



## ***Coronado National Forest Travel Management Collaboration***

---

### ***Forest-Wide Final Report***

December 11, 2012

***Prepared By:***

*Debra Drecksell, Senior Program Manager / Senior Facilitator*

*Patricia Lewis, Senior Program Associate*

## Table of Contents

|  |    |
|--|----|
| Section I: Collaboration Overview .....  | 3  |
| Background.....  | 3  |
| Coronado National Forest Travel Management Planning Process Prior to January 28, 2012 Forest-<br>Wide Kickoff Meeting for Travel Management Collaboration .....  | 4  |
| How Previous Public Input Was Used in the Travel Management Planning Process.....  | 4  |
| What Came Next?.....   | 4  |
| Why a Collaboration? .....   | 5  |
| Input and Consensus .....  | 5  |
| The Collaboration Process .....  | 6  |
| Section II: Arizona State Land Department Resolution.....  | 7  |
| Section III: Brief Summary of Safford CAT Process .....  | 8  |
| Summary.....   | 8  |
| Statistics.....  | 8  |
| Appendix A: Safford Final Collaboratively Developed Alternative.....   | 9  |
| Safford District Workshop/CAT Meeting Attendees .....  | 9  |
| Section IV: Brief Summary of Nogales CAT Process.....  | 12 |
| Summary.....   | 12 |
| Statistics.....  | 12 |
| Appendix B: Nogales Final Collaboratively Developed Alternative.....   | 13 |
| Nogales District Workshop/CAT Meeting Attendees .....  | 13 |
| Section V: Brief Summary of Santa Catalina CAT Process.....  | 16 |
| Summary.....   | 16 |
| Statistics.....  | 16 |
| Appendix C: Santa Catalina Final Collaboratively Developed Alternative.....  | 17 |
| Santa Catalina District Workshop/CAT Meeting Attendees .....   | 17 |
| Section VI: Brief Summary of Douglas CAT Process.....  | 20 |
| Summary.....   | 20 |
| Statistics.....  | 20 |
| Appendix D: Douglas Final Collaboratively Developed Alternative<br>( <a href="http://www.fs.usda.gov/Internet/FSE_DOCUMENTS/stelprdb5401979.pdf">http://www.fs.usda.gov/Internet/FSE_DOCUMENTS/stelprdb5401979.pdf</a> ) ..... | 20 |
| Douglas District Workshop/CAT Meeting Attendees .....  | 21 |
| Section VII: Brief Summary of Sierra Vista CAT Process.....  | 23 |
| Summary.....   | 23 |
| Statistics.....  | 24 |
| Appendix E: Sierra Vista Final Collaboratively Developed Alternative.....  | 24 |
| Sierra Vista District Workshop/CAT Meetings Attendees .....  | 24 |
| Section VIII: NEPA Next Steps .....  | 28 |
| Section IX: U.S. Institute Recommendations and Conclusion.....   | 28 |
| Recommendations.....   | 28 |
| Conclusion .....   | 29 |

## Section I: Collaboration Overview

### Information about the Travel Management Collaborative Process

#### *Background*

Visitors to National Forests and Grasslands share a common interest in the enjoyment of outdoor recreation in a natural setting. The Forest Service currently manages more than 300,000 miles of roads nationwide, including 2158 miles of roads on the Coronado National Forest, to provide visitors with motorized access to recreational amenities, motorized access to those who use National Forest Service lands under special authorizations, such as grazing or operation and maintenance of communication sites, and administrative access to agencies for fire and land management activities.

Over the years, there has been an increased use of off-highway vehicles (OHVs) on Federal lands. Forest Service motorized travel regulations issued before the increase in OHV use and advances in OHV technology were outdated; so in 2005, the Forest Service published final travel management regulations (Travel Management Rule; Federal Register Vol. 70, No. 216; Nov. 9, 2005, pages 68264 through 68291).

The Travel Management Rule clarifies current Forest Service policy regarding motor-vehicle use and provides management direction that allows sustainable access by motor vehicles, including OHVs, on National Forests and Grasslands. It requires that each National Forest and Grassland designate roads, motorized trails, and areas that are open to public motor vehicle use by class of vehicle and, if appropriate, by time of year. The Travel Management Rule requires National Forests to document their motorized transportation systems on a Motor Vehicle Use Map (MVUM) that is available to the public free of charge and updated annually.

The Coronado National Forest published an MVUM for each of its five Ranger Districts in May of 2011 (see <http://www.fs.fed.us/r3/coronado/forest/maps/maps.shtml>). The MVUMs reflect the current designated system of roads, motorized trails, and areas on each Ranger District. Because these MVUMs make no changes to the existing designated road system, no public input or analysis under the National Environmental Policy Act (NEPA) was required. The Forest is now considering changes to the designated road system and will consider public input and perform a NEPA analysis before changes are made. Any changes made will be reflected in the next set of MVUMs published.

***Coronado National Forest Travel Management Planning Process Prior to January 28, 2012  
Forest-Wide Kickoff Meeting for Travel Management Collaboration***

Since 2006, the Coronado National Forest's (Forest) Travel Management Planning (TMP) process has included several opportunities for public involvement. Three open-house meetings related to the Forest Plan Revision (one each in Safford, Sierra Vista, and Douglas Districts) provided opportunities for public input on the TMP process. A fourth meeting, held in Tucson in March 2009, focused entirely on the Santa Catalina Ranger District's TMP.

All meetings gave interested members of the public opportunities to view maps showing existing motorized-use direction in the Forest Plan and to provide input regarding unique recreation opportunities, specific vehicle-class opportunities, access to significant-use locations, dispersed camping opportunities, and environmental and/or safety concerns related to specific roads. The Forest Supervisor also informed 12 Native American tribes in writing about the travel management planning process and advised them of their opportunity to comment.

Additional public meetings have been held in each of the Ranger Districts since the District's proposed actions were published.

***How Previous Public Input Was Used in the Travel Management Planning Process***

After the public meetings, the Forest's internal Interdisciplinary Team (IDT) met to consider recommendations for changes to the current designated transportation system based on a science-based roads analysis and input from a broad spectrum of citizens and groups as well as state and federal agencies. The ID Team's analysis identified the minimum road system needed for each District (as set forth in the Travel Management Rule) and provided recommendations for changes to the designated road system. These changes were documented in Transportation Analysis Plans and maps.

Each District's Transportation Analysis Plan resulted in a proposed action (proposed changes to the designated road system) for that District. Stakeholders were asked to comment on the proposed actions.

Public input received in regard to travel management was considered in the development of the Transportation Analysis Plans and the corresponding proposed actions. The Coronado National Forest is very appreciative of the public's contribution.

***What Came Next?***

After the Transportation Analysis Plans and proposed actions were developed, the Forest Service invited public input and collaboration on the next phase of the travel management process. To ensure interested stakeholders and the public had an opportunity to provide input to potential changes in the Forest's designated road system and were well-informed about the process, Forest Supervisor Jim Upchurch, the District Rangers, and Forest Service staff asked the Udall Foundation's U.S. Institute for Environmental Conflict Resolution (the U.S. Institute), an independent and impartial agency of the

federal government, to design a balanced, fair, collaborative process. The collaboration process has evolved over time based on input and recommendations from participants in the collaborative process.

### ***Why a Collaboration?***

The Forest learned throughout the travel management process that there are conflicting opinions on what the minimum road system should be. The goal of the Collaboration was to bring diverse interests together to obtain input and work toward consensus on an alternative to the proposed action for each Ranger District.

This was an opportunity for the public to review the proposed actions and discuss their needs with the Forest Service. It also was an opportunity for a representative group of stakeholders to work together collaboratively to develop consensus on an alternative designated route system for each Ranger District for the Forest Service to analyze under NEPA. A “Collaborative Alternative Team” (CAT) representing a wide range of stakeholder interests and users of the Coronado’s system of routes was identified at the January 28 Forest-Wide Kickoff Workshop to serve as the consensus-building body for the five District workshops. Individuals who volunteered to serve on the CAT had the option to participate on the Core CAT and attend all the CAT meetings, or to volunteer to serve on one or more of the District CATs and attend only those Districts’ CAT meetings.

### ***Input and Consensus***

The starting point for the collaboration was each District’s proposed action. The Forest identified the following six areas that could be addressed in the collaborative process (the “decision space”). At the collaboration workshops, members of the public had the opportunity to share comments related to the proposed action with the CAT and the Forest Service. The CAT reviewed the proposed actions, discussed their needs with the Forest Service, and strived to reach consensus on how to address routes in the proposed action. For those routes on which CAT members reached consensus within the decision space, the Forest Service is considering the recommendations as an alternative to be included in the draft Environmental Assessment. The decision space included:

1. adding specific unauthorized roads to the National Forest Service (NSF) roads database, thereby, legitimizing their use as part of the District motorized travel system;
2. removing specific NFS roads from the NFS roads database (i.e., decommissioning);
3. closing or otherwise obliterating unauthorized roads by the use of signing, physical barriers and other methods that deny access for motorized use;
4. revising designated uses, seasonal closures, and/or maintenance levels (MLs) assigned to NFS roads (e.g., from “open to the public” to “administrative use only”);
5. adding or converting roads to motorized or non-motorized trails; and/or
6. designating roads or removing corridors where motorized travel will be allowed within a set distance of certain designated routes for the sole purpose of dispersed camping.

At District workshops, among the routes in the proposed action, CAT members’ route preferences were organized into three “buckets” (referred to as the “three bucket” approach):

1. Routes all CAT members agreed with (consensus)

2. Routes all CAT members agreed to with modification or mitigation (consensus)
3. Routes about which CAT members disagreed/ where consensus could not be reached (and therefore about which decisions had to be made by the District Ranger)

Routes all CAT members participating at a workshop agreed with or agreed to with modification or mitigation went into the collaboratively-developed alternative. Facilitated discussion helped CAT members discuss routes about which they disagreed and negotiate to achieve consensus on some of those routes. Then those routes also went into the collaboratively-developed alternative. For any routes about which there was still disagreement by the end of the workshop, the respective District Ranger decided whether to include them in the alternative.

### ***The Collaboration Process***

The collaboration process included meetings with tribal representatives, an initial Forest-Wide Kickoff Workshop, workshops in each District, a Four District Summary Meeting, and a Sierra Vista Summary Meeting to share results of the collaboration and next steps. Workshops typically included an overview of the process, interactive maps, poster and map sessions, and opportunities for sharing participants' travel management needs/concerns on the Forest.

Below is the list of the 16 meetings that were convened:

| Ranger District                                     | Meeting Date           | Meeting Time           | Location Address |
|---|------------------------|------------------------|------------------|
| <b>Forest Wide Kickoff Workshop</b>                 | Saturday, January 28   | 12:30 – 4:30 p.m.      | Tucson           |
| <b>CAT Kickoff Workshop Safford</b><br>(2 meetings) | Saturday, February 18  | 12:30 – 4:30 p.m.      | Benson           |
|   | Thursday, February 23  | 5:30 – 9:30 p.m.       | Safford          |
|   | Saturday, April 21     | 10:00 a.m. – 2:00 p.m. | Benson           |
| <b>Nogales</b><br>(2 meetings)                      | Tuesday, February 28   | 5:30 – 9:30 p.m.       | Nogales          |
|   | Thursday, March 29     | 5:30 – 9:30 p.m.       | Nogales          |
| <b>Santa Catalina</b><br>(3 meetings)               | Thursday, March 8      | 5:30 – 9:30 p.m.       | Tucson           |
|   | Tuesday, March 13      | 5:30 – 9:30 p.m.       | Tucson           |
|   | Wednesday, April 18    | 5:30 – 8:30 pm.        | Tucson           |
| <b>Douglas</b>                                      | Tuesday, May 8         | 5:30 – 9:30 p.m.       | Douglas          |
| <b>Sierra Vista</b><br>(4 meetings)                 | Saturday, June 2       | 11:00 a.m. – 4:00 p.m. | Sierra Vista     |
|   | Thursday, June 7       | 5:30 – 9:30 p.m.       | Benson           |
|   | Thursday, June 14      | 5:30 – 9:30 p.m.       | Sierra Vista     |
|   | Saturday, September 22 | 10:00 a.m.—4:00 p.m.   | Sierra Vista     |
| <b>Four District Summary Meeting</b>                | Saturday, August 25    | 12:30 –5:30 p.m.       | Tucson           |

| Ranger District                          | Meeting Date         | Meeting Time    | Location Address |
|--|----------------------|-----------------|------------------|
| Sierra Vista District<br>Summary Meeting | Saturday, October 27 | 1:00 —4:00 p.m. | Sierra Vista     |

## Section II: Arizona State Land Department Resolution

Ed Dietrich, the Arizona State Land Department’s representative on the CAT, sought the adoption by the CAT of a resolution that requested the Coronado National Forest “immediately begin the process of acquiring necessary access routes across State Trust Land so that legal permanent access will be available for future generations of users of the National Forest.” The CAT adopted the resolution at its Safford District CAT meeting on April 21, 2012, and the resolution is applicable across the Coronado National Forest, including all five districts of the forest. The text of the full resolution is below.

Arizona State Land Department Resolution

### RESOLVED:

Although access issues are not specifically the subject of the TMP project and the participation of the CAT team, the long term success of the TMP process is tied directly to providing legal permanent access across State Trust Lands and private lands.

In the Safford Ranger District alone there are more than 65 significant access routes that cross State Trust Land, of which the vast majority are not legal permanent routes and therefore are temporary.

All Stakeholders in the Coronado National Forest TMP will benefit from the Forest Service beginning to acquire legal permanent access.

Therefore, the CAT Team requests the Coronado National Forest to immediately begin the process of acquiring necessary access routes across State Trust Land so that legal permanent access will be available for future generations of users of the National Forest.

*Adopted by the Coronado National Forest Collaborative Alternative Team (CAT) at the Safford District meeting on April 21, 2012.*

## **Section III: Brief Summary of Safford CAT Process**

### ***Summary***

Prior to the first Safford Ranger District CAT meeting convened on February 23, 2012, Core and Safford CAT members performed pre-work which included reviewing maps, routes, and information about the routes in the Safford Ranger District's proposed action. Although CAT members were able to discuss and reach agreement on some of the Safford routes at the February 23 meeting, many routes remained to be discussed. As the meeting progressed, CAT members shared some of the challenges they experienced preparing for the meeting. Among those challenges was not having the substantive information necessary from the Forest Service, other members of the CAT and members of the public with on-the-ground experience in the District. Seeking solutions to these challenges, they made suggestions for process changes that would help inform their collaboration on the Forest Service's proposed route changes and help them focus on each District sequentially.

The CAT recommended that their proposed process changes be implemented at the Nogales Ranger District CAT meeting, scheduled February 28, and depending on the outcome of that meeting, the Core CAT would determine whether or not to meet again to collaborate on the remaining routes in the Safford Ranger District. At the conclusion of the Nogales Ranger District CAT meeting, the Core CAT members agreed to schedule another Safford Ranger District CAT meeting, disregard the work conducted at the February 23 CAT meeting, and reinstate its work on the Safford Ranger District's proposed action. On April 21, 2012, the Core and Safford District CAT members met again in Benson, Arizona, and completed their work on the District's proposed action.

At both meetings, members of the public were given the opportunity to attend and provide written comments. Also, the U.S. Forest Service (USFS) staff helped CAT members locate routes on maps, answered questions, and served as resources for CAT information requests at both meetings. At the April 21 Safford CAT Meeting, the Safford District Ranger and his staff provided an overview of the District's travel management process and criteria that influenced its proposed action. Comments from the public were shared with the CAT. CAT members indicated, by placing dots on a large spreadsheet, where they disagreed with the Forest Service's proposed action, discussed 13 routes about which there was most disagreement, and achieved consensus on 11 of the 13 routes. The CAT agreed to suspend discussion of Galiuro route 660 until after members of the CAT conducted on-the-ground research of the route. This route was subsequently discussed by Core CAT members at the May 7 Douglas Ranger District CAT meeting. No agreement was reached on the proposal for the route. The Core CAT members then agreed that their work on the Safford Ranger District's proposed action was complete.

### ***Statistics***

Statistics for the Safford proposed action are as follows:

- The total number of routes in the Safford Ranger District's proposed action is 94.

Statistics for the CAT's collaboratively developed alternative for the Safford District are as follows:

- CAT members reached consensus on 50 routes. These routes automatically became part of the collaboratively developed alternative.
- CAT members did not reach consensus on 44 routes from the proposed action. The Safford District Ranger then determined how to address those routes in this alternative.
- After the Safford District Ranger completed work on the remaining routes for this alternative, the final collaboratively alternative(Appendix A) was presented to CAT members and the public at the August 25, 2012, Four District Wrap-up meeting and will be analyzed under the National Environmental Policy Act (NEPA).

**Appendix A: Safford Final Collaboratively Developed Alternative**

([http://www.fs.usda.gov/Internet/FSE\\_DOCUMENTS/stelprdb5401993.pdf](http://www.fs.usda.gov/Internet/FSE_DOCUMENTS/stelprdb5401993.pdf))

**Safford District Workshop/CAT Meeting Attendees**

Two Safford District Workshop/CAT Meetings were convened: one on February 23, 2012 in Safford, AZ, and one on April 21, 2012 in Benson, AZ. In addition to the CAT Members, Forest Service and U.S. Institute for Environmental Conflict Resolution (U.S. Institute) Staff listed in the table below, three (3) members of the public attended the February 23 meeting and two (2) members of the public attended the April 21 meeting.

**CAT Members**

| <b>Name</b>           | <b>Affiliation</b>   | <b>2/23/2012</b> | <b>4/21/2012</b> |
|-----------------------|--|------------------|------------------|
| <b>Rebecca Antle</b>  | AZ State Assn. of 4 Wheel Drive Clubs; Tucson Rough Riders | X                | X                |
| <b>Duane Aubuchon</b> | Arizona Game and Fish                                      | X                | X                |
| <b>Larry Audsley</b>  | AZ Wildlife Federation; Hunting/Wildlife Conservation      | X                |                  |
| <b>Joe Chapin</b>     | Resident   | X                | X                |
| <b>Patrick Connor</b> | Equestrian; Archeology                                     | X                | X                |
| <b>Mary Darling</b>   | Cochise County and City of Sierra Vista                    | X                |                  |
| <b>Ed Dietrich</b>    | Arizona State Land Department                              | X                | X                |
| <b>David Hodges</b>   | Natural Allies; Multiple                                   | X                | X                |
| <b>Peter Hughes</b>   | Odyssey Trails Tour Company, LLC                           | X                | X                |

| <b>Name</b>             | <b>Affiliation</b>   | <b>2/23/2012</b> | <b>4/21/2012</b> |
|-------------------------|--|------------------|------------------|
| <b>Matt Martin</b>      | Permittee  | X                |                  |
| <b>Rod Mondt</b>        | Sky Island Alliance  | X                | X                |
| <b>Marie Pyeatt</b>     | Rancher  | X                | X                |
| <b>Steve Saway</b>      | Cochise Trails Association /<br>(alternate for Peter Hughes after<br>Peter left the meeting) |                  | X                |
| <b>Chuck Smallhouse</b> | Rancher  | X                | X                |
| <b>Cyndi Tuell</b>      | Center for Biological Diversity  | X                | *                |
| <b>Mike Turisk</b>      | Cochise County Government<br>(alternate for Chris Kemmerly)                                  | X                |                  |
| <b>Matthew Walton</b>   | Arizona Game and Fish  | X                | X                |
| <b>Daniel Ward</b>      | Southeast Arizona Sportsmen<br>Association   | X                | X                |

*\*Withdrew from the CAT*

**Forest Service Staff**

| <b>Names</b>          | <b>Title</b>   | <b>2/23/2012</b> | <b>4/21/2012</b> |
|-----------------------|--|------------------|------------------|
| <b>Anne Casey</b>     | District Biologist                                   | X                | X                |
| <b>Eli Curiel, PE</b> | Transportation<br>Engineer/Environmental<br>Engineer | X                | X                |
| <b>Chuck Duncan</b>   | Rangeland/Watershed                                  |                  | X                |
| <b>Kent Ellett</b>    | Safford District Ranger                              | X                | X                |
| <b>Kathy Makansi</b>  | Archeologist   | X                | X                |
| <b>Devin Quintana</b> | Cartographer   | X                |                  |

| <b>Names</b>                 | <b>Title</b>                        | <b>2/23/2012</b> | <b>4/21/2012</b> |
|------------------------------|-------------------------------------|------------------|------------------|
| <b>Misty Shafiqullah, PE</b> | Engineering and Minerals Engineer   | X                | X                |
| <b>Debra Whitall</b>         | Acting Deputy Forest Superintendent |                  | X                |
| <b>Buddy Zale</b>            | Travel Management Lead              | X                | X                |

**U.S. Institute Staff**

|                        |   |   |   |
|------------------------|---|---|---|
| <b>Debra Drecksell</b> | Senior Program Manager / Senior Facilitator | X | X |
| <b>Patricia Lewis</b>  | Senior Program Associate                    | X | X |

## **Section IV: Brief Summary of Nogales CAT Process**

### ***Summary***

Prior to meeting, Core and Nogales Collaborative Alternative Team members performed pre-work which included reviewing maps, routes, and information about the routes in the Nogales District's proposed action. Based on these resources and getting input from others, CAT members determined which routes in the proposed action they disagreed with. Then they met twice to collaboratively develop an alternative to the Nogales District's proposed action.

At both meetings, members of the public were given the opportunity to attend and provide written comments. Also at both meetings, U.S. Forest Service (USFS) staff helped CAT members locate routes on maps, answered questions, and served as resources for CAT information requests.

At the February 28, 2012 Nogales CAT Meeting, CAT members placed dots on spreadsheets on the wall indicating routes where they disagreed with the proposed action. From those spreadsheets, areas of agreement and disagreement were identified. CAT members began discussing some of the routes about which there was the most disagreement. CAT members also generated process improvements for future CAT meetings.

At the March 29, 2012 Nogales CAT Meeting, CAT members requested and listened to a brief overview by the Nogales District Ranger and staff of the proposed action, asked questions, and contributed ideas. CAT members continued discussing routes where there was most disagreement and came to consensus on almost all those routes. At the end of the meeting, CAT members agreed that their work on the Nogales collaboratively developed alternative was complete.

### ***Statistics***

Statistics for the Nogales proposed action are as follows:

- The total number of routes in the Nogales proposed action is 366.
- By Ecological Management Area, this is comprised as follows:
  - Tumacacori has 138 routes in the proposed action.
  - Santa Rita has 228 routes in the proposed action.

Statistics for the CAT's collaboratively developed alternative for Nogales are as follows:

- CAT members reached consensus on 245 routes. These routes automatically became part of the collaboratively developed alternative.
- CAT members did not reach consensus on 121 routes from the proposed action. The Nogales District Ranger then determined how to address those routes in this alternative.
- After the Nogales District Ranger completed work on the remaining routes for this alternative, the final collaboratively alternative (Appendix B) was presented to CAT members and the public at the August 25, 2012, Four District Wrap-up meeting and will be analyzed under the National Environmental Policy Act (NEPA).

**Appendix B: Nogales Final Collaboratively Developed Alternative**

([http://www.fs.usda.gov/Internet/FSE\\_DOCUMENTS/stelprdb5401989.pdf](http://www.fs.usda.gov/Internet/FSE_DOCUMENTS/stelprdb5401989.pdf))

**Nogales District Workshop/CAT Meeting Attendees**

Two Nogales District Workshop/CAT Meetings were convened: one on February 28 and one on March 29, 2012. In addition to the CAT Members and Forest Service Staff listed in the table below, six (6) members of the public attended the February 28 meeting and seven (7) members of the public attended the March 29 meeting.

**CAT Members**

| <b>Name</b>             | <b>Affiliation</b>  | <b>2/28/2012</b> | <b>3/29/2012</b> |
|-------------------------|---|------------------|------------------|
| <b>Rebecca Antle</b>    | AZ State Assn. of 4 Wheel Drive Clubs;<br>Tucson Rough Riders | X                | X                |
| <b>Larry Audsley</b>    | AZ Wildlife Federation; Hunting/Wildlife<br>Conservation      | X                |                  |
| <b>Dan Bell</b>         | ZZ Cattle Corporation   | X                | X                |
| <b>Patrick Connor</b>   | Equestrian; Archeology  | X                | X                |
| <b>Mary Darling</b>     | Cochise county and City of Sierra Vista                       | X                |                  |
| <b>Ed Dietrich</b>      | AZ State Land Department                                      | X                | X                |
| <b>David Hodges</b>     | Natural Allies; Multiple                                      | X                | X                |
| <b>Peter Hughes</b>     | Odyssey Trails Tour Company, LLC                              | X                | *                |
| <b>Rod Mondt</b>        | Sky Island Alliance   | X                | ***              |
| <b>Marie Pyeatt</b>     | Rancher   | X                | X                |
| <b>Jim Riley</b>        | Green Valley Hiking Club                                      | X                | X                |
| <b>Chuck Smallhouse</b> | Rancher   | X                | X                |
| <b>Cyndi Tuell</b>      | Center for Biological Diversity                               | X                | ***              |

| <b>Name</b>           | <b>Affiliation</b>   | <b>2/28/2012</b> | <b>3/29/2012</b> |
|-----------------------|--|------------------|------------------|
| <b>Matthew Walton</b> | Arizona Game and Fish  | X                | X                |
| <b>Mark Williams</b>  | Mountain Empire Alliance; American Endurance Ride Conference | **               | X                |

\*Peter Hughes was represented by Rebecca Antle at the 3/29 meeting

\*\* Mark Williams attended as an observer at the 2/28 meeting

\*\*\*Withdrew from the CAT

**Forest Service Staff**

| <b>Name</b>                  | <b>Title</b>                                   | <b>2/28/2012</b> | <b>3/29/2012</b> |
|------------------------------|--|------------------|------------------|
| <b>Eli Curiel , PE</b>       | Transportation Engineer/Environmental Engineer | X                | X                |
| <b>Jim Coleman</b>           | Off-Highway Vehicles Coordinator               | X                | X                |
| <b>Jim Copeland</b>          | Nogales District Ranger                        | X                | X                |
| <b>Art Elek</b>              | Fire Prevention Officer                        | X                | X                |
| <b>Sean Lockwood</b>         | Range Staff                                    | X                | X                |
| <b>Shane Lyman</b>           | Fire Management Officer                        | X                | X                |
| <b>Devin Quintana</b>        | Cartographer                                   | X                | X                |
| <b>Kathy Makensi</b>         | Archeologist                                   |                  | X                |
| <b>Veronica Rascon</b>       | Support Services Specialist                    | X                | X                |
| <b>Deborah Sebesta</b>       | District Biologist                             |                  | X                |
| <b>Misty Shafiqullah, PE</b> | Engineering and Minerals Engineer              | X                | X                |
| <b>Jim Upchurch</b>          | Coronado National Forest Supervisor            | X                |                  |

**U.S. Institute Staff**

| <b>Name</b>           | <b>Title</b>                              | <b>2/28/2012</b> | <b>3/29/2012</b> |
|-----------------------|---|------------------|------------------|
| <b>Debra Drechsel</b> | Senior Program Manager/Senior Facilitator | X                | X                |
| <b>Patricia Lewis</b> | Senior Program Associate                  | X                | X                |

## **Section V: Brief Summary of Santa Catalina CAT Process**

### ***Summary***

Prior to the first Santa Catalina District CAT meeting held on March 8, 2012, Core and Santa Catalina District CAT members performed pre-work which included reviewing maps, routes, and information about the routes in the Santa Catalina District's proposed action. At the meeting, at the request of CAT members, District Ranger Stan Helin and staff from the Santa Catalina District provided an overview of the District's Travel Management Process to date, described in general the current system of routes, and answered questions from the CAT about specific routes and rationales for the District's proposed Action.

Based on these resources and getting input from others, CAT members determined which routes in the proposed action they disagreed with. At the end of the March 8 meeting, the CAT requested to meet again on March 13 to continue their work on collaboratively developing an alternative to the Santa Catalina District's proposed action. At CAT members' request, a third meeting was held on April 18, to discuss a subset of CAT members' proposals related to proposed parking in the Redington Pass area and routes in the Happy Valley area. A list of CAT members, U.S. Forest Service staff and U.S. Institute staff attending the meetings is included at the bottom of this summary.

At all three meetings, members of the public were given the opportunity to attend and provide written comments. Also, the U.S. Forest Service (USFS) staff helped CAT members locate routes on maps, answered questions, and served as resources for CAT information requests at all three meetings. At the March 8 Santa Catalina CAT Meeting, CAT members placed dots on spreadsheets on the wall indicating routes where they disagreed with the proposed action. At the March 13 meeting, using those spreadsheets, areas of agreement and disagreement were enumerated and CAT members discussed 17 routes on which there was most disagreement and achieved consensus on 12 of the 17 routes.

At the April 18, 2012, Santa Catalina CAT Meeting, CAT members considered proposals related to Happy Valley routes developed by a subgroup of the CAT and a proposal related to proposed parking in the Redington Pass area developed by one of the CAT members. The CAT did not reach consensus on the Happy Valley routes proposals. They did recommend that the District Ranger explore where, near the Three Ponds area in Redington Pass, an enclosed, reinforced parking area that prevents jumping off points for motorized vehicles from the parking area, such as an enclosed cul-de-sac, might be provided by the Forest Service. At the end of the meeting, CAT members agreed that their work on the Santa Catalina District collaboratively developed alternative was complete.

### ***Statistics***

Statistics for the Santa Catalina proposed action are as follows:

- The total number of routes in the Santa Catalina proposed action is 147.

Statistics for the CAT's collaboratively developed alternative for Santa Catalina are as follows:

- CAT members reached consensus on 68 routes. These routes automatically became part of the collaboratively developed alternative.

- CAT members did not reach consensus on 79 routes from the proposed action. The Santa Catalina District Ranger then determined how to address those routes in this alternative.
- After the Santa Catalina District Ranger completed work on the remaining routes for this alternative, the final collaboratively alternative (Appendix C) was presented to CAT members and the public at the August 25, 2012, Four District Wrap-up meeting and will be analyzed under the National Environmental Policy Act (NEPA).

**Appendix C: Santa Catalina Final Collaboratively Developed Alternative**

([http://www.fs.usda.gov/Internet/FSE\\_DOCUMENTS/stelprdb5401994.pdf](http://www.fs.usda.gov/Internet/FSE_DOCUMENTS/stelprdb5401994.pdf))

**Santa Catalina District Workshop/CAT Meeting Attendees**

Three Santa Catalina District Workshop/CAT Meetings were convened: on March 8, March 13 and April 18, 2012. In addition to the CAT Members and Forest Service Staff listed in the table below, nine (9) members of the public attended the March 8 meeting; four (4) attended the March 13 meeting; and four (4) attended the April 18, 2012, meeting.

**CAT Members**

| <b>Name</b>           | <b>Affiliation</b>   | <b>3/8/2012</b> | <b>3/13/2012</b> | <b>4/18/2012</b> |
|-----------------------|--|-----------------|------------------|------------------|
| <b>Rebecca Antle</b>  | AZ State Assn. of 4 Wheel Drive Clubs; Tucson Rough Riders | X               | X                | X                |
| <b>Larry Audsley</b>  | AZ Wildlife Federation; Hunting/Wildlife Conservation      | X               |                  |                  |
| <b>Dave Bertelsen</b> | School of Natural Resources & the Environment/UofA         | X               | X                | X                |
| <b>Patrick Connor</b> | Equestrian; Archeology                                     | X               | X                | X                |
| <b>Bob Cote</b>       | Rancher; Permittee   | X               | X                | X                |
| <b>Mary Darling</b>   | Cochise County and City of Sierra Vista                    | X               |                  |                  |
| <b>Ed Dietrich</b>    | Arizona State Land Department                              | X               | X                | X                |
| <b>Bob Erickson</b>   | Biker; Hiker; Neighbor; Friends of Redington Pass          | X               | X                | X                |
| <b>David Hodges</b>   | Natural Allies; Multiple                                   | X               | X                | X                |
| <b>Peter Hughes</b>   | Odyssey Trails Tour Company, LLC                           | X               | X                | X                |

| <b>Name</b>             | <b>Affiliation</b>  | <b>3/8/2012</b> | <b>3/13/2012</b> | <b>4/18/2012</b> |
|-------------------------|---|-----------------|------------------|------------------|
| <b>Arvie Lake</b>       | Friends of Redington Pass; La Cebadilla Estates; Hiking; Horseback Riding | X               | X                | X                |
| <b>Vaughn Nezelek</b>   | Tucson Rough Riders; Hunting Access                                       | X               | X                |                  |
| <b>Doug Nutter</b>      | Friends of Redington Pass; Resident                                       | X               | X                | X                |
| <b>Marie Pyeatt</b>     | Rancher   | X               | X                | X                |
| <b>Chuck Smallhouse</b> | Rancher   | X               | X                | X                |
| <b>Matthew Walton</b>   | AZ Game and Fish  | X               | X                | X                |

**Forest Service Staff**

| <b>Name</b>                  | <b>Title</b>                                   | <b>3/8/2012</b> | <b>3/13/2012</b> | <b>4/18/2012</b> |
|------------------------------|--|-----------------|------------------|------------------|
| <b>Eli Curiel, PE</b>        | Transportation Engineer/Environmental Engineer | X               | X                | X                |
| <b>Tim Connor</b>            | Range Staff                                    | X               |                  |                  |
| <b>Stan Helin</b>            | District Ranger                                | X               | X                | X                |
| <b>Kathy Makansi</b>         | Archeologist                                   |                 | X                | X                |
| <b>Sylvia Nunez</b>          | Contract Specialist                            | X               |                  |                  |
| <b>Devin Quintana</b>        | Cartographer                                   | X               | X                |                  |
| <b>Misty Shafiqullah, PE</b> | Engineering and Minerals Engineer              | X               | X                | X                |
| <b>Josh Taiz</b>             | District Biologist                             | X               | X                | X                |
| <b>Jim Upchurch</b>          | Coronado National Forest Supervisor            |                 | X                |                  |
| <b>Debra Whitall</b>         | Acting Deputy Forest Supervisor                |                 | X                | X                |

| <b>Name</b>           | <b>Affiliation</b>                          | <b>3/8/2012</b> | <b>3/13/2012</b> | <b>4/18/2012</b> |
|-----------------------|---|-----------------|------------------|------------------|
| <b>Debra Drechsel</b> | Senior Program Manager / Senior Facilitator | X               | X                | X                |
| <b>Pat Lewis</b>      | Senior Program Associate                    | X               | X                | X                |

## **Section VI: Brief Summary of Douglas CAT Process**

### ***Summary***

Prior to the May 8, 2012 Douglas Ranger District CAT meeting Core and Douglas District CAT members performed pre-work which included reviewing maps, routes, and information about the routes in the Douglas District's proposed action. At the meeting, at the request of CAT members, District Ranger Bill Edwards and staff from the Douglas Ranger District provided an overview of the District's Travel Management Process to date, described in general the current system of routes, and answered questions from the CAT about specific routes and rationales for the District's proposed Action. Based on these resources and getting input from others, CAT members determined which routes in the proposed action they disagreed with. Members of the public present were given the opportunity to attend and provide written comments. Also, the U.S. Forest Service (USFS) staff helped CAT members locate routes on maps, answered questions, and served as resources for CAT information requests at all three meetings. A list of CAT members, U.S. Forest Service staff and U.S. Institute staff attending the meetings is attached to the bottom of this summary.

At the May 8 meeting, CAT members placed dots on spreadsheets on the wall indicating routes where they disagreed with the proposed action. Using the results of those spreadsheets, areas of agreement and disagreement were enumerated, CAT members discussed 20 routes about which there was the most disagreement, and achieved consensus on 17 of the 20 routes. At the end of the meeting, CAT members agreed that their work on the Douglas Ranger District's collaboratively developed alternative was complete.

### ***Statistics***

Statistics for the Douglas Ranger District's proposed action are as follows:

- The total number of routes in the Douglas proposed action is 255.

Statistics for the CAT's collaboratively developed alternative for Douglas are as follows:

- CAT members reached consensus on 171 routes. These routes automatically became part of the collaboratively developed alternative.
- CAT members did not reach consensus on 84 routes from the proposed action. The Douglas District Ranger then determined how to address those routes in this alternative.
- After the Douglas District Ranger completed work on the remaining routes for this alternative, the final alternative(Appendix D) was presented to CAT members and the public at the August 25, 2012, Four District Wrap-up meeting and will be analyzed under the National Environmental Policy Act (NEPA).

### ***Appendix D: Douglas Final Collaboratively Developed Alternative***

**[http://www.fs.usda.gov/Internet/FSE\\_DOCUMENTS/stelprdb5401979.pdf](http://www.fs.usda.gov/Internet/FSE_DOCUMENTS/stelprdb5401979.pdf)**

**Douglas District Workshop/CAT Meeting Attendees**

One Douglas District Workshop/CAT Meeting was convened May 8, 2012. Twelve (12) Core and Douglas District CAT members participated; three (3) CAT members (not present) were represented by alternates who attended the meeting. In addition to the CAT Members and Forest Service Staff listed in the table below, two (2) members of the public attended the May 8 meeting.

**CAT Members**

| <b>Name</b>             | <b>Affiliation</b>  | <b>May 8, 2012</b> |
|-------------------------|---|--------------------|
| <b>Duane Aubuchon</b>   | Arizona Game & Fish / <b>Alternate for Matt Walton</b>                      | X                  |
| <b>Patrick Connor</b>   | Equestrian; Archeology  | X                  |
| <b>Mary Darling</b>     | Cochise County and City of Sierra Vista                                     | X                  |
| <b>Ed Dietrich</b>      | Arizona State Land Department   | X                  |
| <b>Meira Gault</b>      | Hidalgo County Public Lands Advisory Committee;<br>Local Government         | X                  |
| <b>David Hodges</b>     | Natural Allies; Multiple / <b>Alternate for Matt Skroch</b>                 | X                  |
| <b>Peter Hughes</b>     | Odyssey Trails Tour Company, LLC / <b>Alternate for Rebecca Antle</b>       | X                  |
| <b>Chris Kemmerly</b>   | Cochise County Public Lands Advisory Council;<br>County Official            | X                  |
| <b>Bill McDonald</b>    | Malpai Borderlands Group; Grazing Permittee                                 | X                  |
| <b>Marie Pyeatt</b>     | Rancher   | X                  |
| <b>Chuck Smallhouse</b> | Rancher   | X                  |
| <b>Harry Stacy</b>      | Cochise Trail Association; Arizona Public Lands Association; Hunting/Hiking | X                  |

**Forest Service Staff**

| <b>Name</b>             | <b>Title</b>                                   | <b>May 8, 2012</b> |
|-------------------------|--|--------------------|
| <b>Eli Curiel, PE</b>   | Transportation Engineer/Environmental Engineer | X                  |
| <b>Bill Edwards</b>     | Douglas District Ranger                        | X                  |
| <b>Veronica Forrest</b> | Support Services Specialist                    | X                  |
| <b>Joe Harris</b>       | Range/Watershed Staff                          | X                  |
| <b>Ruben Morales</b>    | Travel Management Project Lead                 | X                  |
| <b>Devin Quintana</b>   | Cartographer                                   | X                  |

**U.S. Institute Staff**

| <b>Name</b>            | <b>Title</b>                                | <b>May 8, 2012</b> |
|------------------------|---|--------------------|
| <b>Debra Drecksell</b> | Senior Program Manager / Senior Facilitator | X                  |
| <b>Pat Lewis</b>       | Senior Program Associate                    | X                  |

## **Section VII: Brief Summary of Sierra Vista CAT Process**

### ***Summary***

Given the large number of routes in the Sierra Vista District's proposed action and the very engaged public in this area, a Sierra Vista District Workshop with an expanded public component was held on June 2, 2012. Core and Sierra Vista CAT members and the public attended the workshop which included an overview of the travel management and CAT processes and the Sierra Vista District's proposed action. It also included the use of collaborative technology tools at and after the workshop to allow for greater input from CAT members and the public. Prior to that workshop, Core and Sierra Vista CAT members performed pre-work which included reviewing maps, routes, and information about the routes in the Sierra Vista District's proposed action. After the June 2 workshop, a report of the input was provided to the workshop participants.

Based on these resources and getting input from others, CAT members determined which routes in the Sierra Vista District's proposed action they disagreed with. Between the June 2 Sierra Vista District Workshop and the June 7 Sierra Vista CAT Meeting, CAT members indicated on electronic spreadsheets the routes on which they disagreed with the proposed action.

Sierra Vista CAT Meetings were held on June 7 and 14 and September 22, 2012. At these meetings, at the request of CAT members, District Ranger Kathleen Nelson (in June) followed by District Ranger Mark Ruggiero (in September) and staff from the Sierra Vista District provided overviews of the District's Travel Management process to date, described in general the current system of routes, and answered questions from the CAT members about specific routes and rationales for the District's proposed action. At the end of the June 7 meeting, the CAT requested to meet again on June 14 to continue their work on collaboratively developing an alternative to the Sierra Vista District's proposed action. At the end of the June 14 meeting, CAT members requested a third meeting to be held in the fall and formed informal Working Groups to develop proposals over the summer to bring back to the CAT in the fall. The Huachuca Ride the Roads Working Group met and developed proposals which the CAT discussed at its September 22 meeting. The Northern Whetstones Working Group interviewed some landowners in the northern Whetstones and shared the written results of those interviews with the CAT, the Forest Service, and facilitators.

A list of CAT members, U.S. Forest Service (USFS) staff and U.S. Institute staff attending the workshop and meetings is attached to the bottom of this summary.

At the workshop and all three CAT meetings, members of the public were given the opportunity to attend and provide written comments. USFS staff also helped CAT members and the public locate routes on maps, answered questions, and served as resources information requests from CAT members at the workshop, all three meetings, and the Huachuca Ride the Roads Working Group meeting.

At the end of the September 22 CAT meeting, CAT members agreed that their work on the Sierra Vista District collaboratively developed alternative was complete. They also agreed that CAT members could

send written input to Sierra Vista District Ranger Mark Ruggiero prior to October 9, 2012 for him to consider as he made his determinations on “Bucket 3” routes. Several CAT members did so.

**Statistics**

Statistics for the Sierra Vista proposed action are as follows:

- The total number of routes in the Sierra Vista proposed action is 733.

Statistics for the CAT’s collaboratively developed alternative for Sierra Vista are as follows:

- CAT members reached consensus on 65 routes. These routes automatically became part of the collaboratively developed alternative.
- CAT members did not reach consensus on 668 routes from the proposed action. The Sierra Vista District Ranger determined how to address those routes in this alternative.
- After the Sierra Vista District Ranger completed work on the remaining routes for this alternative, the final collaboratively developed alternative (Appendix E) was presented to CAT members and the public on Saturday, October 27, 2012, and will be analyzed under the National Environmental Policy Act (NEPA).

**Appendix E: Sierra Vista Final Collaboratively Developed Alternative**

[http://www.fs.usda.gov/Internet/FSE\\_DOCUMENTS/stelprdb5401992.pdf](http://www.fs.usda.gov/Internet/FSE_DOCUMENTS/stelprdb5401992.pdf)

**Sierra Vista District Workshop/CAT Meetings Attendees**

In addition to the June 2, 2012, Sierra Vista Ranger District Workshop, attended by members of the public and the Sierra Vista District and Core CAT members, three District CAT Meetings were convened: one on June 7 in Benson, Arizona; one on June 14 in Sierra Vista; and one on September 22 in Sierra Vista. In addition to the CAT Members, Forest Service and U.S. Institute for Environmental Conflict Resolution (U.S. Institute) staff listed in the table below, 10 members of the public attended the June 2 and June 7 meetings; 18 members of the public attended the June 14 meeting and 6 members of the public attended the September 22 meeting.

**CAT Members**

| Name                | Affiliation  | 6/2/2012 | 6/7/2012 | 6/14/2012 | 9/22/2012 |
|---------------------|--|----------|----------|-----------|-----------|
| Rebecca Antle       | Arizona State Association of 4WD Clubs & Tucson Rough Riders | X        | X        | X         | X         |
| Richard Barba (Alt) | Alternate for John Millican                                  |          |          | X         | X         |
| Nathan Beneze       | Landowner & Hunter   | X        | X        | X         | X         |
| Patrick Connor      | Equestrian and Archeology                                    |          | X        | X         | X         |

| Name                  | Affiliation  | 6/2/2012 | 6/7/2012 | 6/14/2012 | 9/22/2012 |
|-----------------------|--|----------|----------|-----------|-----------|
| Mary Darling          | Cochise County & City of Sierra Vista  | X        | X        | X         |           |
| Joanne Daley          | Alternate for Rachel Thomas  |          |          |           | X         |
| Ed Dietrich           | Arizona State Land Department  | X        | X        | X         | *         |
| David Hodges          | Natural Allies/Multiple  | X        | X        | X         | X         |
| Peter Hughes          | Odyssey Trails Tour Company, LLC   | X        |          |           | X         |
| Harry S. Lodge (Alt.) | Alternate for Patrick Connor   |          |          |           | X         |
| Mary McCool           | Cochise Trails Association   |          | X        | X         | X         |
| John Millican         | Cochise County Public Lands Council; National Wild Turkey Federation – Huachuca Goulds Chapter | X        | X        |           |           |
| Marie Pyeatt          | Rancher  | X        | X        | X         | X         |
| Steve Saway (Alt)     | Alternate for Mary McCool  | X        |          |           | X         |
| Chuck Smallhouse      | Rancher  | X        | X        | X         |           |
| Chris Sterner         | President, local Huachuca Whitetail Club   | X        | X        | X         | X         |
| Tom Tierney           | Prospecting  | X        | X        | X         |           |
| Mike Turisk (Alt)     | Alternate for Mary Darling   |          |          |           | X         |
| Rachel Thomas         | Hereford Natural Resources District  | X        | X        | X         |           |
| Matthew Walton        | Arizona Game & Fish  | X        | X        | X         | X         |
| Randy Williams        | 4X4s   | X        | X        |           | X         |

| Name                    | Affiliation  | 6/2/2012 | 6/7/2012 | 6/14/2012 | 9/22/2012 |
|-------------------------|--|----------|----------|-----------|-----------|
| Beverly Wilson<br>(Alt) | Cochise County Public Lands<br>Advisory Council; County Official<br>– Alternate for Chris Kemmerly | X        | X        |           | X         |

*\* Withdrew from the collaboration after contract with AZ State Land Department ended*

**Forest Service Staff**

| Name              | Title   | 6/2/2012 | 6/7/2012 | 6/14/2012 | 9/22/2012 |
|-------------------|---|----------|----------|-----------|-----------|
| Drew Core         | Law Enforcement   |          | X        | X         |           |
| Eli Curiel        | Transportation<br>Engineer/Environmental Engineer               | X        | X        | X         |           |
| Duane Bennett     | Acting Sierra Vista District Ranger                             |          |          | X         |           |
| Melinda Fisher    | Sierra Vista Ranger District Acting<br>Biologist                | X        |          | X         |           |
| Shane Hall        | Sierra Vista Ranger District – Fire                             |          | X        |           |           |
| James Heitholt    | Sierra Vista Ranger District<br>Rangeland Management Specialist | X        |          |           | X         |
| Thomas Lorenz     | Sierra Vista Ranger District Range &<br>Watershed Staff         | X        | X        | X         | X         |
| Kathleen Nelson   | Sierra Vista District Ranger                                    | X        |          | X         |           |
| Devin Quintana    | Cartographer  | X        | X        |           | X         |
| Mark Ruggerio     | District Ranger   |          |          |           | X         |
| Chris Schroger    | Archeologist  | X        |          |           |           |
| Misty Shafiqullah | Acting District Ranger – Douglas<br>District                    | X        | X        | X         | X         |
| Peggy Wilson      | Travel Management Lead  | X        | X        | X         | X         |

**U.S. Institute Staff**

| <b>Name</b>     | <b>Title</b>                              | <b>6/2/2012</b> | <b>6/7/2012</b> | <b>6/14/2012</b> | <b>9/22/2012</b> |
|-----------------|---|-----------------|-----------------|------------------|------------------|
| Debra Drecksell | Senior Program Manager/Senior Facilitator | X               | X               | X                | X                |
| Patricia Lewis  | Senior Associate                          | X               | X               | X                | X                |

## Section VIII: NEPA Next Steps

Andrea Wargo Campbell, Coronado National Forest Service NEPA Coordinator, attended the August 25, 2012, Four District Summary meeting and the October 27, 2012, Sierra Vista Summary meeting to explain how the collaboratively developed alternative will be integrated into the NEPA process and the draft Environmental Assessment (EA). She noted that the public scoping period for the Forest Service's proposed action was over 90 days for each district.

1. Under the NEPA process, the CAT's collaboratively developed alternative for each district will be analyzed along with the Forest Service's proposed action and the "no-action" alternative. (Three (3) alternatives will be analyzed.)
2. A summary of the scoping comments received on the Forest Service's proposed action will be included in the draft EA.
3. After the collaboratively developed alternative, the Forest Service's proposed action, and the no action alternative have been analyzed for potential environmental impacts, a draft EA will be published. The EA publishing date for each district will vary.
4. The public will have the opportunity to comment on the draft EA for 30 days. The comments received on the draft EA will be addressed in the final EA and will be part of the Forest Service's record.

## Section IX: U.S. Institute Recommendations and Conclusion

The Coronado travel management collaboration convened and facilitated by the U.S. Institute is now complete.

### ***Recommendations***

Moving forward, the U.S. Institute offers the following suggestions and opportunities for ongoing collaboration:

- 1. Continue Working Together Collaboratively**  
We suggest that Coronado National Forest staff and CAT members continue the understanding and relationships they have developed during the collaboration and build on those as they work together on future travel management and other endeavors.
- 2. Collaborate on Future Travel Analysis Plans (TAPs)**  
We suggest that future Travel Analysis Plan (TAP) processes integrate additional early collaborative input from groups and individuals such as those on the CAT.

### **3. Acquire access routes across State Trust Land**

We suggest that Coronado National Forest “immediately begin the process of acquiring necessary access routes across State Trust Land so that legal permanent access will be available for future generations of users of the National Forest” as recommended by the CAT.

### **4. Develop a travel management Implementation Team**

We suggest that Coronado National Forest staff develops an Implementation Team to support the implementation of the travel management decisions that ultimately come through the NEPA process. The U.S. Forest Service has a Route and Area Designation Implementation Guide at the following link which provides ideas for how this can be achieved:

[http://www.fs.fed.us/recreation/programs/ohv/ohv\\_route\\_area\\_implementation\\_guide.pdf](http://www.fs.fed.us/recreation/programs/ohv/ohv_route_area_implementation_guide.pdf)

According to the Implementation Guide, successful implementation will require the following:

- A long-term commitment and support from forest leadership, including adequate funding and staffing. To facilitate this, a steering committee could be formed, including line officers, key staff and law enforcement. The role of the steering committee would be to provide resources and direction to the implementation team.
- Support from the public. It is important to maintain and improve the relationships with the public that were built during the planning process. Volunteers and partners may be willing to help in many ways including route maintenance, route construction and rehabilitation, monitoring, support for resource protection objectives, compliance with the MVUM and education of other forest visitors.
- Support from other agencies and partners. Many other Federal, State and local agencies have a stake in the outcome and may have funding opportunities.
- An integrated effort among the many programs that have a stake in the outcome. To be successful, implementation cannot be the responsibility of just one program area. An interdisciplinary team approach is suggested.
- A willingness to continually evaluate our efforts and constantly strive to improve.

### **Conclusion**

Coronado National Forest (CNF) staff and CAT members deserve high recognition for the extraordinary effort and care they contributed to this travel management collaboration. Everyone gained from their participation in this process and the results are stronger because of their efforts.

The hours devoted and miles driven by CAT members are remarkable. With CNF serving as an informational resource, CAT members worked hard to educate themselves on the routes and the needs of the interests they represented. It was gratifying to witness their well thought-out participation. In particular, Core CAT members and Coronado National Forest staff from the Forest Supervisor’s office who prepared for, drove to, and participated in and followed up on most or all 16 meetings each, spent well over 100 hours and drove well over 1,000 miles. District CAT members and Coronado District staff also spent many hours and drove many miles. All CAT members were volunteers and received no monetary compensation or reimbursement for their time and mileage. These efforts showed true commitment to the process and the quality of its outcome.

This collaboration serves as a model of what government and citizens can do by working together constructively. We appreciate the opportunity to have worked with such outstanding individuals and groups.