedicated much time and effort to try to meet the needs of the City of Tombstone. With any other similar project, we would be requiring a much greater lead time for analysis, and the proponent would be required to provide cost recovery for the approval process. I have asked my staff to work cooperatively with you, but I need your assistance to move this process forward in a productive manner. Resistance by the City of Tombstone to acknowledge or meet the valuable resource considerations that I have responsibility for will only result in further delays. I would again ask that you continue to work with the local District Ranger and our engineering staff to firm up your plans and discuss options on minimizing the impacts to the Wilderness resource.

Sincerely,

*/s/ Jim Upchurch*  
JIM UPCHURCH  
Forest Supervisor