

Chris French

Controlled Corresp: 8511674

December 17, 2018

James Hubbard, Deputy Under Secretary
National Resources and Environment
U.S. Forest Service
U.S. Department of Agriculture
1400 Independence Ave, SW
Washington, DC 20250-1111

Sent via: U.S. Mail

RE: Removal of Retracted Report

Dear Deputy Under Secretary Hubbard:

Please accept my warmest congratulations on your nomination to the USDA! I am writing on behalf of the **Colorado Wool Growers Association** ("CWGA") in regard to their efforts to ensure domestic livestock grazing continues to be an important use of public lands.

As you may know, agency science on the potential for pathogen transmission to bighorn sheep has been viewed as one-sided. The CWGA has a strong interest in ensuring decisions are made based upon the best available science and information. For these reasons, the CWGA filed a Data Quality Act challenge against the U.S. Forest Service ("USFS") for disseminating a questionable report (RMRS-GTR-209 "A review of disease related conflicts between domestic sheep and goats and bighorn sheep") ("Report") on those issues. As a result of the Challenge and a federal court decision, the USFS agreed to retract this Report and discontinue any reliance thereon. Unfortunately, we noticed recently that the **Report is still posted on the USFS website¹** without adequate notice of the foregoing. Further, the **Report is available via the USFS Quality of Information webpage²** without any form of header or watermark that the same has been retracted, despite the fact that the Report is listed in conjunction with the agency's retraction letter dated August 7, 2009. Notwithstanding the agency's disclaimer regarding the retraction, the Report's continued presence on the USFS is inappropriate.

¹ https://www.fs.fed.us/rm/publications/titles/rmrs_gtr.html; <https://www.fs.usda.gov/treearch/pubs/30355>

² <https://www.fs.fed.us/qoi/disclosure.shtml>

Kent Holsinger
Alyson Meyer Gould
Nicholas Rising

Jack Silver, *Of Counsel*
Terry Jo Epstein, *Of Counsel*
David L. Kueter, *Of Counsel*

P: (303) 722-2828
F: (303) 496-1025
www.holsingerlaw.com

1800 Glenarm Place, Suite 500
Denver, CO 80202



Holsinger Law, LLC

James Hubbard, Deputy Under Secretary
December 17, 2018
Page 2 of 2

Holsinger Law, LLC
lands, wildlife and water law

In order to correctly reflect the full and complete retraction of the Report, we respectfully request that the USFS remove all copies of and references to the Report from the USFS website and ensure it is not relied upon by the agency. Thank you and best of luck in your endeavors at USDA.

Sincerely,

HOLSINGER LAW, LLC

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'K. Holsinger', with a stylized flourish at the end.

Kent Holsinger

cc: B. Brown, Executive Director, CWGA (*via email*)
A. Lockwood, Executive Assistant to the Under Secretary, NRE, USDA (*via email*)